



Creating a More Inclusive Classical Music

A study of the English orchestral workforce
and the current routes to joining it

Literature Review

Tamsin Cox

2021
DHA

Contents

Executive Summary	1
<i>What literature is available?</i>	1
<i>What does the literature tell us?</i>	2
<i>What are the gaps?</i>	6
1 Introduction	8
1.1 Background	8
1.2 Research Scope	9
1.3 Sourcing literature	9
1.4 Organising the findings	11
2 What kind of literature is available?	12
2.1 Where does the literature come from?	12
2.2 What kinds of diversity are explored in the literature?	14
2.3 How is the research being undertaken	17
3 What does the literature tell us?	21
3.1 The demography of classical music	21
3.1.1 Pre-higher education	21
3.1.2 Higher education	24
3.1.3 Gender/sex in the classical music workforce	26
3.1.4 Ethnicity/race in the classical music workforce	28
3.2 Experiences of working in classical music	29
3.2.1 How does the work work?	29
3.2.2 Diversity, identity and meaning	39
3.3 Initiatives to diversify the workforce	49
4 Conclusions	54
4.1 The current state of knowledge	54
4.2 What are the gaps?	55
5 Bibliography	58

Executive Summary

This literature review looks at a range of material about who works in, and trains for, the classical music workforce. It examines what we currently know about the presence and absence of particular groups in the population, and what is known about the experiences of and pathways which different groups take through their training and working lives. It maps some of the key knowledge contributors in this area, looks at what kinds of research and data production are being undertaken and identifies key arguments in the current literature. This review focuses on literature from the UK (though there are some key references from elsewhere), from academic and other sources, including work undertaken by music sector organisations and consultants.

This piece of work sits alongside two others: a data audit and analysis, bringing together a range of existing data sources to explore the demography of those learning, training and working in classical music; and a survey of musicians and other workers in the classical music sector. In summer 2019 Arts Council England commissioned DHA and ICM Unlimited to work on this research project, supported by a steering group taken from the classical music sector and a wider reference group. Both the literature review and the data audit and analysis have benefited significantly from thinking and research already undertaken, and from data being made available by the sector.

What literature is available?

We found and reviewed a range of academic literature, much of which came from a sociological perspective, but also from areas such as cultural theory, music theory, and music education (see Section 2.1). Research undertaken or commissioned by organisations in the sector has been included, as well as the work of some independent researchers. Much of the work we reviewed recognises that there is not a significant history or depth of work in this area, and most of the material included in this review is from the last five years; at the same time, there is evidence of a significant increase in focus and engagement from researchers in this area and a sense of the importance and urgency of building a better knowledge base and understanding.

Looking at the available material, some areas of diversity are explored more than others (see Section 2.2.). Studies which focus on sex or gender (both these terms appear in the literature) are the most prevalent and include work from a longer time period. Work on ethnicity and race is more limited, particularly from the UK context – we have reviewed some material from the US and acknowledge this comes from a very different socio-political context. Studies considering socio-economic class are small in number and very recent. Identifying material which considers the presence and experiences of those in classical music with disabilities and health conditions has been challenging, but there is some material considering conditions such as hearing loss and mental health issues, as well as some evidence of a more theoretical engagement with narratives of disability in classical music.

There is a dearth of material on other protected characteristics as defined by the Equality Act 2010 and the Equality Duty 2011, which are age, gender reassignment, religion or belief, sexual orientation, marriage and civil partnership and pregnancy or maternity. We found some studies

which explored experiences of discrimination, including discrimination in relation to specific protected characteristics. More generally, we note the call for more intersectional analysis (i.e. work which looks at more than one characteristic, and how they relate to each other) and understanding of the presence/absence of different groups in training routes and the workforce, and of the experiences of individuals. There are some examples of work displaying nascent intersectional evidence and analysis.

Section 2.3 looks at how the research has been undertaken. The studies reviewed here include quantitative data from primary sources, such as surveys of individuals, data reported by organisations and datasets produced through observation (rather than formal assessment/verification of) characteristics. Secondary datasets tend to focus on training routes, and datasets relating to higher education entry are particularly significant. A small number of studies combine primary quantitative and qualitative work, but much of the qualitative work uses either secondary quantitative data or does not include a quantitative element. Interviews and focus groups are the most common approaches to qualitative work, and there are a number of studies which include the researcher embedded as an observer alongside interviews and other methods. There is some work with historical documentary evidence, which has been particularly included here where it connects historical analysis to our contemporary understanding of classical music practices.

Most difficult to find was material relating to attempts to diversify those training or working in classical music. We are aware of work – both historical and current – being undertaken to widen access to classical music education, but much of the publicly-available literature is limited in its examination of the efficacy of this work, and often concentrates on experiences of a specific intervention rather than any long-term outcomes.

What does the literature tell us?

The demography of classical music

Section 3.1 of the report explores what the literature can tell us about who participates, and who does not, in training for and working in classical music. Looking at the picture of engagement in pre-higher education, there is some evidence of an increase in the proportion of children and young people in the UK learning an instrument in the twenty years to 2014, and an increase in the proportion of young people in England who report making music on a regular basis in the twelve years to 2018 (though this does not indicate an increase in engagement with classical music specifically). There is, however, evidence of a drop-off in engagement as young people get older. Evidence from Music Education Hubs shows that within whole class ensemble teaching those taking part are more representative of the pupil population than is the case in activities where pupils choose or opt to be involved.

Data on ensembles and choirs suggests that more girls than boys engage in these activities (around a 60% vs 40% split), and this is supported by historical data on learning instruments via local authority music services. Female students have overtaken male students (proportionally) in take-up of music GCSE and A-Level over the last decade. There is also data on instrument choice, which suggests a strong relationship between sex and some instrument choices. Material on ethnicity and socio-economic class and participation in pre-higher education classical music activities specifically (as opposed to wider musical activities) is quite limited, but

there is evidence that young people from lower socio-economic groups are less likely to engage in formal activities like instrumental lessons, and to take music qualifications at school.

In higher education there has been some fluctuation in the balance of women and men entrants to conservatoire education; recent data shows a broadly balanced intake, but two studies identify data suggesting that women experience lower acceptance rates (and are a larger proportion of applicants to conservatoires than men). Looking at specific courses, there is some evidence of a relationship between gender/sex and specialism (e.g. music education/pedagogy courses were more likely to be taken by women, music technology courses were almost exclusively taken by men); it is also the case that the relationships observed between instrument and sex in children and young people pre-Higher Education are replicated in conservatoire students' instrument choices.

Both conservatoires and 'traditional' music degrees in university settings have a smaller proportion of 'Black and minority ethnic' students than the national average for undergraduates. Proxy indicators for socio-economic class show a concentration of students from 'private' schools in conservatoire entry. There is also a disproportionately high intake from areas where young people are more likely to go to higher education in conservatoire entry and in 'traditional' music degrees.

Amongst the classical music workforce, several studies focus on orchestras. Data from a range of national contexts suggests an increase in women in the orchestral workforce over the last 30 years; current estimates suggest that women are still in the minority in the orchestral workforce in the UK, but only slightly. The same relationship as was observed in pre-higher education and higher education data between sex/gender and instrument persists in the workforce data, and there is also evidence of a relationship between the seniority and profile of role and sex/gender, with women making up a smaller proportion of principal posts than their overall presence in the orchestral workforce, less prevalent in more high profile ensembles, and significantly less prevalent in conducting and artistic leadership roles and as solo artists.

Men were also overrepresented in conservatoire teaching, but a survey of instrumental teachers (not limited to conservatoire teaching) found a significant bias towards female teachers. In orchestral management and administration, men predominated in Board roles but women were otherwise overrepresented in this area of the workforce.

Looking at race and ethnicity in the workforce, there is data on UK orchestras which estimates that only 1.7% of members come from a 'Black or minority ethnic' background. Data from the US shows a longitudinal picture in which the ethnic diversity of orchestras overall has changed, but largely driven by an increased presence of particular ethnic groups rather than a rise in the presence of all ethnically diverse groups.

Experiences of working in classical music

This review was able to find some literature which addresses how the 'work' of classical music operates (see Section 3.2). This includes some very limited material on recruitment processes, and it is worth noting that tools like screened auditions (often referred to in the literature as 'blind' auditions) prompt very different opinions in the sector, and that the research into the effects of such approaches in an orchestral setting is both limited and the subject of some debate.

Recent research exploring the way in which classical musicians make a living highlights a range of ways in which structures can help or inhibit development. Challenges like networking, self-promotion, projecting a public presence, and navigating unwritten rules are affected and framed by musicians' experiences, including their gender and socio-economic class background. There is also evidence of a pay gap between men and women after graduating, and evidence of much precarity (including low earnings and unpaid work) in experiences of work.

Looking at the pathways classical musicians take through their careers, there is some literature available which reveals how 'composite' careers work, and which examines how musicians see and assign a hierarchy of value to different elements of their work (e.g. the relationship between performing and non-performing activities). There is also literature which explores how musicians' choices and motivations for engaging in different kinds of work change over time.

Within the literature reviewed are a small number of studies which include reflections on the relationship between careers in classical music (and, more widely, the performing arts) and life choices. The area which is most directly addressed is having children, and most of the material available focuses on women's experiences, and also on women who hoped to or anticipated having children. There is some evidence of care-givers reporting changing their working priorities in order to meet caring responsibilities, and that careers like classical music – with work taking place in evenings and at weekends, and often with less regular patterns – being particularly inflexible to those with caring responsibilities.

From recent surveys there is some evidence of experiences of harassment and discrimination from those working in the music sector. These experiences took place in educational and work settings. The surveys suggest that amongst some respondents there was a lack of awareness of and confidence in any available complaint systems in those settings. Sexual harassment and gender discrimination were amongst the more commonly reported experiences.

There is very limited data on disabilities and long-term health conditions amongst those working in classical music, but this review included studies which covered the experiences of disabled musicians (in any genre) with barriers to access in rehearsal and performance spaces, and more widely to spaces (both physical and non-physical) in the workplace. A key element of the small amount of material on disability and long-term health conditions is musicians reporting a reluctance to disclose conditions, whether for fear of causing problems and damaging relationships, concerns about the ways in which colleagues may respond to disclosure, and the prospect that work or training opportunities may be limited or damaged by that disclosure.

This review also includes some material which explores injury and illness, including as a result of musical activities. As with disabilities or long-term health conditions, there is evidence that in some contexts injury and illness are seen as a taboo, and something not to be disclosed; there is also evidence from a study on hearing loss of musicians not seeking professional help where they suspected they had hearing loss. There are some studies exploring issues like anxiety and stress, both performance-related and more widely. One study specifically links precarious and informal working practices to poor mental health amongst musicians.

Amongst the literature which explores diversity there are also studies which consider questions of identity and meaning. The importance of family background, and music within the family environment, emerges in several studies. In some cases families were seen as 'musical', and so music was familiar territory; families were important in supporting individuals to navigate the

training pipeline, and in supporting young musicians to pursue a career. There is evidence of family environments in which music was not seen as a suitable or safe profession, and the suggestion that socio-economic class may frame perceptions of risk in career pathways. Whilst much of the work which looks at socio-economic class emphasises the presence of middle-class musicians and young people training to be musicians, there is also evidence of variation of experience and perception within that group, and of intersections with other characteristics (e.g. gender) affecting the motivations and perceptions of young people and their families.

Within the literature reviewed here there are also considerations of how meaning is made or attributed in relation to music as well as in workforce and training practices. This includes some examination of cultural expectations of young musicians (e.g. teachers' perceptions of young people's aptitude for different kinds of musical activities), and the ways in which constructions of musical activities like composing or singing are framed in relation to characteristics like gender. Some of this work goes on to consider typical practices in classical music, such as the role of a conductor training an ensemble, as embodying values which can be linked to particular constructions, for example to values connected to middle-class identity.

There is a significant challenge in the material to suggestions that the value or meaning of music can be separated from the inequalities which exist in the practice of music. Ideas such as the inherent 'universality' of music are dismantled, to show the way in which these perceptions of value rely on particular inclusions and exclusions. The role of race and ethnicity in relationship to an art form which is rooted in white, Western culture is examined. This review also includes some material which examines how ideas and perceptions of disability have followed particular narratives in classical music, examining both historical and contemporary figures.

Initiatives to diversify the workforce

Finding literature which explored either interventions in the workplace/labour market or the effect of interventions at an earlier stage in training was difficult, and it is not clear if the absence of literature indicates an absence of initiatives, an absence of evaluation or an absence of publicly-available material which examines their efficacy (see Section 3.3.). There is evidence of a number of significant initiatives which seek to give experiences (including those which were classical music-oriented, and including instrumental learning) to children and young people who would typically be regarded as underrepresented in these activities, and certainly in elite training routes and in the workforce. One study which examines experiences of young people taking part in an instrumental learning project who are moving from primary to secondary school highlights both the benefits of and challenges in continuing to engage in activity where their wider circumstances are sometimes prohibitive or unable to support that engagement.

There is some evidence which explores specific interventions with post-conservatoire-training musicians and orchestras, predominantly from the US, which identifies both the value of such interventions, but also the significance of the challenge to typical orchestral workplaces which had not always undertaken the necessary work to consider how they might best receive and support musicians recruited through these interventions.

What are the gaps?

Section 4 of this review offers some conclusions. Some characteristics and experiences have been explored more fully than others, and – on the whole – the UK-based research and other work available has tended to focus on gender/sex. There is evidence that more work which takes an intersectional approach, looking at how different characteristics relate and combine, would be both valuable and is necessary to properly reflect the range of experiences and drivers beyond the career pathways of those working – and not working – in classical music.

Most of the material we reviewed looked at cultural production, but there is material in this review which connects to a wider call taking place in studies of creative workers to connect research in cultural production to our understanding of cultural consumption too. When we think about the importance that families appear to play in the lives of young musicians, this is but one example of the relationship between consumption and production which may ultimately affect presence and absence in the workforce.

There is evidence in the literature of musicians, other workers and those in training experiencing discrimination and harassment, and there is also evidence of a profession in which injury and illness are present. The available studies are limited in their ability to help us understand the prevalence of these experiences within the population. There are suggestions from these studies and from some other qualitative work that particular practices in the sector may either cause or enable some of these issues, but it would be useful to understand more about these specific conditions, and also to learn whether any attempts made within particular settings to address these conditions have been successful.

Much of the material considered here looks at a population of musicians or workers in the classical music workforce at a particular moment in time. There is a dearth of work examining development, transitions, motivations and the circumstances in which choices are made. There are indications of the strong influence which socio-cultural constructs play in the way in which the very youngest children engage in music – the data on instrument choice is a useful indicator in this respect – and suggestions that this is also manifest in a range of other choices or turning points as musicians and potential workers develop their practice and navigate the profession. Currently much of the data enables us to acknowledge some strong relationships – e.g. between middle-class values and learning an instrument – and by inference suppose that these perceptions and presentations of value may be as alienating to some as they are affirming to others.

It would be valuable to understand more about these effects, particularly from the perspective of those whose backgrounds and experiences are not widely represented, and specifically to build a better understanding of the effects and longer-term impacts of interventions with children and young people. Currently the literature tends to focus on groups at a particular moment in time, and there are – as far as we can ascertain – no longitudinal studies and almost no work which follows-up at a later point in time. There are, again, suggestions in the data that some elements of the demography in the workforce might be changing, or that change might be coming as some parts of the workforce cease to work and new groups come through, but only three studies explored change over time and none particularly examined the causes of change, except to acknowledge broader societal change.

This literature review brings together a range of material which outlines presence and absence by different demographic groups in the workforce and in training routes. It has identified a body of material which helps us to understand better the experiences of musicians and, to a lesser extent, other workers. What is particularly missing is any detailed evidence of what might make a difference to the overall diversity of the sector.

1 Introduction

1.1 Background

1. In summer 2019 Arts Council England appointed ICM Unlimited and DHA to undertake research looking at the diversity of the classical music workforce, with a particular focus on England. The aims of the research project included reviewing and developing the evidence base of current employment in the sector, routes into the sector and identifying if, and where, evidence exists of interventions that may be effective in enabling underrepresented groups to progress through education and into employment. The research study has three elements: a literature review, a data audit and analysis of available data, and a workforce survey. The first two elements have provided useful reference and context for the focus of the survey, and also represent a mapping of possible areas for future exploration and data analysis.
2. This work has been undertaken in a period in which there has been an increasing focus in the UK on the demography and experiences of workforce of the cultural sector and wider creative industries. Policy-makers and funders have undertaken inquiries (e.g. Labour Party, 2017; and instigation of the Creative Diversity All-Party Parliamentary Group in 2019), collected and presented data (e.g. Arts Council England, 2019), established workforce development schemes (e.g. Weston Jerwood Creative Bursaries), challenged the sector to improve its representation (e.g. PRS Foundation's KeyChange initiative) or to remove barriers to access (e.g. Attitude is Everything's Next Stage initiative). Academics and other researchers have worked independently and with the cultural sector to explore presence and absence in the workforce (e.g. Brook, O'Brien and Taylor, 2018) and the experiences of those in the workforce (e.g. ISM, 2017; ISM, Equity and the Musicians' Union, 2018; Musicians' Union, 2018; Musicians' Union, 2019; Help Musicians, 2014; Payne and Taylor, 2017; Bain, 2019; McDowell, Gamblin, Teoh, Raine and Ehnold-Danailov, 2019).
3. Within commercial and academic research, a focus on the relationship between the consumption of culture and different demographic characteristics (particularly class) (e.g. Bennett, Savage, Silva, Warde, Gayo-Cal and Wright, 2009, following Bourdieu, 2010) has been complemented more recently by work which looks at the relationship between the production of culture and different demographic groups (e.g. CAMEo, 2018, on the UK screen sector; Hesmondhalgh and Baker, 2015, on sex, gender and work segregation in the cultural industries; Nordicity and Smith, 2017, on offstage theatre and the performing arts; and O'Brien, Laurison, Miles and Friedman, 2016, on meritocracy in the creative industries). Latterly, academic work has begun to connect analyses of consumption and production, and to argue for a better understanding of the relationship between production, representation and consumption in culture (e.g. Oakley and O'Brien, 2015; Oakley and O'Brien, 2016; Hesmondhalgh, 2018; and Brook, O'Brien and Taylor, 2020).
4. This brief background acknowledges an important context for this particular study, and the variety of researchers, organisations and interested parties who are currently involved in exploring the workforce in the cultural sector and wider creative industries. Mapping the detail of this wider, growing field of material is beyond the scope of this review, but other recent studies (Oakley and O'Brien, 2015, in particular) provide useful surveys of this wider body of literature.

1.2 Research Scope

5. This literature review seeks to provide a picture of the current state of knowledge of: the demography of the classical music workforce and the extent to which this is diverse or not; how diversity, or a lack of diversity, effects peoples' experiences of training and being in the workforce; and the effects or implications of these experiences. Some broad limitations and areas of focus were adopted for this review, with a concentration on material written in English, and a focus on examples and studies from the UK and particularly England (where such a focus exists), supplemented by with some examples from the US and Australia, and a small number of studies which provide data relating to the UK/England alongside comparative data from Europe.
6. The focus in this review is on what may be termed Western art music, though we adopt the term 'classical music' in this review, reflecting the language most commonly used by the studies which have been considered here.ⁱ We have adopted some narrowness of scope within this, and not given full attention to studies which may solely focus on areas including singing and composition. Two studies which include comparative data between classical music and other musical genres are also included.
7. Whilst this review is concerned primarily with employment in the classical music sector, this is a relatively new area of research and we found that meaningful (and sometimes more detailed) data exists within studies which (predominantly) look at musicians who are still in education and training. Some of this material is included here, as is material which specifically explores initiatives to expand the diversity of those participating and working in classical music. This, however, is a very broad umbrella. It is beyond the scope of this review to acknowledge the wide range of music education and participation activities and interventions which specifically seek to engage children and young people who may not typically be engaged in classical music. It is also often the case that the evaluative material which exists in relation to much of this work does not identify whether participants go on to develop their musical practice and, ultimately, whether they seek employment in the sector.ⁱⁱ
8. It is also important to acknowledge that this review omits a significant body of work which explores questions of cultural diversity in school and musical curricula, in the academy (its canons and its theoretical positions) and in policy and funding decisions. This review briefly includes some of this work where it examines at experiences of working within the sector. In addition to recognising these omissions at this stage, they will be returned to in the conclusion of this study by way of a reminder that the literature which is included in this review is part of a wider landscape.

1.3 Sourcing literature

9. The literature included in this review comes from a range of sources, including academic publications (journal articles, books and reports), commissioned research material and other kinds of grey literature including policy documents and some web publications. This study is indebted to work already undertaken in 2015 by Claire Mera-Nelson, now Director of Music at Arts Council England but then Director of Music at Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance, and her colleague Dr Erin Johnson-Williams (formerly Trinity Laban, now Durham University) in compiling a list of potential sources.

10. The topic of diversity in the classical music workforce (and the wider topic of diversity in the cultural sector workforce) is an area which has seen some significant work undertaken in the recent past, including major studies with focussed on England by Dr Christina Scharff and Dr Anna Bull, amongst other work. These studies and others have mapped much of the ground already. In certain cases (for example, when seeking material on disabilities and long-term health conditions amongst classical musicians) web searches proved difficult to calibrate, but important in finding the limited material which exists in this area.
11. Several reports and studies have been published in the period since this review process commenced, and so this literature review may have both the benefit of being a small contribution to a developing area of knowledge and also of finding itself not quite up to date quite quickly. Several recent conference and seminar proceedings (e.g. Royal Musical Association and Music HE, 2020; Kosen TROMSØ, 2018) are indicative of current research projects in this area, and of a welcome wider discourse taking place.
12. There is also a wider context to acknowledge. In 2017 the #MeToo movement, emerged in the wake of allegations against a high profile film producer, and sought to give a platform to the experiences of women and the impacts of those experiences upon their careers and lives. In 2020 the Black Lives Matter protests which arose in response to the killing of George Floyd in the US brought this political and social movement to address historic and systemic injustices and provide freedom of opportunity to Black people into wider public consciousness across the globe . In the UK the #WeShallNotBeRemoved alliance was formed in response to Covid-19 disruption, to advocate for and support D/deaf, neurodivergent and disabled creative practitioners and organisations.
13. Within the arts and cultural sector these discourses have had several effects, from statements of support to more substantial action. The Chineke! Foundation, which provides 'outstanding career opportunities to established and up-and-coming Black, Asian and ethnically diverse classical musicians in the UK and Europe' sent a call for action to UK Prime Minister Boris Johnson, co-signed by musicians, composers and organisations from the world of classical music (Nwanoku, 2020). For the 2020 BBC Proms the BBC commissioned a new musical setting for William Blake's 'And did those feet in ancient time' from a Errollyn Wallen, a Black female composer, who saw her version as a tribute to the Windrush generation (Dowd, 2020). Music examination boards have been criticised and lobbied to change their syllabi to include more women composers (Busby, 2019) and more work by Black composers (Batty, 2020a and 2020b; Pentreath, 2020). New networks and collective vehicles have emerged from those working in music, including the Black Music Coalition and Black Lives in Music group, and wider projects like the Black Curriculum (started in 2019) have also provided spaces for discussion, challenge and organisation. UK Music, the industry body for music, established a Diversity Taskforce in 2015 and publishes biannual reports tracking diversity indicators in the industry, alongside a recent Ten-Point Plan which sets out actions and responsibilities for its members (UK Music, 2020). Within academic research, new networks have emerged (e.g. Equality, Diversity and Inclusion in Music Studies Network, the Black Opera Research Networks), and dominant academic discourses have been challenged (e.g. Ewell, 2020 following a talk in 2019) prompting rebuttal (Journal of Schenkerian Studies, 2019) and refutation in response to that rebuttal (Society for Music Theory, 2020).

14. This study does not include a detailed survey of connections to these wider debates, but it is important to acknowledge the way in the public discourse – through broadcast, news and social media – is engaging with and, sometimes, driving discussions about diversity in classical music.

1.4 Organising the findings

15. This literature review is organised in two main sections. The first – ‘what kind of literature is available’ – looks at:
 - Where research on diversity in the classical music workforce has been taking place and who has been doing it;
 - What kinds of diversity are being explored, and where research is limited or lacking; and
 - Examines some of the common methodological approaches to producing and analysing data and applying theoretical approaches.
16. The second – ‘what does the literature tell us’ – lays out the main results from the sources included in this review, including sections on:
 - Representation of different groups in the workforce;
 - Representation in training and education for classical music;
 - How the ‘work’ works, and the experiences and effects of diversity in the classical music workforce; and
 - Initiatives to diversify the workforce.
17. Finally, this review ends with conclusions which highlight the main areas of consensus and absences from the literature which has been included and identifies some opportunities or areas for future research.
18. It has already been noted that this review uses the term ‘classical music’, reflecting its use in the wider literature considered in this review. This approach has been generally extended in reflecting the language and terminology choices made in literature sources in relation to diversity, and specifically in relation to different demographic characteristics. What this means is that in the discussion of individual sources an attempt has been made to reflect the language chosen in that source; where discussion covers more than one source, if the language varies between sources differences have been highlighted. Where terms are used which are not so commonly recognised within the UK, clarifications are provided. There is some further discussion of the choices and differences in language and concept use in section 2.2.

2 What kind of literature is available?

2.1 Where does the literature come from?

19. As noted in the introduction to this review, the question of who gets to work in the cultural sector and creative industries is a topic which is receiving particular attention at present from those in the sector, the media, researchers, policy-makers and funders. Much of the literature included in this review was published in the last decade, and several sources were published in the period in which this review took place. There are two main groups of literature included in this review: academic literature including books and journal articles, published through established routes and usually peer-reviewed; and a wide range of grey literature, including reports undertaken by academics, work commissioned and/or undertaken by organisations and funders working in the cultural field, material from education and training providers and some material from individual researchers, practitioners and activists. Not included here is any consideration of media coverage of diversity in classical music (section 1.3 briefly touches on some examples); on the whole, media coverage tends to report on evidence from elsewhere, or to provide commentary/report criticisms or calls to action; as such, it is valuable evidence of a debate taking place, but does not specifically add to the knowledge base.
20. Much of the academic literature included in this review comes from a sociological perspective (e.g. Bull, 2015, 2016a, 2016b, 2018, 2019; Scharff, 2015a, 2015b, 2017, 2018; McCormick, 2009 and 2015; De Boise, 2018). Also included is literature which uses methodologies from the social sciences, or brings social or cultural theory to bear but additionally articulates a more specific relationship with areas of study relating to music, including perspectives connecting to musicology (Born and Devine, 2015; Born, 2010), or more specifically music theory (Straus, 2011 and particularly Straus, 2018), music psychology (Greasley, Fulford, Pickard and Hamilton, 2018; Sergeant and Himonides, 2019) and music education (Bennett, 2005 and 2008; Mantie and Tucker, 2012; Daubney and Mackrill, 2018; Hallam, Rogers and Creech, 2008; Green, 1997; Moore, 2012). Some material from sociologists who were not only concerned with classical music (or indeed music at all), but whose work on areas like parenthood has yielded relevant material (e.g. Irwin and Elley, 2011) is also included.
21. Articles have been found in a range of journals reflecting this disciplinary spread, though there are examples of different disciplinary perspectives being brought together in recent publications such as *The Classical Music Industry* (Dromey and Haferkorn, 2018). There is also some inclusion of unpublished work from students in this area (e.g. Davis, 2014; Plumb, 2019), and – as already noted – recent conference proceedings give indications of some research in progress (e.g. Royal Musical Association and Music HE, 2020; Konsen Tromsø, 2018).
22. In terms of research from within the cultural sector, or commissioned (from academic or commercial researchers) by the sector, membership and workforce-oriented bodies have been particular drivers of work in this area, including the Musicians' Union (MU), Incorporated Society of Musicians (ISM) and Help Musicians (e.g. Musicians' Union, 2019; DHA, 2012; ISM, 2018; Help Musicians, 2014). In the US the League of American Orchestras has proved a useful (and the only) source of longitudinal data on orchestral players (League of American Orchestras and Doeser, 2016).

23. The work of independent individuals has also been included in this review, notably Bain (2019) and O'Donnell (2016), both of whom had a history of work and an ongoing practice in the sector. The personal motivations of both Bain and O'Donnell are clear in their writing, and also connect to a range of academic material which has been written by musicians, ex-musicians or people who trained to a significant level as musicians, notably Bull (2015, 2016a, 2016b, 2018, 2019), Davis (2014), Bennett (2005 and 2008), Breda (Breda and Kulesa, 1999), Yang (2014) and Yoshihara (2007). The strain of reflective academic practice varies between writers: some authors foreground it very strongly (e.g. Davis, 2014; Yang, 2014; Yoshihara, 2007), some use this background to embed themselves in research sites (Bull, 2015) and others acknowledge it, but it plays a less explicit part in their research (Breda and Kulesa, 1999).
24. The motivation or imperative for work undertaken in this area is explicitly stated by some authors, and worth reflecting upon briefly. Yang (2014), writing from a US perspective, places her investigation within a wider context of debates for and against perceived elitism in classical music, but also connects to her personal experiences of identity:

'I have been personally affected by many of the changes discussed in the pages to follow and feel some urgency in opening up the conversation about the relevance of classical music to a wider range of people and in motivating its stakeholders to re-examine previous judgments about its value.' (Yang, 2014: 20).

Bull also offers a very personal motivation for her work, and argues at the same time for the importance of bringing to bear the knowledge of having experienced classical music practices:

'This thesis is, in some senses, an exploration of my own formation as a young musician, since I had shared very similar experiences to many of my participants. However, I went back to university at age 26 to do an undergraduate degree in sociology, as a route out of my musical career. I mostly stopped playing classical music, and had no intention of doing research in this area. In fact, I spent many years trying to escape writing this thesis [...] I suspect that others, like me, who share this musical identity may feel uncomfortable at casting a critical sociological eye on such a formative part of our very selves. And yet to really understand what is at stake for classical musicians, we need to be musicians ourselves to study this culture.' (Bull, 2014: 47)

25. From an academic perspective, Bull and Scharff make a general argument about the relative lack of attention which had previously been paid to the way in which classical music works:

'There is a dearth of critical, empirical sociological inquiry into classical music practice... when we embarked on our separate research projects, we were surprised to find that there has been comparatively little research on classical music practice and even less of an emphasis on inequalities.' (Bull and Scharff, 2017: 284)

In Scharff's ESRC-funded 2015 study 'Equality and Diversity in the Classical Music Profession', she more specifically notes that:

'...the lack of evidence is particularly pronounced in relation to musicians' class and ethnic backgrounds...there is an urgent need to collect and collate more data.' (Scharff, 2015b: 4).

Scharff also offers an argument for why this data is important, suggesting that barriers to accessing and progressing in the profession are often couched as ‘individual problems’ⁱⁱⁱ; there is a job to do, therefore, to ‘make visible’ the patterns of inequality ‘and to understand what we can do to move beyond them’ (2015b: 4).

26. A report commissioned by the League of American Orchestras goes a step further in connecting what takes place within classical music to wider socio-political debates and concerns, and suggests the need for a better understanding of how classical music works, noting the:

‘...heightened and volatile national conversation about race and that the domain of orchestral music is not outside or exempt from that conversation.’ (League of American Orchestras, Rabkin and Hairston, 2016: 6).

The reference to a ‘national conversation’ here also indicates a specificity of national context: the discussion which is taking place in the US is not the same as that which is taking place in the UK. What we can observe more widely is that much of this work, whoever is undertaking it, includes a sense of moral imperative.

2.2 What kinds of diversity are explored in the literature?

27. In searching for literature which explored the representation of different demographic groups in the classical music workforce, or which looked at the relationship between demographic characteristics and the experiences of those working in classical music, studies which focused on gender or sex were by far the most prevalent. It is also the case that work in collecting data and developing analytical and critical frameworks to interrogate this issue has been more substantial and taken place over a longer period of time. For example, the longitudinal datasets from the League of American Orchestras date back to 1978 for gender (League of American Orchestras and Doeser, 2016). Green’s work brings together an established theoretical approach from gender studies with an analysis of historical sources and of data from schools collected in 1992, and her work in this area provides something of an underpinning for much of what follows exploring gender and classical music.
28. The approach this review takes to language and concepts of diversity is discussed earlier, and it is worth noting that despite Green’s experience (in 1997) that it was ‘now customary practice’ to treat ‘sex’ as referring to ‘the biological characteristics of women or men’ and ‘gender’ as referring to ‘historical constructions of femininity or masculinity’, there are some examples which we have reviewed which seem to use sex and gender interchangeably (e.g. Sergeant and Himonides, 2019). With this exception, on the whole the term gender is preferred except where datasets specify sex (e.g. Hallam, Rogers and Creech, 2008).
29. Work on ethnicity or race is much more limited, particularly from the UK. The terms ‘race’ and ‘ethnicity’ are used interchangeably in some sources, and there is less evidence of any clarity in the adoption of one term over another. Most of the material included here which focuses on ethnicity or race comes from the US, where (as already noted) there is a different context for understanding the representation of different ethnic groups within the workforce. The effects of this context are highlighted in DeLorenzo (2012) who identifies a small cluster of ‘classical performance groups and organisations who are devoted to Black and Latino musicians and composers’, including eight ensembles, two membership bodies for musicians, a festival and a social justice organisation. This kind of organisation of focused activities has only more recently appeared in the UK, perhaps reflecting the different histories and experiences of ethnically

diverse populations. Chineke!, which is an orchestral ensemble which takes a range of forms, and its youth ensemble Chineke! Juniors have existed since 2015 in the UK, both focused on Black, Asian and ethnically diverse musicians, and other groups (e.g. the Decus Ensemble) and organisations (e.g. The African Concert Series which takes place at the Africa Centre, London) are also taking a lead in promoting Black, Asian and other ethnically diverse performers and composers (both past and present).

30. Two key studies from the US are able to take a longitudinal view; one uses datasets which go back to 1980 in their collection of data on race and ethnicity, and the other looks at forty years of interventions (League of American Orchestras and Doeser, 2016; and League of American Orchestras, Rabkin and Hairston O'Connell, 2016). Both Yoshihara (2007) and Yang (2014) provide a useful historical account of the take up of Western classical music practices (particularly amongst the middle classes) in what in the UK we would typically term East Asia, and in plotting the presence and development of Asian and Asian American musicians on the international stage, and in the US domestic classical music industry.
31. In a UK context, studies which are concerned with the relationship between socio-economic class and classical music tend to be relatively recent, and connect to a wider body of work on class and consumption (e.g. Bennett et al, 2009) as well as a range of studies on cultural work (across different sub-sectoral areas) and class (e.g. O'Brien, Laurison, Miles, and Friedman, 2016). Recent work on national datasets which are specific to music (e.g. Whittaker, Fautley, Kinsella and Anderson, 2019, looking at A-Level entries) is supported by qualitative studies like Bull (2019). Definitions used in this area vary significantly according to the study methodology, and it is worth noting that national datasets often provide proxy indicators (e.g. POLAR, the classification system Participation of Local Areas which indicates the likelihood of participation in higher education by those living within a given geographical area) which studies use either singly or in combination with other indicators. Some qualitative studies opt for self-definition, allowing participants to identify and define their class and/or socio-economic status.
32. Seeking material which considers the experiences of classical musicians with disabilities, long- or shorter-term health conditions has been a particular challenge for this literature review. Searches often brought up studies looking at music in a therapeutic or participatory context, with beneficiaries or participants who had disabilities or long-term health conditions. The possible prevalence of this paradigm is highlighted in a review of studies covering music and hearing impairment in the opening section of an article by Fulford, Ginsborg and Goldbart (2011). The authors cite an earlier study (Whittaker, 1986) and note that:

'...there is a pedagogical tension between therapeutic engagement in music by the hearing-impaired, for social and emotional (non-musical) ends, and intrinsic engagement in music and music theory for its own sake.' (Fulford, Ginsborg and Goldbart, 2011: 450).
33. Attitude is Everything, a disability-led charity which works with the live music industry to improve D/deaf and disabled people's access to live music, undertook a survey of musicians (from any genre within live music) with access requirements as part of their Next Stage initiative (Attitude is Everything, 2019), and to date this remains one of only a few examples of this type of primary research that could be identified. Another is an interview study on the experiences of amateur and professional musicians with hearing impairments by a group of academics (Fulford et al, 2011). Bringing both an historical and a theoretical perspective, Straus' 2011 book on disability and instrumental music from the Western classical traditional (looking at composers and

performers) provides an important reference point in an area which is otherwise less populated. Straus suggests that:

'Until now, disability has not entered much into discussions of music. This is probably because music is blessed and cursed by its nonrepresentational nature and by the forbidding technical vocabulary that has grown up around it: both features have tended to isolate music and discussions of music from larger cultural trends.' (Straus, 2011: 11).

He goes on to note the 'extensive literature on the use of music as therapy for people with disabilities and on the musical perceptions of people with disabilities'.^{iv} Straus' work, in a similar way to the gender work of Green, and others, brings to bear a theoretical and critical framework from disability studies, and therefore explores disability as a social construct in the context of classical music histories and practices.

34. We have identified some studies which explore issues of health (mental or physical) which occur during the career span of musicians – sometimes linking those health outcomes directly to musicians working conditions and experiences. For example, Help Musicians surveyed musicians (from a range of musical genres) on their hearing (Help Musicians, 2015; and further analysed in Greasley, Fulford, Pickard and Hamilton, 2018) and on a wider range of health and wellbeing issues which musicians may have experienced whilst working as musicians (Help Musicians, 2014). Heather O'Donnell, who works as a pianist, teacher and musicians' health psychologist has interviewed and written about musicians who experience injuries and health issues as a result of their musical practice (O'Donnell, 2016). Coming at questions of physical health from a different perspective, we also found material which considers what kind of fitness musicians have, but also what kind of fitness they would benefit from given the demands of music making (Araújo, Wasley, Redding, Atkins, Perkins, Ginsborg and Williamson, 2020).
35. There are studies which explore stress (e.g. Breda and Kulesa, 1999), and/or broader aspects of wellbeing, as well as work which focus on a wide range of mental health issues (e.g. Gross and Musgrave, 2016 and 2017). A recent review from Willis, Neil, Mellick and Wasley, 2019, provides a useful overview of studies looking at occupational demands and the well-being of performing artists, and includes a number of studies which look at classical musicians, though notably they conclude that there is a 'paucity of high quality and theoretically informed research in this area'.
36. Beyond the four characteristics for which some focused material has already been identified (gender/sex, ethnicity/race, class and disability/long-term health conditions), there is a dearth of material which considers any of the other protected characteristics as defined by the Equality Act 2010 and the Equality Duty 2011, which are age, gender reassignment, religion or belief, sexual orientation, marriage and civil partnership and pregnancy or maternity. There are some studies which offer brief considerations of these characteristics, usually in relation to other characteristics or areas of main focus, for example: Yoshihara (2007) reflects upon homophobia; Breda and Kulesa (1999) include age as a variable in their study; and Bennett and Hannekam (2018) look at the different stages of a musicians' career. There is some evidence of discrimination and bullying related to these other areas in work undertaken by the ISM (e.g. ISM, 2018), and more generally some work on gender reflects upon family and caring responsibilities.
37. Finally, it is worth considering where multiple characteristics and their intersection – in terms of enforcing inequalities or opportunities – emerges in the literature. Bull and Scharff (2017) and

Bull (2018) begin to identify some intersections between gender and class, and likewise Yoshihara (2007) and Yang (2014), situate their analysis at a particular intersection of race and class, and seek to pay some attention to both factors. Scharff (2015a) calls for the development of an 'intersectional framework', and what exists at present provides us with indicators of areas which may be important for future research.

2.3 How is the research being undertaken

38. Looking at literature which includes quantitative (or predominantly quantitative) data, there are three main sources of data. Secondary datasets from existing data collection mechanisms are used in a number of studies, of which the most prevalent dataset is higher education data (in the UK this is either from UCAS or Higher Education Statistics Authority). Several studies consider entry to conservatoires (Scharff, 2015b and 2017; De Boise, 2018; Sergeant and Himonides, 2019) or to a wider range of music degrees (Born and Devine, 2015). In addition, there is some work on music qualifications at a lower level, using secondary datasets (e.g. Whittaker et al, 2019). Mostly this work analyses the data by individual characteristics (e.g. gender, ethnicity) though Born and Devine combine a range of indicators from UCAS data to provide a kind of proxy indicator for social class (2015). De Boise is the only study included here which involves another national comparator, using higher education entry data from Sweden alongside that of the UK (2018). Data from entry to higher education provides the most complete, standardised set of demographic data about training musicians at a particular point in their development, and is currently unmatched by other data sets this literature review has considered. Elsewhere, secondary datasets which are sometimes less specific to classical music, or music generally, are included for wider reference (e.g. Scharff, 2015b uses both Skillset and Arts Council England reports to provide context). Bennett (2005 and 2008) takes work using Australian national datasets further, exploring whether classifications of occupations and industries can be a viable source.
39. The second source of quantitative data comes from surveys which have been undertaken with a range of participants. These surveys tend to fall into two categories: surveys undertaken directly with a member of the workforce, a parent or a young person; and surveys undertaken with an organisation which then supplies data about multiple members of its workforce, or participants in its activities.
40. Some workforce surveys focus specifically on particular research sites (e.g. a single orchestra or a small group of orchestras, e.g. Fasang, 2006 or Plumb, 2019); others seek larger responses, often working through a combination of membership bodies and open requests for participants (e.g. Help Musicians, 2014; ISM, 2018; Attitude is Everything, 2019; the teacher survey in ARBSM, 2014). These surveys largely focus on specific issues which the workforce may have encountered and are generally not framed as censuses. As such, the demographic data they capture is largely used to explore the relationship between specific issues and demographics, rather than being presented data as indicative of the wider musical population.
41. Whilst some of these surveys only sought a specific sub-group of the population – for example Attitude is Everything (2014) sought responses from artists working in live music who had access requirements – the majority were seeking the largest possible response from musicians or teachers. One of the challenges in survey work which explores specific experiences, and is advertised in the recruitment process as doing so, is the possibility for a self-selection bias by survey respondents which may relate directly to characteristics or experiences being explored

by the survey itself. Greasley et al, for example, identify a likely 'response bias' in their survey on hearing loss in musicians, with those musicians who had experienced hearing loss potentially more likely to complete the survey (2018). The overall effect of this problem is the way in which we can understand the prevalence (or not) of particular experiences, effects and characteristics, where there is a paucity of reliable data about the musician population against which to compare any survey data.

42. In addition, one of the issues which the Greasley et al study sought to mitigate against was the possibility of under-response from those who may experience hearing loss, due to the potential for respondents feeling vulnerable in admitting their hearing loss. In the literature review, this study also identifies findings from elsewhere about musicians avoiding hearing protection due to not wishing to be seen as deficient or 'weak' in this area (Greasley et al, 2018: 3). As such, this provides a useful example of where survey data might contain the possibility of either under or over estimation of the prevalence of certain experiences in relation to the wider population.
43. Bennett and Hannekam's work using the Creative Workforce Initiative (CWI) which includes a survey tool collecting a range of quantitative and qualitative data is unusual in that the wider set-up for the study provides an element of comparison, enabling classical musicians to be explored as a single group and compared with workforce groups from other areas of the creative industries (2018).
44. There are two significant surveys of young people and their musical activities and preferences, which were undertaken at national level and include adjusted/weighted sample approaches to enable the data to be presented as representative of the national population (ABSRM, 2014; and Youth Music and Ipsos Mori, 2019). The ABSRM survey also includes an adult population survey (again using a sampling methodology).
45. Some research is based on workforce data provided by employers. A study by the League of American Orchestras and Doeser (2016), for example, uses data collected by the League (and which they had digitally available) from 1978 onwards. The data was collected through surveys of orchestras which were members of the League, who reported the data voluntarily on an annual basis. ABO's 2014 report on youth ensembles uses a similar approach, via a one-off survey. The dataset underlying Hallam, Rogers and Creech (2008) brings together two datasets, bringing together data supplied by music services and/or local authorities with data in the Common Basic Data Set held by the Department for Education, which matches instrument learners with demographic information.
46. The third source of quantitative data relates specifically to studies of the demography of orchestral players. There are several studies, including two recent publications, which have provided data based on observation of characteristics: this involves identifying the wider sample of orchestras or conservatoires, accessing member or staff lists, and producing data on characteristics like sex/gender and ethnicity on the basis of those listings. Scharff (2015b) used this approach with UK-based orchestras and conservatoires and Sergeant and Himonides (2019) did the same with orchestras in the UK, Europe and the USA. Bain's study of the wider music industry also takes an observed characteristics approach focusing on the rosters of UK music publishers and UK record labels, and when reflecting upon developing her data set the author notes that:

'There is an unusual transparency in the music industry, where websites are the companies' shop fronts... Thus, by counting, and making a record of that count, a very accurate audit of the industry's product is possible.' (Bain, 2019: 8).

47. The method of observation presents issues which are acknowledged by the authors. Sergeant and Himonides, for example, discuss the question of whether listing policies are consistent, and the possibility that some orchestras listed a wider group of players, or included 'regular' extras (2019). Scharff's study involved observing both gender and ethnicity, and Scharff notes that this approach involves a margin of error for both characteristics. Such was the difficulty in producing meaningful data for ethnicity, that the study produced data for only a proportion of conservatoire staff and orchestras (2015b). Scharff particularly notes the issues with observing ethnicity as a method, with the absence of photographs limiting the potential data pool and reliance on visual indicators providing only a 'crude' approximation. Thus, the data on ethnicity from this section of the report divides musicians and staff members into two groups: 'white' and 'BAME', following Arts Council England's reporting approach at the time of publication of the paper (Scharff, 2015b: 19-20). Bain also reflects upon the possible issues with observing gender.^v
48. Qualitative approaches vary significantly from study to study, and are sometimes prefixed with a quantitative element, for example with Irwin and Elley (2011), who surveyed over 500 parents in Leeds, and then undertook 34 semi-structured interviews. Bennett's work also used mixed methods, with exploratory interviews, a survey and then focus groups, alongside work with secondary datasets (2005 and 2008). Scharff's qualitative dataset provides one of the few comparative opportunities, with interviews which included musicians from both London and Berlin (2015a, 2017, 2018). Typically, interview data found in the literature included in this review is analysed with a thematic approach; sometimes authors refer more formally to approaches such as discourse analysis.
49. Several authors combine a range of more and less formal approaches, for example Bogdanovic (2015) uses focus groups, interviews and a range of discussions with informants, and Green's work includes observations in classrooms (1997). In some cases, this mixture of approaches is also a way to acknowledge and make use of the author's relationship with the research site. Yoshihara describes herself as 'simultaneously an insider and an outsider' (2007: 13) and places some particular emphasis on the relationship between personal emotional responses, the theoretical framework which she brings to her work from a particular academic discipline and the ethics of her engagement with her study subjects. Thus, her study includes – amongst other things – extended verbatim reproductions of interviews or sections of interviews with subjects who are introduced by name and with a short biography. These sections are presented as the different voices of the Asian and American Asian classical music community – much of Yoshihara's focus is on predominantly on musicians with an East Asian heritage. Bull's research study (2015, 2016a, 2016b, 2018, 2019) goes a step further, and is an ethnographic study of young people involved in classical music youth ensembles. Bull participated as a musician in some of the groups, and observed rehearsals and performances. She undertook a series of semi-structured interviews and focus groups, as well as interviews with adults running the ensembles.
50. Ethnographic work in some cases provides case studies which sit alongside analysis of quantitative secondary data (e.g. Born and Devine, 2015). In other cases, ethnographic approaches are important in enabling authors to consider historical material. Green (1997) for example looks at historical practices and examples, drawing on a wide range of sources, in relation to gender and music. Straus (2011) undertakes a similar job looking at disability and

classical music, using sources including material from writers who are both contemporary to the composers and performers he considers, and those from more recent periods in an effort to trace how narratives are constructed. McCormick's work (2009 and 2015) on elite music competitions includes analysis of documents, media and other coverage of the competition and, through discourse analysis, she examines the narratives which are constructed around the competition and the competitors. She also, like Green, situates her work in a historical context, using documentary evidence (e.g. critics reviews of competitions and other media reports) and more widely connecting to the history of performance practice, particularly from the 19th century (McCormick, 2015).

51. This literature review has found relatively little material covering interventions or initiatives to diversify the workforce. However, work by the League of American Orchestras with Rabkin and Hairston O'Connell (2016) attempts an overview of 40 years of fellowships for young musicians across US orchestras. The study includes a review of documentation, where it existed, and supplements this with interviews with musicians, orchestra staff and 'outside experts'. It is the only report which provides a sense of this kind of approach over a substantial period of time. Elsewhere the relative absence of longitudinal studies is notable (League of American Orchestras and Doeser, 2016, is by far the most substantial; Scharff, 2015b, includes some data over a time period).
52. In terms of theoretical approaches, Bourdieu's concepts of cultural capital and habitus (2010) are used in a number of ways, including in: Bull and Scharff (2017), connecting consumption with production, via a reflection on the family background of musicians and practice of listening to music at home; Irwin and Elley (2011) in their consideration of parents supporting and directing their children in education, including organised activities; and in Moore (2012) looking at the experiences of undergraduate music students in Ireland and examining notions like cultural capital in relation to different music traditions. Lareau's work (2003) on unequal childhoods is also a reference point for studies which look at childhood and parenting. Scharff (2018) uses the role of subjectivity and notions of the ideal worker, and her book (2017) lays out a theoretical framework which builds upon other studies which explore cultural work and workers as a paradigm of 'entrepreneurialism', and uses her empirical material – particularly the interviews – to explore how 'entrepreneurial subjectivity' is constituted and negotiated by her study participants. This approach builds on a wider body of Foucauldian analysis (which is outlined in Scharff, 2017: 16-17), which includes work looking at cultural workers as a 'paradigm[...] of entrepreneurial selfhood' and particularly also highlights the way in which "young women' have been positioned in similar ways in media, public, and policy discourses' (Scharff, 2017: 10).
53. Bennett's earlier study, looking at career trajectories and experiences (2005 and 2008, based on the same dataset), foregrounds her later work (Bennett and Hennekam, 2018) which brings in lifespan perspective theory as a way of framing their work looking at the career trajectories and experiences of musicians. In doing so, this also connects their work to a wider range of material on employment and careers.

3 What does the literature tell us?

54. This chapter explores what the literature tells us about the classical music sector: who works in the sector (both musicians and other workers), and who trains to do so; and what the relationships are between different kinds of work in classical music and demographic characteristics. The second section explores what the literature has found about the experiences of diversity in classical music. The third section looks at the literature which covers initiatives to diversify the workforce.

3.1 The demography of classical music

55. This section looks at what the literature can tell us about the presence and absence of different demographic groups in classical music. This includes a brief review of some key sources which relate to participating and training in classical music prior to higher education, a consideration of work which looks at entry to higher education (which, as has already been noted, is something of a 'hot spot' in data terms), and then a review of what available material tells us about the demography of the workforce. This latter section is divided up by demographic characteristic, where substantial material exists.

3.1.1 Pre-higher education

56. It is beyond the scope of this study to provide a comprehensive view of literature which explores the take-up of instrumental learning amongst children and young people and the variety of approaches to providing instrumental learning opportunities which currently take place. However, it is worth noting in a UK context – and particularly, though not exclusively, in relation to the English policy context – the last decade has seen significant attention given to questions of music education, from policy-makers through the National Plan for Music Education (Department for Education, 2011), and the establishment of Music Education Hubs, and from other parties including sector organising/membership bodies, music education providers, academics and funders. Given this focus, this section briefly considers some of the key research which is relevant to this literature review, addressing questions of who does and does not take part in instrumental learning. It does not consider literature relating to individual approaches or interventions, but rather looks at what picture is available to us at a population level.
57. The Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM) undertook a survey in 2014 of children and young people, adults and music teachers.^{vi} It found that more children reported learning to play an instrument than had been the case in a survey undertaken six years previously (76% of 5-14-year-old respondents in 2014 vs 41% in 1999 said that they knew how to play an instrument). Similarly, Youth Music and Ipsos Mori (2019) in their survey of young people (aged 7-25) also found that more young people (67%) were making music than had been the case in a comparative survey in 2006 (39%). Both surveys, however, also find that as children and young people get older, there is a drop-off in the proportion of them learning instruments or making music.

58. Behind this data is evidence of uneven take-up across different demographic groups, and segregations or affiliations between different demographic groups and types of musical activities. Children and young people from AB socio-economic groups are more likely to play an instrument, and more likely to have instrument lessons (74%) in comparison with their peers from other socio-economic groups (55%) (ABRSM, 2014). Young people in receipt of free school meals were more likely (74%) to describe themselves as musical than those young people who were not (60%); they were also as likely to sing and play an instrument as other young people, more likely to have seen live music played at home and less likely to have seen music at a concert or a gig (Youth Music and Ipsos Mori, 2019). They were also more likely to be involved in particular kinds of music making, including karaoke, making music on a computer, writing music, DJing and rapping. It appears that in some cases whilst boys may give up playing instruments, they may continue (or move over) to making music using technology (Youth Music and Ipsos Mori, 2019).
59. Looking at take-up/provision of Whole Class Ensemble Teaching (WCET) in England, data is collected via Music Education Hubs and analysed collectively to produce some information about who receives WCET tuition. The report on 2016/2017 data finds that 'the ethnic profile of WCET provision follows the general ethnicity profile of the national population' (Fautley and Whittaker, 2017). A lower proportion of pupils with a statement of special educational needs (SEN) received WCET tuition or participated in area-based ensembles and choirs than were present in the total school population; the same is true of pupils in receipt of the Pupil Premium.
60. Fautley and Whittaker also found that more girls than boys participated in area-based ensembles and choirs (e.g. at KS3 just over 60% of participants were girls) (2017). The ABO survey of youth ensembles (ABO, 2014) reported 62% female to 38% male membership of youth orchestras. Similarly, the overall dataset included in a study commissioned by the then Department for Education and Skills found that 60% of those learning instruments via local authority music services were girls (Hallam, Rogers and Creech, 2008: 9).
61. The ABRSM survey finds a growth in the range of instruments being learnt, in comparison with the 1999 survey. It also identifies a relationship between instrument choice/opportunity and demographic factors like gender and socio-economic group (ABRSM, 2014). A historic study of music learners across 150 local authority music services in England also demonstrated that instrument choice for children and young people is segregated by gender in some areas (Hallam et al, 2008). Instruments like the harp, flute, fife/piccolo, oboe and clarinet were significantly more studied by girls, as well the voice, and electric and bass guitars, tuba, kit drums, tabla and trombone were significantly more studied by boys. Some instruments were also substantially less gendered in their selection.
62. The data also suggests the possibility of particular factors affecting the take up of particular musical studies over time: for example, a significant downturn in the proportion of boys taking vocal studies at KS3 (in comparison with previous key stages) which may be related to voices breaking (Hallam et al, 2008). The study goes on to suggest that a combination of different factors – individual preferences and factors, social factors and specific factors relating to the instrument itself (size, access to tuition, etc) – may all combine to contribute to a set of circumstances in which there are still some strong relationships between gender and instrument choice. Sergeant and Himonides (2019) took the data from this study and, using binominal probability, arranged the results to produce a spectrum of instruments from a 'feminine-type' (e.g harp, flute, oboe, violin) through gender neutral (e.g. French horn, double bass) to a 'masculine-type' (e.g. percussion, trombone, trumpet, tuba).

63. The All-Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education undertook a review of the state of music education in England in 2019. It drew together a range of sources, and suggests that music education was in decline as a classroom subject in primary and secondary schools due in part to the current policy and curriculum emphasis on other subjects, and a decline in other indicators like entries for graded music examinations (All-Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education, ISM and University of Sussex, 2019).
64. This assessment is underpinned by other literature. Daubney and Mackrill's survey of secondary schools considers the choices which schools are making about the availability of music as a subject in the run-up to GCSE (2018). Work by Whittaker, Fautley, Kinsella and Anderson (2019) looking at A-level music provision also maps the falling number of entries. The study looks at A-Level provision and entry geographically, and in terms of school type: A-Level entry occurs disproportionately highly from independent schools, is concentrated within a group of fewer than 50 schools, and occurs disproportionately highly in schools in postcode areas with POLAR ratings of 4 or 5, i.e. amongst those areas where young people are most likely to go on to Higher Education.
65. Bain raises the question of how women musicians emerge through the system, and presents important contextual data on GCSE and A-Level take-up; in the last decade the proportion of female GCSE music students has risen to overtake the proportion of male students, and female students tended to get better grades (Bain, 2015: 15). The same is broadly true for A-Level, though a slightly higher proportion of male students than female students get an A* grading.
66. More widely, the pattern of uneven provision of classroom teaching, instrumental teaching and other forms of music education (which is suggested in the A-Level data analysed by Whittaker et al, 2019) is highlighted in several reviews of music education, including: Henley's review of music education in 2011; a review commissioned by the Paul Hamlyn Foundation (Zeserson, Welch, Burn, Saunders and Himonides, 2014); one undertaken in partnership with the Royal Philharmonic Society (Derbyshire, 2015); and the All-Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education's 'State of the Nation' report (2019).
67. To put this into a broader context, a recent report as part of the work being undertaken by the Social Mobility Commission suggests a relationship between participation in extra-curricular music alongside a range of other activities (including sport) and 'intentions to remain in education after compulsory schooling'. The study found that opportunities to participate are 'unequally distributed', and that household income appeared to be a key area of inequality, with those from the poorest households being 'much less likely to take part in all types of extra-curricular activities, but especially music classes and sport' (Donnelly, Lažetić, Sandoval-Hernandez, Kumar, and Whewall, 2019).
68. We found very little material overall for this review on the experiences of musicians with disabilities, but the Take it away Consortium – partnership between Creative United and Take It Away, Drake Music, Music for Youth, The OHMI Trust, Open Up Music and Youth Music – undertook some research to survey Disabled^{vii} musicians on their experiences, and work with a group of co-researchers who were also Disabled musicians to interpret the findings (Youth Music, 2020). The report finds that Disabled musicians are often limited in their instrument choice, and tended to choose something they could play without adaptation often because knowledge about adapted instruments was limited. Retailers surveyed in the study were usually not familiar with adapted instruments, and only a minority of Music Education Hubs responding to the survey held any specialist equipment or adapted instruments for instrument loan. Finding

accessible music lessons and funding support was difficult for some survey participants. Participation in activities like public music groups was low amongst respondents, and only half of those surveyed felt they had suitable opportunities to perform music to an audience if they wanted to. The report concludes with a set of recommendations, and looks beyond educational settings to changes which might be made within the wider music industry; it particularly identifies a lack of understanding from music education and industry settings of the barriers which Disabled musicians face, and the necessity for involving Disabled people in designing educational and industry responses which would support Disabled musicians better (Youth Music, 2020: 47).

3.1.2 Higher education

69. Scharff's study (2015b) used HESA data across an 18-year span (1995/1996 to 2012/2013). What she finds is overrepresentation of women at five UK conservatoires in the mid-nineties, subsiding to a roughly equal representation of men and women by 2012/2013. Historically, Green identifies sources which indicate a high presence of girls and women in formal educational structures in the late 19th century: in 1890 90% of ABRSM candidates were girls, and most students at the conservatoires were women (1997: 60). Sergeant and Himonides also looked at admissions to UK Conservatoires, and conclude that conservatoire admissions seemed to imitate the data on instrumental learners in music services, with around 20% more female than male candidates, and no evidence that admissions were made disproportionately to candidates of either sex. In contradiction to this De Boise (2018), in his comparative study of gender and HE music admissions in the UK and Sweden, analysed admissions to undergraduate programmes in UK conservatoires and identifies that whilst women made up 62% of the applicants in 2014, they only made up 52% of those students gaining an offer – demonstrating that women in his sample experienced a lower application to offer ratio than men. Scharff (2019) also considers comparative acceptance rates via UCAS Conservatoires data from 2014 (UCAS Conservatoires, 2015) and identifies both the higher application rates for women and the higher acceptance rates for men.
70. Whilst Swedish universities appeared to have a lower proportion of women both applying and receiving offers for higher education music courses, proportionally more women applicants received an offer than was the case with men applicants (De Boise, 2018). Corresponding data for postgraduate programmes in UK conservatoires for the same period (2014) also shows that whilst there are fewer men than women applying for courses, a larger proportion of men applicants are accepted than is the case with women applicants (UCAS Conservatoires, 2015).^{viii}
71. Looking more widely at music degrees, Bain uses HESA data and notes an increase in the proportion of women taking both undergraduate and postgraduate degrees in music over the period from 2013-2018, with female undergraduates peaking at 43%, and female postgraduates at 49%. Bain provides some useful comparisons between different types of degree courses: music performance, as opposed to composition, music technology and theory/management/education, has the closest gender balance. In degree course type, the proportion of women is higher at postgraduate than at undergraduate stage (Bain, 2019: 20-21). De Boise's study of UK and Sweden applicants and offers for HE music courses also confirms the 'gendered imbalances' that occur across different types of music courses, in different music genres (classical and popular music courses), in music technology and in courses which focus on areas like music business/industry and music teaching/pedagogy (2018). Amongst these is a

grouping for 'music teaching/pedagogy' in which both the UK and Sweden show more women than men applying for and receiving offers for these degrees (in the UK women make up 68% of those offered a place on courses in this grouping) (2018: 29).

72. Born and Devine, in their study comparing the demographics of students taking traditional music degrees and those taking music technology degrees in UK higher education, found that almost 90% of music technology admissions were male, in comparison with traditional music degrees which showed a 45% male, 55% female split (2015). The authors were able to identify that a higher proportion of female students (17.5%) took music technology A-Level than were then represented in the applicants and admissions at higher education, and suggest that there may be a useful comparison to be found in the way in which representation of women lessens across the various stages of science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) subjects and professions. Born and Devine also connect this issue to the question of gender and musical composition/constructions of artistic authority (touched on elsewhere in the review, via Green, 1997).
73. Sergeant and Himonides looked at UK conservatoires over a recent five-year period (2012-2016) and found that the relationship between gender and instrument choice which they had explored elsewhere (in pre-higher education instrument learning, discussed above) was carried through into instrument study within conservatoires (2019: 13-14).
74. Looking at ethnicity, in 2012/2013 8% of students at five UK conservatoires were from Black and minority ethnic backgrounds, in comparison with 10% of students undertaking a music degree across all UK institutions (Scharff, 2015b: 9).^{ix} Born and Devine, comparing the student demography of traditional music degrees and music technology degrees in UK higher education, found a higher proportion of Black and minority ethnic students on music technology degrees (15%) than was the case on traditional music degrees (6%) and the national average for undergraduates on any degree (about 11%) (Born and Devine, 2015: 138).
75. Looking at proxy indicators for class, Scharff uses POLAR data to identify that only a very small proportion of conservatoire students (3.9% in 2012/2013) came from neighbourhoods with low participation in higher education in comparison to a UK student population average of over 10%. In addition, 24.4% of conservatoire students in 2012/2013 had attended a private school (Scharff, 2015b: 8). Scharff (2019) also considers comparative acceptance rates via UCAS Conservatoires data from 2014 (UCAS Conservatoires, 2015) and identifies the higher application and acceptance rates for those from the most advantaged areas, particularly in comparison with those from the most disadvantaged areas.
76. Born and Devine used a combination of indicators (already outlined earlier in this review) to explore the socio-economic class intake to traditional music and music technology degrees. Using POLAR data, they found that traditional music degrees admit a larger proportion of students from those areas most likely to participate in higher education and from students who have attended selective schools, and that music technology degrees admit more students from those areas least likely to participate in higher education and from non-selective schools (Born and Devine, 2015: 152). Music technology degrees are also, therefore, in line with the growth of intake across higher education from those lower participation POLAR quintiles. Traditional music degrees also tend to admit students with higher overall A-Level points scores, and music technology degrees which are BA/BMus programmes are more likely to admit students with lower overall A-Level points scores; music technology which are BSc/BEng sit somewhere in-between on A-Level scores.^x

3.1.3 Gender/sex in the classical music workforce

77. In considering gender representation in orchestras, Scharff identifies an older study which puts the proportion of women in British orchestras at 30% in 1990 (Allmendinger and Hackman, 1995); by comparison, Scharff's more recent dataset estimates that just over 43% of players in British orchestras are women (2015b: 10). The League of American Orchestras and Doeser's study of a longitudinal dataset on gender and racial/ethnic diversity in US orchestras show the gender balance of orchestras improving over a period of 36 years: in 1978 data reported by member orchestras indicated that 38% of musicians were women; in the early 1990s this began to rise more quickly, and in 2014 the proportion of women musicians was 47%. In assessing over 40 orchestras and 3,420 players, Sergeant and Himonides found that a majority of musicians in 'major' orchestras in the UK, Europe and North America were male (56.7%) (2019: 4). This did, however, vary across the three regions chosen by the study: in Europe (not including the UK) 63% of musicians were male, whereas in the UK and North America this was less at 56%). In addition, using a study on instrument choices made by learners through music services in England (Hallam et al, 2008) they state that:
- 'Fewer women achieve orchestral positions than would be predicted by the numbers of girls receiving instruction....and conversely, a greater percentage of men achieve orchestral positions than would be predicted by numbers of boys receiving tuition...'
(Sergeant and Himonides, 2019: 9).
78. Where information was available about the duration of service by players (only for 4 orchestras), the data showed that men had typically served longer than women in an orchestra (mean duration for men of 19.3 years vs 16.65 years for women); and, proportionally, women were at the point of maximum representation between 16-20 years' service, with men at their maximum representation between 20-25 years' service. The authors note that the average age of women in orchestras is lower than that of men (Sergeant and Himonides, 2019: 7).^{xi}
79. Sergeant and Himonides identify a relationship between sex and instrument in their study of orchestras in the UK, Europe and the US: almost all harpists were female; the majority of flautists were female; brass sections were more likely to be male, and female brass players tended to be French horn players; no timpanists were female, and the significant majority of percussionists were male. This study had also further analysed data from Hallam, Rogers and Creech (2008) on child instrumentalists, and was able to conclude that correlation between gender and instrument choice for orchestral musicians and gender and instrument choice for the children and young people was 'high and highly significant for both sexes' (Sergeant and Himonides, 2019: 9).
80. Scharff's 2015(b) study looks at the relationship between instrument choice and gender through both the membership of British orchestras, and conservatoire teaching staff. Similar patterns to those outlined in other studies are visible: most harpists were women, and almost all harp teachers; all tuba players and teachers were men. Generally, men dominated in brass and percussion; the only instrument other than harp in which women dominated as conservatoire teachers was the flute.
81. In their study of orchestras, Sergeant and Himonides also identify a relationship between particularly kinds of prestigious organisations and roles, and sex. Within their North America cohort, they found that the 'Big 5' orchestras compared with 25 other orchestras had a higher

overall proportion of male musicians; and that in those 25 orchestras where there were more female musicians, this resulted in increased representation in the violins, woodwind and harp (areas like brass and percussion remained ‘almost exclusively male territory’) (Sergeant and Himonides, 2019: 4), suggesting an intersection of horizontal and vertical segregation (i.e. both instrument choice and prestige are interacting with gender in producing employment patterns). With regards to leadership roles, the study also notes that only two orchestras had female trombone principals, and only one had a female tuba principal.

82. More generally, the presence of female players in musical leadership roles in orchestras – using the designation of ‘Principal’ across the 40 orchestras included in the study – is significantly less than that of male players: 83.2% men vs 16.8% women (Sergeant and Himonides, 2019: 6). The Berlin Philharmonic and Vienna Philharmonic listed only one female principal each, and the Bavarian Radio Orchestra had none.
83. Scharff identifies the absence of women in conducting and roles of artistic leadership, with 1.4% of conductors and 2.9% of artistic/musical directors being women (2015b: 13). Only 26.8% of principals in British orchestras were women. On the question of ‘prestige’, Scharff also notes that whilst – at the date of the study – they found that women made up 43% of the population of British orchestras, and that this number was lower in an orchestra identified as particularly prestigious. Looking at US orchestras, data collected between 2006 and 2016 shows almost no change in the proportion of women music directors (9%) and women conductors (21%) (League of American Orchestras and Doeser, 2016).
84. Within a wider music context, Bain’s study also looks at the artist rosters of record labels, and finds a similar imbalance of male to female artists, though classical music record labels (in comparison, for example, to drum and bass and grime music) tended to have a higher proportion of female artists. Despite this, only 32% of solo artists signed to UK classical labels are female (Bain, 2019: 14).
85. Looking at staff working in US orchestras, five years (2010-2014) of data on the diversity of orchestra staff indicate a slight narrowing of the gap between male and female staff, with female staff decreasing from 59% to 56%. In this period there was consistently a very slightly higher proportion of female top executives than male. Board membership over the same period also seems to be moving slowly towards parity, with 58% of Board members being male in 2014 (League of American Orchestras and Doeser, 2016). In a UK context, Scharff notes that women also made up only 34.7% of Board members of music sector organisations, based on Arts Council England data for 2014 (2015b:14).
86. Plumb’s study (an MA dissertation from 2019) of five symphony orchestras in the UK suggests that women are slightly overrepresented in ‘orchestral management’. Her study finds no evidence of vertical segregation, with women being well represented at the most senior levels^{xii}, but did find evidence of horizontal segregation with technical and production roles being much more likely to be occupied by men, and women being more highly represented in areas like artistic planning, development/fundraising and learning.
87. In conservatoire teaching, Scharff’s study found that men were overrepresented at 70%; Scharff notes that working in a conservatoire is ‘regarded a more prestigious form of teaching’ (2015b). Around 2% of conservatoire teachers were identified as bring from a Black and minority ethnic background. By comparison, the ABRSM survey of 4,491 instrumental teachers (a third of

whom also reported that they were a 'professional performer' and only 4% of whom reported teaching in a university or college) found that 71% were female.

88. This study has, for the practical necessities of setting a scope which could be managed by the available resources, excluded much material which relates to composers. However, it is worth noting (as Green, 1997 and others do) that composition is one of the most unequal areas in terms of gender balance. In exploring contemporary music composers writing for UK publishers, Bain identifies that 86% are men. Her study splits up the data by musical genre; 23% of composers listed in writing teams by classical publishers are female (Bain attributes this to 'a high number of women in educational music'), but overall (i.e. including composers listed individually) only 14% of composers working with UK classical music publishers are female (Bain, 2019: 11). She also looks at the staff working for music publishers, and reports that 37% of those working for UK music publishers are female (2019: 22-23).
89. A study by The Ivors Academy (formerly BASCA) gathered data on composition students and looked at commissioned works which were entered for the British Composition Awards (now 'The Ivors'), and found that women were in the minority (36% of students and 21% of commissioned works), and from undergraduate, through taught postgraduate courses to PhDs. They also found that women were more significantly underrepresented in more prestigious commissions.

3.1.4 Ethnicity/race in the classical music workforce

90. Scharff's study of the membership of British orchestras estimates, based on observation, that only 1.7% of members come from a Black or minority ethnic background. The Ivors Academy (formerly BASCA) study referred to earlier on compositions found that of those composers who were in the commissioned sample, only 7% were from Black and minority ethnic backgrounds (BASCA, n.d.).
91. Beyond Scharff's work on orchestral membership, the only other significant assessment in terms of data on ethnic/racial representation in the classical music workforce comes from the US and thus the circumstances and context are different to that in the UK. Nevertheless, the study includes a longitudinal dataset which provides some useful evidence where change is, and is not, taking place. The study by League of American Orchestras and Doerer, looked a period of 34 years and identified a slow increase in 'non-white'^{xiii} musicians in US orchestras from 3% in 1980 to 14% in 2014. This shift seems mostly to reflect an increase in Asian and Pacific Islander^{xiv} musicians (a 70% increase over this period), where growth in other racial and ethnic groups has been less significant: for example, the proportion of African American musicians has averaged at just below 2% across the period of the data. When looking at the size of orchestra, smaller orchestras were more racially and ethnically diverse than larger ones; this was particularly reflected in the proportions of African American and Hispanic/Latino musicians (League of America Orchestras and Doerer, 2016: 4).
92. Looking at the relationship between racial and ethnic diversity and senior musical staff, the proportion of 'non-white' conductors shows a slow increase between 2006 and 2016 (from 16% to 21%), and a similar rise (from 17% to 22%) can be seen over the same period in 'non-white' music directors. It appears to be the case that 'non-white' conductors were more likely to be working with larger orchestras, though the sample sizes of the data mean that this finding should be treated cautiously. Over five years (2010-2014) the proportion of 'non-white' staff has

been about 14% on average, and not varied significantly. Using a core constant sample to remove the possible effects of local population variation, a slight decline in the representation of African American and Hispanic/Latino staff is visible over the same five-year period. The proportion of 'non-white' top executives varied between just below 2% and 5% in this period. Board membership was quite static in this period, with just under 8% being 'non-white' (League of American Orchestras and Doeser, 2016).

3.2 Experiences of working in classical music

93. This section explores what the literature can tell us about the experiences of diversity in classical music. It is split into two parts. The first looks at direct experiences of working in classical music, considers formal and informal elements of the way in which working practices are constructed and explores material on career and life choices. It also looks at the available literature on harassment and discrimination, and considers how the industry engages with members of the workforce who have disabilities, long-term health conditions or facets of neurodiversity, and reviews literature on injury and illness amongst the workforce.
94. The second part looks at material which considers complex questions of influence, identity and meaning, and includes literature which advances critical analyses of the relationship between classical music and its structures and the socially constructed manifestations and experiences of different characteristics.

3.2.1 How does the work work?

Recruitment Processes

95. Amongst the material which looks at the experiences of the workforce in classical music, there is a small cluster of literature which focuses on audition processes for musician jobs in orchestras. Part of the reason for this cluster of literature is the famous study of the effect of screened auditions on female musicians by Goldin and Rouse, which concluded that screened auditions were helpful to female musicians. They estimated that adopting screened auditions increased the likelihood of a woman gaining an orchestral job for which she was auditioning by between 7.5 and 13.7 percentage points (1997: 23), and the study was picked up in the media and by others with the headline that the use of a screen in auditions increased the probability that women would go through by 50%. The peer-reviewed article, published later than the working paper, notes some caveats relating to sample and data sizes and statistical significance, but stands by this headline claim (Goldin and Rouse, 2000).
96. More recently, the study has received scrutiny which questions the validity and clarity of this headline claim. Criticisms relate in part to the reliability of the dataset as supporting evidence for the kind of conclusive statement and the clarity of the formulation of this headline claim. A more recent study of 'blind' hiring practices (for a different sector) in Australia, where they found that the approach hindered female applicants, has also added to this revised view that screened auditions may not remove discrimination in the way or to the extent that has been asserted (Soave, 2019).
97. Sergeant and Himonides (2019) provide a useful context for their contemporary study of the representation of male and female musicians in 'world-class' symphony orchestras, by noting

the slow entry into professional orchestras by female musicians, and particularly into some European institutions (e.g. the Berlin Philharmonic admitting women in 1982, and the Vienna Philharmonic only in 1997) (Sergeant and Himonides, 2019: 2). They also go on to consider contemporary practice around recruitment in the 40 orchestras included in their study, comparing the UK system of auditions followed by extended trialling against the US system of appointment following auditions and the use of screened auditions in the US. This study does not draw any particular conclusions about the relationship between recruitment processes and gender balance in employment.

98. Elsewhere, there have been some attempts to understand the potential relationship between recruitment processes and possible discrimination. Fasang's study of musicians in German orchestras used a questionnaire with 144 usable responses, and plotted a number of background variables including gender, education (what we would recognise in the UK to be both undergraduate and postgraduate higher education courses), on the job training and parental musical activities (Fasang, 2006). Musicians in some cases provided data for up to 150 applications each, and the study produced two ratios: that of written application to invitation to audition, and that of audition to job selection. The study assumes that all audition experiences were screened, and concludes that whilst the use of screened auditions appeared to remove potential discrimination, the initial step of selecting amongst written applications those to be invited to audition still demonstrated significant gender discrimination against women.
99. Work by the League of American Orchestras, Rabkin and Hairston O'Connell considers briefly the question of auditions and their effect upon musicians from racially and ethnically underrepresented groups with respect to US orchestras. Through their interviews, they discovered both support for and scepticism of screened auditions as a way of removing discrimination. Interviewees referred to the pre-audition screening process, and the need to demonstrate a particular training pedigree – the right conservatoire, the right teachers – and also to the ways in which orchestras might effectively 'work around' the screened audition process to still select in a particular way.

Making a living

100. More generally, several studies reviewed here which include a qualitative element shed some useful light on the less formal activities and approaches which musicians are required to engage in, in order to make a living. They also reflect in different ways on the pressures and challenges of making enough money, and some of the ways in which the typical structure of working arrangements and conditions interact with individuals and their particular experiences.
101. Scharff's study of 64 female musicians working in London and Berlin includes reflections on the way in which networking is a 'key component' of how the work works (2018). Some study participants who identified themselves as being from lower middle-class or working-class backgrounds reported having to learn to network, having no experience of doing so but recognising the requirement for it. One musician identified not knowing some of the typical networking practices (e.g. arranging consultation lessons with conservatoire teachers prior to auditions), and others pointed out that networking meant engaging with people from a different class background than their own. By contrast 'participants who felt comfortable networking were all middle-class' (Scharff, 2018: 100).
102. Through the same interview material, Scharff outlines the way in which musicians see their work and themselves as being economically framed: they are running a business, and the product is

themselves (2015a: 6). This commodification of the self was not something interviewees liked, although Scharff highlights how some study participants found ways in which to engage with it more positively. Interviewees (who are all young women) reveal some key areas in which their gender affected their relationship to expected modes of working. Musicians were reluctant to promote themselves, but better at promoting others; they expected that male musicians were better than female musicians at self-promotion, and saw self-promotion as an activity lacking in 'modesty', being too 'pushy' and not coming naturally (2015a: 9-10). As a result, interviewees gave examples of undertaking self-promotion in way which was 'nice'; Scharff frames this response to the need to self-promote as reinforcement of a kind of 'safe' femininity.

103. In addition, some interviewees also wanted their art to speak for itself and placed the commercial activities of self-promotion in opposition to this (2015a: 12-13). There is also the suggestion that having to engage in self-promotion threatens a female's status as artist because that status is already quite fragile (the role of the artist being normatively male). However, Scharff's study also reveals musicians who reported struggling to escape their gender as artists: for example, a women brass player who reported finding it hard to avoid being 'typecast' in a marketing strategy. Scharff also notes some of the difficulties interviewees had with navigating their public presence, including what to wear on stage, and that one interviewee had talked about female players building careers through relationships with men in power, with others stating that they actively sought to avoid this kind of rumour attaching itself to them.
104. Scharff's book on gender and classical music takes her analysis of working conditions further, in terms of framing questions of precarity in the context of the social and other norms of the classical musicians' profession. She points out that whilst study participants talked openly with her – as a researcher – about their concerns and experiences, they were not prepared to do so in the same way with colleagues. Several study participants suggested that talking about difficulties in getting work, or problems in making a living, was in some way taboo (one study participant suggested that these were "unwritten rules") (Scharff, 2019: 152). Scharff finds that her study participants demonstrate an 'acceptance' these elements of precarity, considering them to be just part of how the profession works. The musicians also tended to deny the impact of this precarity on individuals. Scharff argues that this amounts to an 'individualisation of failure': that the structural failures which may be constraining, contributing to and causing this precarity are unacknowledged.
105. Through her study participants, Scharff also explored the ways in which the subjectivity of what it feels like to do the work (of being a classical musician) is framed within experiences of place, particularly comparing Berlin and London. London is described several times by study participants as a "hard" place to live and work, in particular reference to living costs, the challenges of travelling for work (costing time and money) and needing to continually take on further work and finding it difficult to plan appropriate breaks from work. In some cases, study participants based in London still lived with parents, or benefited from arrangements which enabled them to live at below market rates; but Scharff notes that these arrangements are another element of precarity, and give a sense that 'not only that life in London was hard, but also uncertain' (Scharff, 2017: 179-182).
106. Scharff's work in framing her empirical research within the theoretical frame of exploring entrepreneurial subjectivity brings to the fore both the positive and negative aspects of classical music as cultural work, from the pleasure of playing to the difficulties of making a living. Whilst Scharff concludes that the entrepreneurial framing is not 'absolute' in the way in which musicians delineated their experiences, she also notes that other framings or discourses – such

as an acknowledgement of structural limits – were not often used. Individual happenstance – ‘luck’ – was more likely to be suggested as a reason for success or failure (2017).

107. Help Musicians worked with a research partner to understand the career development of post graduate students who at some point had applied for (and in some cases received) financial support from Help Musicians to support their studies. They wanted to understand what the longer-term effects of these awards might be, but the survey of just over 100 musicians (70% of whom were focused on classical music or opera) also revealed some interesting differences between different groups within the sample. The survey respondents reported their pay, and the results show a pay gap between male and female respondents, with female respondents reporting earning 25% less than their male counterparts in the first year after graduating, improving to 18% less further down the line (Payne and Taylor, 2017: 5-6). Generally, their findings also reflected the precarious nature of trying to earn a living as a musician, with unpaid work, the need to undertake paid work outside music to stay afloat, oversupply of labour for the work demand, significant debt and, overall, low earnings all characterising the experiences of students and graduates.
108. These precarious features of employment emerge as a common factor in surveys of classical music workers undertaken by music industry bodies, for example, the Musicians’ Union commissioned survey in 2012 which highlighted low average earnings and other challenges around terms and conditions such as poor pension provision (DHA, 2012). Other elements of precarity have emerged particularly from other work by Help Musicians (formerly the Musicians’ Benevolent Fund) which provides grants and services to musicians at various stages of their careers. Their Health and Wellbeing Survey from 2014, for example, reveals a range of challenges from ‘anti-social hours’, ‘money problems’ and ‘work insecurity’ through to a range of mental and physical health negative experiences and conditions (Help Musicians, 2014).

Having a career

109. Bennett’s work on musicians and their career paths and experiences is useful partly because of the way in which it places focus on something which is otherwise not widely explored in the literature reviewed here. She identifies the absence of data which might illuminate policy-making about ‘the way in which artists live and work’, and identifies challenges with datasets which are not well set up to respond to the ‘fluid’ nature of working life for artists, and particular issues around holding multiple jobs and experiencing what Bennett terms a ‘composite’ career (Bennett, 2005). Bennett’s study also highlights a wider range of skills which musicians have to develop and use in their careers, including business and communications skills, and engaging in activities like networking (2005: 209-210). On the whole, Bennett’s work does not include material which enables us to understand whether different demographic backgrounds for individual musicians make a difference in their experience of working; however, her work is included here because it seems to be a key reference (where there is a sparsity of material) in terms of understanding how musicians’ careers work.
110. One of the interesting elements of Bennett’s earlier fieldwork (available via an unpublished thesis from 2005, and later in a book in 2008) is the way in which her research reveals the influence of what she terms ‘attitudinal and hierarchical barriers’ (2008: 123), particularly in relation to the way in which musicians viewed the relationships between performing activities and non-performing activities. Bennett notes that whilst musicians in her study reported spending more time teaching than performing, there were gender differences with male musicians on average spending more of their working time in ‘performance, composition,

examining, and technical roles' and female musicians spending more of their working time in 'teaching, ensemble direction and business roles' (2005: 205). Bennett outlines the way in which musicians self-reported a sense of hierarchy: soloists were at the top, instrumentalists in the middle and teachers at the base. Study participants reported resigning themselves to teaching roles because they could not gain enough performance work, though Bennett also highlights the ways in which some participants found value in their teaching practice (2005: 206-7).

111. Bennett and Hennekam's study of musicians' career trajectories (in all musical genres), and the motivations behind different career choices and pathways, similarly highlights the emphasis from early career musicians on pursuing a 'performance career', which is 'positioned as superior to other career outcomes; a solo career was the pinnacle of success' (Bennett and Hennekam, 2018: 114). Non-performance careers, such as teaching, were seen as 'less desirable'. Bennett and Hennekam usefully identify a range of other research in which this career hierarchy has been recognised amongst early career musicians. Their analysis goes on to outline the ways in which musicians' choices alter and adapt, as (in many cases) they discover that they cannot make a living solely from performance, but also as they explore other potential areas of activity. In their study, most mid-career musicians reported: that their career had not developed as they had expected; an acceptance of multiple roles and activities (including teaching and administration) and of the competitive nature of performance careers; and that a desire to seek greater autonomy and a range of other factors affected mid-career choices.
112. At both the mid-career and the late-career stage, Bennett and Hennekam's analysis reveals how musicians adapt and respond to the relative precarity and changeability of their career opportunities. Within their dataset, Bennett and Hennekam were able to look at a subset of 'classically-trained musicians', and identified some differences between them and the wider sample of musicians from a range of genres. These included: more classical musicians reporting "passion" as the main career driver; working more hours; being less likely to work in the community sector, and more likely to work in the commercial and not-for-profit sectors; more likely to have teaching as a source of revenue; being less likely to be unemployed (in fact, none were); being less likely to work part-time; appearing to be more sustainable in terms of income; and being very likely to use networks to find work, including using professional associations.

Life Choices

113. In addition to Bennett's work on professional choices and trajectories, several qualitative studies discussed 'life' choices, mostly focusing on questions of family and caring responsibilities with study participants. Scharff's study of female musicians working in London and Berlin focused upon musicians in their late 20s and early 30s. One of the topics covered in the interviews was the study participants' views on having children (some participants had children, and some did not); Scharff states that about a third of participants portrayed having children, or planning to have children, 'as "really difficult"'. Reasons given for this view included: unsocial hours and challenges of childcare provision; absence of maternity benefits, particularly for freelancers; and the importance of 'regular practice to remain able to compete professionally' (Scharff, 2018: 103). Some participants felt that the flexible nature of freelancing was helpful in managing parenthood, but others thought the unpredictable nature of it was a challenge.^{xv} It was also the case that some study participants anticipated there being a challenge in balancing the emotional commitment they had to their musical practice with having children (Scharff, 2018: 104).

114. Bennett's study of classical musicians in Australia finds that 'irregular' and 'unsociable' hours were key factors in musicians making choices to undertake alternative work or change their career structures. She notes that:

'...the impact was felt most keenly by women, who were also strongly influenced by family circumstances.' (2005: 227).

Bain (2019) posits the notion of a 'motherhood penalty', as well as 'unsociable hours', as one of the barriers to greater female participation and representation in the wider music industry, and refers to the work undertaken by PiPA and academics at Birkbeck on the relationship between caring responsibilities and careers in the performing arts (McDowell et al, 2019). The PiPA report, based on a survey of over 2,500 workers in the performing arts (or previously working in the performing arts) identifies caring responsibilities as the main contributing factor for leaving the sector, with low income and financial instability the second most reported factor. The survey suggests that there is a pay gap between those who are parents and carers, and those who are not, and that this exacerbates the challenges of working in a sector with limited pay, job security and – in some cases – just not enough paying work to make ends meet (McDowell et al, 2019: 7).

115. Bogdanovic in her qualitative study of staff working in HE music notes that some female participants expressed anxiety about the prospect of starting a family and taking maternity leave, which they saw as a likely delay and interference with their career progression, and their relationships with colleagues and students (2015: 14). Some participants reported being asked about possible family commitments in interviews for roles in HE, and Bogdanovic notes that no female participants acknowledged having children when taking part in the focus groups (many said they did not, and others did not offer information).
116. Plumb's thesis also includes a small series of interviews with staff working in administrative / executive roles in orchestras, and through these she identifies barriers to career progression, some of which appear to be gendered, including: for women, the availability of part-time roles and the challenge of working long hours in terms of fitting with family life and caring responsibilities; and for men the steadiness of income/job security to support family commitments (Plumb, 2019). The study's sample sizes are small, but the findings suggest some useful further areas for research.

Harassment and discrimination

117. Three recent surveys, from cultural sector membership organisations representing the workforce, explore experiences of harassment and discrimination. In 2017 the Incorporated Society of Musicians (ISM) surveyed 'the music sector' to ask musicians questions about their experiences of harassment. Across 600 or so responses, 47% of respondents reported having experienced sexual harassment, inappropriate behaviour or discrimination in the course of their work as a professional musician, though the technical note in the report suggests that this figure should be higher due to the rates of attrition in the survey response (27% did not give an answer). By way of comparison, the Help Musicians' survey on health and wellbeing found that 44% of respondents reported sometimes or frequently having experienced discrimination (2014). In the ISM survey, 71% of those reporting having these experiences identified as female; 72% were self-employed. The report outlines the types of discrimination outlined by respondents as including:

‘...all nine types of discrimination as defined in the Equalities Act 2010... gender, gender reassignment, marriage and civil partnership, religion, maternity and pregnancy, race, sexual orientation, age and disability. Discrimination on the basis of mental health and appearance was also reported’ (ISM, 2018: 14).

118. Locations and perpetrators of sexual harassment were reported via the survey, and included places of education and work, colleagues, teachers and those in authority. 23% of respondents said that they had reported their experiences, with the fear of losing work being the most commonly cited reason for not reporting harassment (ISM, 2018). 23% of respondents reported experiencing gender discrimination, 80% of whom were female; only 25% reported their experience. Reporting of other kinds of discrimination was lower (for example ageism was reported by 4% of respondents, and discrimination on the basis of race and/or heritage by 3% of respondents), and the levels of reporting of these experiences remain low in all areas (ISM, 2018).
119. Following this work, ISM worked with Equity and the Musicians’ Union on a survey of students attending higher education institutions, with a similar level of response (around 600 study participants). A portion of responses (15%) came from those attending music college, and a further group (14%) from those attending conservatoires which offer music and drama courses. Other respondents were university students, at specialist dance or drama schools, or elsewhere. The survey asked similar questions to the survey of professional musicians referred to above (ISM, 2018). Half of respondents reported having experienced sexual harassment, inappropriate behaviour, bullying or discrimination. 73% of those reporting these experiences identified as female. ‘Inappropriate behaviour’ was the most common experience reported, with bullying, gender discrimination and sexual harassment the next most common.
120. Fellow students and members of permanent teaching/academic staff were the most commonly identified perpetrators. 57% of respondents experiences these kinds of behaviours did not report their concerns, and only 13% say that they reported all their concerns. Of those who did report any concerns, 43% were satisfied with the outcome. 57% of all respondents knew how to report incidents if they occurred, and only 31% reported knowing that guidance/training on how to recognise and report inappropriate behaviour, bullying or discrimination was available (ISM, Equity and the Musicians’ Union, 2018).
121. More recently, the Musicians’ Union has surveyed musicians about sexual harassment, and reported that 48% of respondents had experienced sexual harassment at work, and that 85% of those did not report it. 61% of respondents reported feeling ‘at risk because they work on a freelance basis’. In reflecting upon barriers to reporting harassment, the study found that participants identified the following:

‘Workplace culture is currently cited as the greatest barrier to reporting harassment (55%), followed by fear of losing work (41%), expectations that the issue would not be handled appropriately (32%) and fear of not being believed or taken seriously (27%).’ (Musicians’ Union, 2019).

Disabilities, long-term health conditions and neurodiversity

122. This review could not find any meaningful studies which seek to assess the prevalence of musicians, or other members of the workforce, in classical music who have a disability, long-

term health condition or who may require support for other conditions including specific facets of neurodiversity. What was found covers some specific experiences of how disabilities or other conditions are, or are not, supported by the way in which the music sector works.

123. Attitude is Everything undertook a survey of 96 music artists (working in a range of genres, including classical music), exploring their experiences of working in the live music industry (2019). Half reported ‘access-related barriers’ in rehearsal spaces, and more than a third were not able to access their nearest rehearsal space. Half of respondents reported being ‘disabled by physical barriers at most gigs’ and a fifth had had to cancel shows due to physical access issues; two thirds reported having ‘had to compromise their health or wellbeing to perform live’. Study participants reported specific examples of physical access problems, ranging from stairs, uneven surfaces, signage, toilets and navigating unforgiving cancellation policies where poor health might mean a gig needs to be given up. Other kinds of issues included gigs being paid in alcohol and a general lack of information and support (Attitude is Everything, 2019)
124. Adding to other evidence we have already reviewed which suggests musicians feel that it is difficult to disclose health issues or requirements, 70% of respondents in Attitude is Everything’s survey agreed that they had ‘withheld details of a health condition or impairment due to being worried that doing so will cause problems and impact a relationship with a promoter, venue or festival’ (2019). When artists had disclosed issues, most reported not being taken seriously, or being ignored. 42% reported encountering access issues when applying for funding, and 40% reported experiencing access issues at industry events. Almost all the respondents agreed that ‘if artists with access requirements become more visible and are given the opportunity to speak out about their experiences’ it would contribute to the industry becoming more inclusive (Attitude is Everything, 2019).
125. Universal Music published a handbook in early 2020 which includes some research material from a survey of 49 employers in the creative industries and material from interviews with 14 individuals with ‘specific facets of neurodiversity’ (both freelance and employees) working in the sector. Only 17% of organisations who responded to the survey knew how many neurodiverse people they had in their organisation, and 75% did not have – or did not know if they had – policies and procedures in place for neurodiversity.^{xvi} The handbook also identifies barriers to neurodiverse staff within the workplace and makes recommendations for organisations to improve their support of neurodiverse employees or freelancers. It covers issues including: lack of awareness and understanding in organisations; recruitment and application processes; social norms and organisational culture (‘unwritten rules’); management and mentorship; career progression and retention. Other issues raised include: the way in which organisations and colleagues respond to disclosure of neurodiverse conditions; the challenges of freelancing; working circumstances, both on and off site, including things like touring experiences; and also day-to-day working practices. One of the contributing neurodiverse individuals is someone who works in an orchestra, and whose testimony highlights challenges relating to social interactions in classical music settings.
126. Fulford et al’s study of engagement in music-making by adults with hearing impairments undertook semi-structured interviews with 13 musicians, a mixture of amateur and professional, and with different levels of hearing impairment. The sense that disability is a ‘taboo’, which O’Donnell (2016) refers to and is discussed more fully below, is reflected in the ignorance exhibited by one study participant who sought to pursue music studies at university, only to be rejected by institutions who suggested that the participant’s deafness prohibit their study of music. Another participant whose hearing impairment occurred whilst they were in employment

in an orchestra refers to feeling the need to conceal his hearing loss from his colleagues (Fulford et al, 2011). In 2020 a report was published which explores the lived experience of Disabled musicians, both in educational settings and elsewhere. In an introductory section by Dr Jo Thomas she talks about the personal nature of disclosing disability, and the different factors which might affect her choice to disclose in different situations – she particularly identifies ‘other people’s assumptions’ as a barrier and challenge (Youth Music, 2020).

127. A study of conservatoire students’ perceptions of health and wellbeing found some ‘potentially harmful perceptions, attitudes, and behaviours toward health’ amongst the study participants, and identifies low engagement in ‘health responsibility and stress management’ (Araújo, Wasley, Perkins, Atkins, Redding, Ginsborg and Williamon, 2017). The study suggests that
- ‘most interventions and initiatives for physical and psychological health in conservatoire settings still develop as a result of identified problems that need fixing (e.g., MPA, musculoskeletal problems, and pain) rather than focusing on equipping students with the skills necessary to prevent, understand, and deal with the challenges of music making.’ (Araújo et al, 2017).
128. A later study by the same authors looks at physical fitness in music training, and concludes that music education settings, like conservatoires, could support fitness monitoring and health literacy amongst students, to enable both educational settings and students to take responsibility for fitness in order to prevent potential injuries and support musicians in their ongoing practice (Araújo et al, 2020). Both studies suggest that, on the whole, musicians are not trained or encouraged to consider their health and fitness as an integral part of their capacity and development as musicians; this seems to speak to the challenges raised by O’Donnell and participants in Fulford et al (2011) in reflecting a wider environment in which health, fitness and disability are not widely discussed or understood, or even considered important.
129. Participants were also asked about the particular challenges and approaches they experienced and used in their music-making, in response to their hearing impairments, including approaches to preparation and music learning, listening styles, engaging with visual and other cues and instructions. The study authors raise some useful areas in which further work could be undertaken to explore possible approaches to music-making between those with and without hearing impairments (Fuford et al, 2011).

Injury and Illness

130. Alongside the small volume of material found on disability and long-term health conditions, there is literature – and material within wider studies – which refers to experiences of injury and illness which take place both as a result of being part of the classical music workforce, and whilst – though not necessarily as a direct cause of – working. The extent to which these injuries or illness become longer-term conditions is not generally explored in detail.
131. Bennett’s work on classical musicians highlights the significant injury rates – through playing – which occur typically as a result of orchestral playing; interestingly, Bennett characterises the level of injuries reported amongst her study participants as being ‘significantly lower’ than the rate which was reported via other literature, and suggests that the musicians in her study – and particularly the male musicians – may have been reluctant to discuss injury (2005: 208). Heather O’Donnell’s writing (e.g. O’Donnell, 2016) which comes from the experiences of a musician, teacher and musicians’ health psychologist, places significant emphasis on the taboo

of acknowledging injuries and disabilities, the absence of open discussions and the way in which this taboo means that musicians who experience significant illness or injury often end up becoming 'invisible'. Scharff (2019) also discusses musicians 'hiding injuries'.

132. Work on hearing impairments, and particularly hearing loss as a result of or during the period of working as a musician, is an area where there is a cluster of work which has been undertaken internationally. For the purposes of this review we have selected some recent UK-based studies for inclusion here, but Greasley et al offer a useful review of other relevant studies which gives a sense of the wider picture of understanding in this area (2018: 2-4). In Help Musicians' survey of musicians from 2015 the majority of respondents identified that at least a portion of their work was in the classical music genre and just under a third reported being orchestral musicians. The survey explored musicians' experiences of hearing loss, and their response to that loss (2015). The survey is further analysed in Greasley et al, and key findings include a high prevalence of reported hearing loss (40%) as well as around a fifth of respondents stating that they 'don't know' if they had experienced hearing loss (2018).^{xvii} Older musicians were more likely to report hearing loss; and guitar, brass and percussion players were more likely than some other instruments.
133. Brass players were, of all the instrument groups, most worried about noise levels at work and most likely to attribute hearing loss to work. 58% of respondents 'felt that working as a musician was the main contributory factor to their hearing loss' (a further 19% said they didn't know). Around half of those who reported hearing loss, or said that they didn't know if they had hearing loss, also reported having sought professional help. Older musicians were more likely to have sought help; by instrument, brass players were least likely to have reported seeking help, with singers, pianists and string players being the most likely. Amongst the reasons selected for not having sought help, respondents either suggested a 'lack of concern or indifference' (e.g. feeling that it could not be changed, it did not affect their lives or career), 'insufficient knowledge or awareness' (e.g. unsure where to go, or unaware there might be a solution) or that they had taken action themselves already (Greasley et al, 2018). The study also explored use of hearing protection and attitudes towards hearing protection, and one important finding includes what the authors describe as 'a strong tension' between wanting to protect their hearing, and the sense that using protection limited their experience of their own and other musicians' sound output.
134. Help Musicians earlier survey (2014) looked more widely at the experiences of musicians in relation to a range of health problems and factors which might affect wellbeing, from performance anxiety to anti-social hours. As with the hearing loss survey, the majority of respondents reported working in the 'classical music' genre. The report particularly identifies three practice-related problems which a substantial proportion of survey respondents reported experiencing sometimes, or all of the time: performance anxiety (75%), repetitive strain injury (48%) and hearing problems (47%).
135. Breda and Kulesa, in a study from 1999 funded by the Symphony Orchestra Institute in the US, undertook a survey of orchestral musicians in US orchestras. Some findings which are relevant in the context of this literature review include a levels of job satisfaction and perceived stress being related to being less favourable towards the profession, the perception of musician's having less of a voice and a more negative view of management. Interestingly players under 40 were more likely to report experiencing perceived stress or lower job satisfaction. In comparison with men, women reported more job dissatisfaction, rated their orchestras and profession less favourably, and were more likely to report physical distress. In the context of Help Musicians' survey findings on performance anxiety, it is also worth noting that Breda and Kulesa's survey

found that 52% of respondents had used beta-blockers in response to performance anxiety, and that this was more prevalent (60%) in those under the age of 40. Using beta-blockers was a factor associated with more stress, less job satisfaction, a more negative view of the orchestra and of the profession (Breda and Kulesa, 1999).

136. Gross and Musgrave, in a two-part study for Help Musicians, surveyed and interviewed professional musicians (including classical musicians) to explore incidence of mental health issues. A large proportion of the survey cohort reported having experienced ‘panic attacks and/or high levels of anxiety’ (71%); similarly, many reported having experienced depression (69%). The report notes that this is a significantly higher incidence than would be the case for the general population (Gross and Musgrave, 2016), though – as we have noted already in relation to Greasley et al (2018) – what it is difficult to assess is the possible impact of response bias in those musicians choosing to complete the survey.
137. Amongst the qualitative data from both the survey and the later interviews are suggestions from musicians that the structure of the music industry is a contributing factor to poor mental health, with factors including: the precarity of working conditions and earnings; the precarity of experience, in terms of the degree of contingency involved in building a career; lack of respect for the profession, often from those outside it; absence of transparency in working arrangements, and the heavy reliance on networking which requires a particular kind of presentation of the self; the way in which many musicians feel that their sense of self is bound up in their work; an environment in which critical feedback and self-critical practices are encouraged and common (what the study authors call ‘the feedback economy’); the challenges of trying to maintain family relationships, particularly where working requirements take musicians away for periods of time; difficulties of balancing portfolio working with the need to take a break from time to time; potential for physical illness and injury; anti-social working environments; discrimination and bullying; and the challenges of finding support for mental health issues, particularly as many musicians are self-employed (Gross and Musgrave, 2016 and 2017).

3.2.2 Diversity, identity and meaning

138. Alongside the analysis of representation in the workforce and considerations of the way in which working life is constructed, there is also literature which looks at a set of complex and difficult questions about how identity is constructed through and in response to classical music. This part looks at this material in two areas. It first examines material which reflects upon the influences on those in the classical music workforce, and particularly highlights the importance of family background and experience. The second grouping is material which explores narratives and identities in classical music.

Family, role models and other influences

139. Bull and Scharff bring their qualitative data^{xviii} together in an examination of class and classical music and raise the question of how the attitudes towards classical music which are held by classical musicians’ families, shapes the experiences of those musicians. The authors suggest a relationship between class and the experience of, and attitude towards, classical music, particularly as a profession. Those musicians who considered their families ‘musical’ (and were therefore supportive of them) were middle-class, and those who did not describe their families as ‘musical’, and reported difficulties in pursuing a professional life in classical music, were

lower-middle-class or working-class (Bull and Scharff, 2017: 289). Musicians who considered their families 'musical' felt that the presence of classical music in the house, and encouragement to learn music, were 'natural' and 'uncontested' (Bull and Scharff, 2017: 290). Musicians' from a lower middle-class or working-class background talked about their parents feeling that classical music was not a 'safe' or 'secure' profession (ibid); the lack of familiarity and perceptions of risk meant that parents expressed concern or encouraged musicians to find other professions.

140. This article also demonstrated the relationship between perceptions of value and classical music, including reflecting on whether musicians had listened to classical music with their parents in childhood. Again, there appeared to be a relationship between class and the presence of, and taste for, classical music within the family setting (Bull and Scharff, 2017). Work by the League of American Orchestras, Rabkin and Hairston O'Connell (2016) also suggests that families play a crucial role in supporting musicians. In their study of fellowship programmes working with young musicians from racially and ethnically underrepresented groups in US orchestras, they interviewed several fellows and identified that many had grown up in families where parents and/or siblings were musicians.
141. League of American Orchestras et al (2016) also suggests that families play a crucial role in supporting musicians in working through the various stages of education and training. In their study of fellowship programmes working with young musicians from racially and ethnically underrepresented groups in US orchestras, they interviewed several fellows and identified that they had 'successfully navigated the pipeline'. They had, in many cases, had the advantage of attending schools with strong music programmes and particularly engaged and engaging music teachers and provision and had access to instruments and lessons in a way which was not financially prohibitive. Many also indicated having taken up key opportunities – summer schools, multiple fellowships, other specific and targeted programmes to support young musicians. They had gone on to conservatoires and prestigious music programmes in universities (League of American Orchestras, Rabkin and Hairston O'Connell, 2016: 14).
142. Fulford et al's study examines the context, motivations and early experiences of a group of study participants who were musicians with hearing impairments and notes the importance of families and parents (all but one study participant described having a 'musical family'). There were cases of participants who had hearing impairments as children, and for whom music operated in a very specific way, as 'a means of escaping the challenges of day-to-day verbal interaction' (Fulford et al, 2011: 461).
143. Work by Irwin and Elley looking at parents and the relationship between class and parenting approaches adds a useful layer, suggesting that class correlates not only to particular cultural tastes and familiarities with cultural practices, but also to different approaches to parenting and views of the purpose/value of parenting activities. Following work in America (e.g. Lareau, 2003) on the theory that middle and working-class families follow different cultural logics, they explore the notion of 'concerted cultivation' as a logic pursued by middle-class families in their choice of extra-curricula activities for their children. Irwin and Elley refer to a wider literature looking at the ways in which some middle-class families engage their children in organized activities, in part as a way of both ensuring that their children do not become 'left behind' other middle-class children and addressing their own feelings of class-based anxiety.
144. What their study found is that this 'anxiety' is not the prevailing motivation for all middle-class parents. Instead, what they identified examples which include the case of a parent who learned

to play music as a child, and now supports her children in learning instruments, demonstrating what Irwin and Elley (after Lareau) term a 'natural attitude'. This 'natural attitude' is an assumption of the intrinsic and social value of activities like learning an instrument, and a parental approach – in line with the logic of 'concerted cultivation' – of pursuing organised activities to benefit their children (Irwin and Elley, 2011: 488). Where Irwin and Elley found greater evidence of middle-class parents strategizing more explicitly in terms of their children's education and development, they identified more complex intersections: one example included a Black middle-class parent seeking to avoid their child being affected by stereotypes about underachievement by Black boys; and another involved a parent who identified both himself and his wife as having a working-class background, and to each be the first in the family to go to university.

145. This diversity of attitudes within the middle-class family experience is echoed by Bull's work looking at young people participating in classical music ensembles. She identifies three clear groups within her sample who might all be termed 'middle-class', but for whom particular family history (e.g. parental education and occupation, their 'length of tenure in the middle class') means that different experiences and motivations can be seen (Bull, 2018: 83). Interestingly, these extend to things like instrument choice with – for example – those in the 'new' middle classes being most likely to play brass instruments.
146. Irwin and Elley also examined the views and approaches of working-class parents. They note that, whilst working-class parents also felt that education was very important and saw themselves as having a role in influencing their children's future, they demonstrated less confidence than was the case with middle-class parents and sometimes 'less faith in education as a route to success' (Irwin and Elley, 2011: 491-2).
147. Moore, in her study of undergraduate students in higher music education (not exclusively 'classical music') in Ireland, explored the musical backgrounds of students and the relationship between this and their higher education experience. The study included students with a strong background in Irish traditional music and popular music, as well as western classical music. She highlights the role of students' parents in passing on particular music traditions, supporting students in their knowledge of things like college admissions and providing other kinds of support and encouragement (Moore, 2012: 72). One self-taught student found the theoretical elements of the course (based in Western classical music) very difficult, and a second student whose background was in Irish traditional music also reported challenges in engaging with music theory in the form in which it was being taught, and in relating it to their own musical experience. Both students had parents who were musical, but in self-taught or Irish traditional music. Moore highlights the self-doubt and anxiety which this experience engendered in students, and concludes that:

'Students whose musical habitus differ from the dominant ideologies at play in higher education, can be disadvantaged in regard to a perceived lack of relevant cultural capital.' (Moore, 2012: 76).^{xix}

148. DeLorenzo, in her review of literature on race, socio-economic factors, urban teaching and classical music in the US, identifies a number of structural barriers to poorer Black and Latino students gaining and engaging with music education opportunities, and also identifies other influencing factors such as the absence of other Black or Latino faces in the school orchestra, questions of cultural identity and the relationship towards a 'Eurocentric ensembles in terms of the music literature performed'. DeLorenzo maps a range of literature and reports some

anecdotal experiences of her own students, which highlight the absence of teachers of a similar ethnicity and/or gender to some groups of students (DeLorenzo, 2012: 42).

149. This question of representation in teaching roles or in other spaces where role models might be sought is raised in personal testimony and independent research from Beth Higham-Edwards (2019), a young female professional percussionist who undertook some independent research looking at conservatoire staff and orchestral musicians in the UK. She found only one female percussion teacher in the London conservatoires. Overall 10% of percussion posts in conservatoires in the UK were held by women (though sometimes the same woman held more than one post). She also found that only 8% of percussionists with orchestras were female. Higham-Edwards reflects upon the absence of women in percussion in the training and professional environments: the number of female teachers was disproportionately small in comparison with female students, though female students of percussion were also in the minority. She reported not meeting in person a female percussionist who was more advanced – in career terms – than she was. All the more senior roles were held by men, and her experience was that some of those musicians were actively discouraging towards women.
150. Bogdanovic's qualitative study of staff in HE music departments also notes the absence of senior role models for women (2015). She finds that those working in HE music recognise a gender imbalance across the industry, canon and within HE. Reflecting particularly upon HE structures, the relationship between gender and prestige – hiring committees which are predominantly male, issues of confidence in seeking progression and promotion – is apparent in the focus group material, as is a recognition of the male dominance in areas like conducting and composing. Importantly, Bogdanovic adds another HE-specific element to our understanding of prestige: the dominance of male academics, and female support staff; or the perceptions of 'masculine research and feminine teaching and learning'; and the balance of males in senior roles and females in junior roles (2015: 10).
151. Mantie and Tucker's study of musicians' participation in education and community-based ensembles examines questions of cultural background and musical preferences, and provides some valuable self-reflection about assumptions which educationalists might make. Their pre-study assumption – that students of particular cultural heritage would be listening to and interested in the traditional music of that culture – was proved incorrect, and stemmed from pedagogical practices and positions (which they both held, as working music educationalists) that demonstrate both 'cultural insensitivity and cultural essentializing', expecting that ensemble participants should either reflect the values of the educationalist or conform to some kind of neat, cultural other, reflecting an alternative tradition in an acceptable way (Mantie and Tucker, 2012: 262-263).
152. More widely, as a result of their study, Mantie and Tucker problematise the monocultural music education in (in their examples) Canadian schools, which focuses on the Western culture and canon with a particular emphasis on the 'choir-orchestra-band (COB) paradigm', and examine this challenge in teaching assumptions. On the one hand, they reflect upon their own assumptions that underrepresented students might prefer "their music" – and therefore, that they may end up being excluded from this paradigm because of these assumptions. On the other hand, Mantie and Tucker recognise the exclusionary nature of offering no other alternative to the current monocultural offering.
153. There is relatively little work at the moment which connects consumption and production of classical music, though surveys like Youth Music and Ipsos Mori (2019) begin to connect taste

and activities, and studies like Mantie and Tucker attempt to draw connections between musical choices ‘at home’ and activities outside the home. Bull and Scharff (2017) also suggest that there are elements of the classical music system which operate in a similar way upon consumption and production. For example, cultural institutions create ‘strongly codified practices’ which apply to both performers and audiences, with experience of each reinforcing experience of the other. Amongst these they include: ‘being comfortable in grand spaces’; the practices of live classical performances (e.g. clapping in the right place, sitting still and listening); and required dress for performers, which still tends to be relatively similar in its formality (Bull and Scharff, 2017: 292-293).

154. When Bull and Scharff’s study participants reflected upon classical music as opposed to other kinds of music, the idea of ‘depth’ – classical music being more ‘serious’ and ‘important’ – was important, and suggested that the primary driver for consumption was not enjoyment. Other material indicated that participants were involved in practices which sought to elevate the value of classical music above other kinds of music; however, participants also demonstrated awareness of the ‘complex moral politics’ of making judgements about different kinds of music and taste in music. Despite this, some of Bull’s study participants did reflect upon their unfamiliarity with genres like rap music, with the suggestion that they did not understand it; Bull and Scharff remind us that there is a significant ‘distance in social space’ between these study participants and the young people who are likely to listen to rap (Bull and Scharff, 2017: 294).
155. Bull and Scharff’s work also reveals some interesting findings about the ways in which different characteristics intersection in the choices young people made. The young middle-class and upper-middle class men in Bull’s study chose to pursue professional careers outside music, with higher earning potential and status, where the young women from a similar class background were more likely to indicate that they wanted to pursue a career in classical music, and to link that choice to a passion for playing (Bull and Scharff, 2017: 291-2). Yoshihara similarly found some gender differences where young musicians were encouraged by parents to go on to study music at University or a conservatory, in order to pursue a career and identifies a cultural expectation amongst middle and upper-middle class families in East Asia that male children (particularly eldest sons) should:

‘...be successful and to carry on the family name, tradition, and wealth. They define success usually in terms of a professional career in such fields as medicine and law or employment in a prestigious corporation or a government office. Many regard the pursuit of the arts as unmanly and socially unrespectable, and unless one comes from a family of professional musicians, there is usually little understanding of what a musical career entails. Such gendered and classed notions of the music profession are shared widely not only in East Asia but also in Asian American communities as well.’ (Yoshihara, 2008: 104).

Music and meaning

156. Green’s book on music, gender and education provides a historical analysis of how gender and music interact. For example, she identifies sources which indicate a high presence of girls and women in formal educational structures in the late 19th century: in 1890 90% of ABRSM candidates were girls, and most students at the conservatoires were women, most of whom went on to become teachers (1997: 60). Green demonstrates that female singers who engage in particular modes or approaches to display are more acceptable than others, because they reinforce particular norms of gender construction (e.g. Green, 1997: 46; and echoed in Bain,

2019: 28). Similarly, women engaging in a range of roles which Green terms 'enabling', for example running musical salons or music teaching, are also reproducing a kind of femininity which conforms to societal norms. Women who were instrumentalists demonstrated a greater 'interruption' of these norms of femininity, and those engaging in autonomous creativity – composing or improvising – posed the most threat to those norms, particularly because the activities foreground the mind (rather than the body) of the practitioner (Green, 1997: 113). Green argues that these 'delineated meanings' – in which things like constructs of gender (both male and female) are included – affect those who play, those who listen and those who compose music. The core of her proposition is that:

'...because of the power of delineations to overcome our experience of musical inherent meanings, these gendered delineations tend to appear as if they were an essential part of the very musical notes themselves.' (Green, 1997: 140).

157. Green also suggests that these constructed meanings filter down through structures such as education systems. Her survey of teachers shows, for example, that the majority of teachers felt that girls were more successful at singing than boys. This was also felt to be true for instrumentalists, with more girls thought to be 'more active' playing instruments than boys. In addition, teachers reported girls as being particularly prevalent in playing the flute and the violin. When asked to consider how girls and boys approached composition, Green finds that:

'Teachers view the compositional abilities and attitudes of girls as conformist, conservative and wanting in those attributes of autonomy and creativity which are definitive aspects of the construction of genius as a male prerogative... Boys, on the other hand, are understood to be inventive and creative, their possession of these traits being proven by the very perception of their anti-conformity and reluctance to work hard.' (Green, 1997: 228).^{xx}

158. Bogdanovic (2015), talking with staff in music departments in HE, also reflects upon instrument choice, and the experiences of female staff coming into teaching teams which are predominantly male. In both instances, female study participants reflect upon feeling the need to imitate or replicate particular elements of their male colleagues' behaviour and language. Bogdanovic's study participants also reflect upon the gendered behaviour of students, whom staff identify as both replicating gendered choices but also sometimes reluctant to acknowledge any gender issues (2015, 12-13).
159. Scharff also notes (with a range of useful sources, connecting this work on classical music to a wider academic critical discourse on gender and creative labour) the way in which 'prevailing notions of creativity are gendered', with the artist and roles with significant artistic and creative elements being male (2018: 97). McCormick similarly examines the way in which music competitions, often framed as kinds of 'physical contest' reinforce notions of virtuoso performance 'to be interpreted as a display of masculinity' (McCormick, 2009: 18), and points to particular examples of female winners being praised for, and acknowledging, their masculine performance style, whilst also being recognised for a particular kind of conventional femininity (for example, dressing 'appropriately').
160. McCormick is also able to trace the changes in the demographic characteristics of music competitions, looking at an example of a piano competition in the US and noting initially a gender imbalance which changes over time and latterly a significant contingent of Asian^{xxi} (by birth or descent) pianists, many of whom accounted for the rise in female pianists also. In her book, McCormick examines more extensively the way in which the narratives which are

constructed around competitors – including the competitor/artist as ‘athlete’, ‘hero’, ‘artist’, ‘prodigy’, ‘virtuoso’ and so forth – intersect with characteristics like gender and race, and with notions of cultural traditions and origin. Her focus on the competition as a ritual enables McCormick to place things like concert dress alongside body language, stage presence, programme biography, repertoire choice as well as other key elements of the way in which the competition is constructed and individual performers present themselves and engage with the judges, critics and the public (McCormick, 2015).

161. Bull’s study of young people in music ensembles in South East England also includes some consideration of how positions of authority – such as being a conductor – are established, and the way in which gender intersects with these constructions. All the conductors in her study are male, and she explores the various ways in which authority was established, predominantly through consensual approaches but ‘with the coercive possibility of humiliation ever present’ (Bull, 2016b: 867). She identifies various facets of this: the idea of ‘charisma’ is important, with authority being communicated and established through a range of performative actions including the conductor’s ‘physicality, his voice, his gestures, his stance, and his gaze’ (ibid). Bull’s observational and interview data suggests that these constructions are gendered, and reinforce perceptions from female musicians that conducting was not for them. Bull’s later book, based on the same study of young people in music education ensembles, goes further in its analysis of gender differences to suggest that:

‘Finally, as well as classical music reproducing middle-class gender roles, these gendered pathways are necessary to reproduce classical music as a tradition. In my study, women were more likely to take on the unpaid, voluntary administrative labour that allows the exams, concerts, youth orchestra rehearsals, and other everyday practices of classical music to function. This labour in turn supports men to continue in positions of prestige and authority.’ (Bull, 2019: 183).

162. In Bull’s study of young people playing in classical music ensembles, she develops a typology of future aspirations, grouping the young people in several categories and identifying two particular groups who indicate that they are keen to pursue music as a career. The first of these groups comes from the professional or upper middle-classes, is exclusively male and aspires to hold a ‘position of power or prestige’ in the music profession. The second is from the professional or new middle-classes, and in pursuing a music career does ‘not expect high status or rewards’ (Bull, 2018: 84).^{xxiii} Her study explores this intersection of class and gender in the development of aspirations towards and expectations of prestige in classical music. On the one hand, it appears that for those young people coming from professional middle-class families, young women (rather than men) were more likely to pursue a career in classical music, fulfilling a ‘respectable’ form of middle-class identity. On the other hand, those young people who demonstrated a real drive for positions of leadership and prestige in classical music were men (Bull, 2018).
163. Every one of the new middle-class and working-class participants in Bull’s study, for whom engagement in music required ‘a heavy investment, socially, materially, and emotionally’, wished to pursue a career in classical music. Bull suggests that this may indicate a disruption of Bourdieu’s model of capital, reflecting instead the ‘role of pleasure and fulfilment in classical music’, though she also notes the ways in which particular choices (e.g. young women singers, seeking to pursue a career in opera) were also reinforcing existing gender and class norms (Bull, 2018: 89).

164. Within these critiques of classical music, gender and class, there is a central charge which is being made against classical music: earlier it was noted that Green's argument that we are unable to separate 'inherent' musical meaning from the 'delineated' meanings which relate to social constructions of gender. Green goes on to note that this is a specific problem for female musicians:

'The gender of a female performer in many contexts, and of a female composer in most contexts, unlike the gender of the male musician, becomes an object of interest, an overt and often problematic, part of the musical meanings themselves'. (Green, 1997: 138).

165. Bull makes a similar argument to Green, in suggesting that musical meaning is not free from social constructs. She suggests that this entanglement relates to all aspects of musical practice, and is 'embodied' within it: that musical practices take on and reflect gender norms, and that the middle-class setting in which the young people are making music underwrites a conformity to these norms, and (for example) a disinclination to challenge anything in a conductor's authority which the young people did not feel comfortable with. Although the study participants thought they were engaging in a process of making choices and enacting personal agency, Bull's analysis suggests that the structures and practices of authority in these ensembles mean that this is not really the case. In the context of this literature review, what is particularly important to acknowledge is that Bull is suggesting that the act of music-making – embodied through the physical and emotional responses of musicians and singers – is bound up with these power dynamics (Bull, 2016b).

166. Bull (2019) very directly problematises the notion of music as a space or site in which autonomy from social structures may be enabled, or which may operate as critical vehicles against social norms. Instead, she argues that an examination of the practices of classical music – rather than its abstract or philosophical potential – reveals what Bull describes as 'a more complex, contingent connection between music and the social' (2019: xxvi). Bull goes on to examine these connections, and in conclusion outlines four different 'articulations' (after Stuart Hall) that she has identified within the musical practices which have been observed through her study of young people.

167. In brief these are: first, the 'social organization' of classical music, with established roles of teacher authority, the place of the musical canon and boundaries which are drawn around or elevate particular repertoire above others, the requirements for particular instruments for particular pieces; second, the 'reliance on historical and contemporary modes of embodiment', with 'modes' like 'controlled excitement', formulations such as the 'respectable' female and specific relationships between those in authority (e.g. conductors) and those being directed, with associated expectations of openness and trust; third, the 'imaginative dimension of bourgeois selfhood', in which things like ensembles create imaginary 'ideal' communities – Bull identifies particularly 'the orchestra as a bourgeois fantasy of male control'; and fourth, 'the aesthetic of "getting it right"', which places emphasis on virtues such as 'precision and detail', and often elevates ideas of faithfulness (e.g. to a composer's intentions) (Bull, 2019: 175-179).

168. In offering these 'articulations' as a critical analysis of the relationships between musical practice and social structures and attitudes, Bull is aware of the challenge for those significantly engaged with classical music in acknowledging this critique:

'...this intertwining of the social and the aesthetic also makes it difficult to talk about inequalities because critical discussion is often perceived as an attack on the 'music

itself’—the very thing that is meaningful and special to participants, and that is deeply formative of their very selves...But unless we are critical of the patterns of inclusion and exclusion that are formed through the practices that are required by classical music’s aesthetic and the modes of social organization that are written into the scores of its canonic repertoire, this closed world cannot be opened up to a wider range of people.’ (Bull, 2019: 180).

169. Yoshihara, in her study of Asian and Asian American musicians^{xxiii} provides a similar critique, problematising the defence of classical music as having a value which is ‘universal’ (i.e. transcending different experiences or contexts). She points out that notion of ‘universality’ only goes one way: Asian and Asian American musicians are often perceived or framed as being unable to ‘relate to’ (and therefore perform for or relate to an audience), the ‘essential’ Westernness of classical music (2007: 5). Scharff’s study of female musicians based in London and Berlin echoes this dualism of, on the one hand, denying differences, and, on the other, insisting upon them. What is at first striking is the way in which study participants sought to avoid acknowledging the issue:

‘...the majority of research participants disavowed racial inequalities in the classical music profession. While some participants openly discussed the lack of racial diversity among musicians, most interviewees disarticulated racial inequalities.’ (Scharff, 2018: 105).

170. Scharff goes on to explain that three participants from a Black and minority ethnic background ‘denied having experienced any form of discrimination personally’ and that seven white participants suggested that the classical music scene was inclusive, using terms like “‘international”” and “‘melting pot”” (Scharff, 2018: 105). Yoshihara identifies Asian and Asian American musicians engaging in a similar kind of formulation when talking about their identity, constructing an idea of being an artist or a musician as a non-national or ethnically specific – indeed, as a way to be part of a community which can ignore nationality and ethnicity (Yoshihara, 2007: 62-3).
171. Despite these denials of difference, Scharff notes that ‘white privilege remains unacknowledged’, and goes on to identify that participants did exhibit judgements which included ‘implicit, racial hierarchies’ when talking about East Asian players as demonstrating technical excellence as the expense of musicality and emotional connection (ibid). Two study participants (one East Asian by origin, and the other European) described female East Asian students coming to Europe to learn how to express themselves emotionally, as their technical capacities were already in place. Another mixed-race musician identified experiencing both the assumption that she and her family would not know about classical music, because of the difference in cultural background, and the way elements of her personal style in playing were attributed to her ethnic origin (Scharff, 2018: 107).
172. Yang notes similar assumptions to those Scharff highlights, regarding the abilities of Asian and Asian American musicians as demonstrating technical capacities, but musical deficiencies (Yang, 2014: 99). She frames this central problem in a similar way to Yoshihara (2007):

‘Yet even as the roster of prominent Asian musicians steadily grows, sociopolitical factors conspire to maintain “universalist,” that is, Europeanist, discourses of classical music, thus rendering Asian participation in this cultural practice unnatural or less than salutary.’ (Yang, 2014: 84).

173. Looking at data focused on the San Francisco area, Yang demonstrates that whilst Asian and Asian American students are very prominent in their participation in music education and key prestigious education ensembles, this 'overrepresentation' is reversed as the data is examined through to faculty membership at university and conservatory level, to some extent in orchestral membership and at the most visible level in conductors/artistic directorships. Yoshihara (2007) notes similar attrition between conservatory intake in the US of Asian and Asian American students, and representation in orchestras, on boards and elsewhere. Despite this, Yoshihara reminds us that musicians are not the only contribution from East Asia to the way in which Western classical music is practiced and organised; the manufacture of pianos (Yamaha) and the development and export of an internationally recognised and practiced pedagogical methodology (Suzuki) are all now part of this interaction (2007).
174. Later in the same book Yang examines constructions of race further, particularly in the intersection between race and gender; her example is the significant focus by critics and commentators on the dress and presentation of female Asian musicians. She identifies particularly a kind of double prejudice: allusions to an apparent production line for young, often female Asian musicians as a potential risk to the integrity of classical music, with the possibilities that Asian musicians might overrun the presence of European/other Causcasian musicians, and in their marketability (and particularly in any perceived display of sexuality) cheapen or undermine the art form (Yang, 2014: 133-142). Yoshihara also discusses the way in which female musicians 'have to navigate the sexual economy which shapes the profession' (2007: 109) and she notes, amongst other things, repeated patterns of older white men (sometimes in roles such as faculty members at conservatory, or senior teaching roles) dating young Asian women musicians.
175. Scharff's study also includes some examples where race and language intersect with gender to reinforce or make more complex issues around self-promotion (e.g. in the case of one interviewee whose cultural background particularly encouraged modesty) (2015a: 12). Yoshihara identifies similar issues for female Asian and Asian American musicians, coming from a background where being encouraged and taught to be 'polite' was likened by one subject in her study to being almost 'submissive' (2007: 112). Yoshihara's study participants also reflected on the way in which East Asian culture placed a particular type of emphasis on the presentational value of female musicians, reinforcing gender stereotypes within a specific ethno-cultural lens (2007: 115-116).
176. Where Green (and others) have theorised the relationship between gender and music, Joseph Straus has taken on a similar approach connecting a theoretical framework from disability studies – one which recognises disability as a social and cultural construction – to an analysis of classical music, with a focus on predominantly historic, but some living, figures and particularly composers. In the introduction, he reflects upon the instability of the category 'disabled', an idea which has changed and is constructed differently over time, but places this alongside our understanding of other unstable socially and culturally constructed categories (gender and race). He suggests (as Bull, 2019, does, in relation to her articulations of class and classical music) that despite the contingency and instability of the categorisation, an insistence upon 'coherence of disability as a category' will allow the relationship between music and disability to be revealed, so that we can see that:

'Music (which includes its composers, performers, listeners, critical traditions, and exemplary works) both reflects and constructs disability.' (Straus, 2011: 14).

The book examines a range of examples of composers, looking at the critical reception of their work and the way in which different narratives of disability are included in this reception.

177. Straus goes on to frame four particular narratives which are strongly associated with different composers (e.g. Beethoven and the narrative of 'disability overcome'). He then explores the relationship between music theory and disability, with the premise that the metaphor of a musical work as a body 'and thus susceptible to disability' (2011: 105) is key to 'much traditional music theory'. He goes on to explore how ideas of the 'normal' and 'abnormal' (particularly in Modern music) in musical works are constructed, explained and made problematic or somehow normalised through narratives which are similar to those he has already explored. Straus's later book, *Broken Beauty* (2018) takes this analysis of musical theory and the production of and response to Modernist music to suggest that a central concern of Modernist music is 'the representation of disabled bodies', and to propose some possibilities for a 'disablist' music theory.
178. In a chapter on musical performers Straus suggests that it is not just that the reception of performers that is framed by the kinds of narratives which he has already outlined in relation to composers, but that the musicians are engaged in performing disability in line with these 'well established cultural scripts'. He emphasises some of the dynamics which are particularly relevant to music, where musicians are already beings demonstrating 'extraordinary bodies', and thus the presence of a physical and perhaps very visible disability may combine to constitute the framing of a musical performance in the context of a 'freak show' (Straus, 2011: 125-6). Audiences come not only to see the musician perform music, but also to perform their disability – this is the result of the normative social and cultural construction of disability.

3.3 Initiatives to diversify the workforce

179. This review does not touch upon the range of music education initiatives in the UK (or elsewhere) which seek to address questions of representation and equality of opportunity for children and young people; to do so would be a significant and separate job of work outside the scope of this study, but would also find that the majority of interventions cannot or do not relate their activities to the potential future employment of their participants in the classical music sector. Much of the material available which covers this kind of work focuses on limited-term interventions, and is not able to identify whether younger people continue to play in the longer-term.
180. There are some substantial projects, including the In Harmony project (funded by Arts Council England and the Department for Education), which is the subject of prolonged policy interest and investment, and organisations like Orchestras for All, Music Masters (formerly London Music Masters) and the OHMI (One-Handed Musical Instrument) Trust which have all undertaken specific work to support access to music education from groups which may not otherwise have that opportunity. Whilst these interventions exist, their annual reports and other published material do not currently provide any longitudinal insights into the training and employment destinations of their participants.
181. Amongst the music initiatives which take place there is evidence of activities working beyond ensuring 'first access' opportunities for children and young people. Orchestras for All has a

programme which, alongside support for music teachers, runs a national ensemble for young people (the National Orchestra for All) which specifically targets participants who face ‘complex barriers to making music together’; the young people are identified and nominated by ‘teachers, music leaders, social workers and charity partners’ (Orchestras for All, no date). The OHMI Trust ran a teaching pilot which explored the needs of learners and teachers in instrumental teaching for children with physical disabilities, and identified a range of practical learning about what worked and could be sustained in the future (Fautley and Kinsella, 2017). Some of these initiatives are not without critics; for example Bull (2016a) connects In Harmony to a set of class and gender norms, and suggests that, rather than erasing inequality, it may be at risk of reinforcing existing hierarchies.

182. One study which does examine the reasons for young people continuing, or not continuing, their musical practice is Hallam and Burns’ (2018) examination of the England-based In Harmony programme which takes some of its approach from the El Sistema programme which has operated in Venezuela since 1975. At its core is ensemble teaching and playing for children, with a focus on disadvantaged communities, and much of the initial focus was on primary schools. The individual projects are geographically focused, and some have operated continuously for more than ten years.
183. Hallam and Burns specifically looked at questions of musical progression, particularly for children and young people who had taken part, or were taking part, in an In Harmony project, and who were moving from primary to secondary schools, and examined pilot activities undertaken across the In Harmony projects to enable musical progression amongst participants. Both the research and the pilot activity are particularly interesting due to the relative absence of work which we have been able to find (particularly in a UK context) which looks not at ‘first access’ but at issues around the barriers or issues to continuation that might exist for those children and young people who are already engaging in music education activity.
184. Their report suggests some crucial factors: the role of the family in supporting ‘successful progression’ is seen as key, including ‘sibling support and modelling’ as well as a good relationship/connection between school and home. Barriers include ‘complex and challenging home circumstances’ (Hallam and Burns, 2018: 3-4). Other issues range from the practical – travel, costs, location – through to social issues. The authors identify that young people who engage in out of school activity early develop their independence through taking part. However, it is also clear that some of the young people which the research engaged with were not in a position to control the circumstances which might support or inhibit their progression.
185. Looking at initiatives which specifically seek to diversify the workforce, the most substantial study identified for this literature review is one of fellowship programmes for musicians from minority racial and ethnic backgrounds in US orchestras. The study was undertaken under the aegis of the League of American Orchestras, and looks at 40 years of fellowships, beginning with a programme established in 1976 by the Music Assistance Fund (MAF) to support young African American musicians. From a UK perspective (where the existence of a similar focus on racial diversity and a particular intervention methodology has not been in evidence), it is worth noting that the study suggests that:

‘Fellowship programs have since become the orchestras’ principal vehicle for addressing racial homogeneity of their players’ (League of American Orchestras, Rabkin and Hairston O’Connell, 2016: 6).

186. The study chose to focus upon programmes which targeted young musicians who had completed, or nearly completed, their formal music education, and which involved the fellows in the day-to-day of orchestral practice for an extended period of time, paid those young musicians and were intended to support them to compete successfully for positions in orchestras. In doing so, they identified 11 programmes over the 40-year period and included fellowships across 23 orchestras. There was evidence of some programmes which had been run previously, but about which no documentation seemed to exist. The study identifies three main models for fellowship programmes: programmes with multiple orchestral partners (though a fellow might only be placed with one orchestra); programmes run by a single orchestra; and programmes run in partnership between orchestras and conservatoires. Whilst information on the costs of the programmes was minimal, the report is able to usefully reflect upon the different elements and approaches used in different programmes.
187. The study sought to investigate the career pathways of fellows post-fellowship, and identified that 41% of those they could identify data for were playing in orchestras, and 17% were playing as soloists, freelancing or deputising with orchestras. A further 17% were teaching at some level. A handful of others played chamber music or had other musical jobs. Some also worked in orchestral administration, were activists, entrepreneurs, teachers and undertook a range of other activities. Only 5 (of 94) did not have careers in professional music. All the fellows thought that the fellowship experience had been beneficial to, and supportive of, their careers, and did not necessarily see orchestral membership as the ultimate success marker of a fellowship.
188. The work by League of American Orchestras, Rabkin and Hairston O'Connell, also examined the fellows' own experiences. They report that these experiences are complex, 'sometimes internally contradictory', providing young musicians with both a sense of support and opportunity, but also discomfort at being 'singled out' due to their background. The attitudes of musicians in the hosting orchestras were mixed towards fellows, and there were some suggestions that these initiatives were supported by management, but not necessarily by the players; several fellows reported orchestral members assuming the worst of them. Section leaders seem to have been key in setting the tone for a good or poor experience. Longer fellowships also gave both the fellow and orchestral players time to settle in and find 'common ground'.
189. In some instances, orchestras reported a tension between the orchestral management, who had put a fellowship programme in place, and orchestral players. This appeared in at least one case to focus on the musical standards of the orchestra, and the idea that if fellows were to perform alongside the rest of the orchestra, they needed to be at a requisite standard (that of any other typical substitute player). This led to challenges in recruiting fellows who had recently completed their conservatoire training – fellows were not yet able to reach these standards so recruitment failed and the programme was discontinued (League of American Orchestras et al, 2016: 23). More generally, the report finds challenges within orchestral settings where the value of diversity is not universally accepted or defined, and where there is limited or no clarity about the relationship between the orchestra's strategy and what workers on the ground experience, particularly where programmes like this were being implemented in a 'top down' way.
190. Despite this, fellows reported 'positive professional and artistic gains' (2016: 15). Learning did not just extend to their playing, but also to the insight into professional life – the workload and processes for preparing both mentally and physically. Fellows reported developing networks of connections and raising their own profile. Fellows who were interviewed in this study also talked about the challenges of visibility and being seen as different:

“Black classical musicians are well versed as being the only black person in the room. That’s really core to your identity.” (League of American Orchestras, Rabkin and Hairston O’Connell, 2016: 16).

Some fellows also reflected upon being asked to take part in engagement and outreach programmes, and sometimes felt suspicious of the possible motives – being included as a very visible indicator of potential diversity – and of the ways in which this might let orchestral staff and members off the hook in terms of really building relationships with nearby communities who might not often come through the doors of a concert hall.

191. In spite of this, this difference was seen by some fellows as a ‘source of strength and a site of potential for the orchestra’, and for some there was a particular cultural background or experience they could bring to bear which resonated either with particular music, or more broadly with a kind of moral imperative in order for orchestral music to continue to be relevant. It was also noted that an orchestra with a high proportion of musicians from underrepresented racial and ethnic groups was reported by fellows to be ‘particularly warm, supportive and friendly’.
192. At the level of the individual orchestras, there is no evidence that those orchestras which ran or run fellowship programmes now have a more diverse workforce than those who did not. The study does not include any data about changes in the diversity of individual orchestras. The report does go on to discuss in broader terms the motivations of different kinds of interventions, and the way in which experts interviewed as part of the study saw these relationships. This allows the report to pose some meaningful questions, such as: if the orchestra reflects its community, will its audiences follow suit? The report was also able to consider questions of scale and indicated that there were some programmes seeking to grow and build the critical mass of fellows. Overall, the report concludes that:

‘...fellowships do not change the fundamentals of the pipeline problem. They are not, in and of themselves, a solution to the persistent racial homogeneity of orchestras. But fellowships clearly make a contribution.’ (League of American Orchestras, et al. 2016: 28)

The report ends by suggesting that a paradigm shift is required in these fellowship programmes, so that orchestras ‘should be accountable for fellows’ success’ and that the notion of ‘success’ is not just about the fellow, but the orchestra also. What the report identifies is a looseness of hypothesis and accountability – fellowship programmes are set-up in hope of benefiting both sides, but without any detailed proposition, or will to be accountable for its success or failure.

193. In the US, the Sphinx Organization works to:

‘...form a pipeline that develops and supports diversity and inclusion in classical music at every level’ (The Sphinx Organization, 2020).

The current Sphinx programme includes support from education and training through to audition support, mentorships, a series of professional ensembles and soloist support programmes, and work to support arts leadership. Many of the individual programmes focus on Black and Latinx musicians and/or musicians of colour. The programme was founded in 1997 by Aaron P. Dworkin, at the time a young musician and graduate student (DeFord, 2008), and is the current chief executive officer is Afa Dworkin, his wife. The Sphinx Organization’s 20-year impact report

identifies, amongst other outputs, 10 professional soloists and 27 member musicians of professional orchestras. Looking at the broader context, it also identifies an increase in the proportion of Black and Latinx musicians in American orchestras, from 2.7% to 4.3% (Sphinx Organization, no date).

194. Some of the work undertaken by the Sphinx Organization involves wider partnerships, such as the National Alliance for Audition Support which involves the New World Symphony (a kind of orchestral ‘training’ programme for graduate musicians) and the League of American Orchestras (a membership body for US orchestras and related organisations and groups). A recent impact report identifies Black and Latinx musicians winning auditions and placements with orchestras and ensembles in the US, and reports programme participants finding the range of support (e.g. intensive support, substitute musician grants, instrument grants) almost universally very or extremely helpful (National Alliance for Audition Support, no date). Feedback from participants highlights, amongst other things, the practical and emotional challenges of engaging in applications and auditions in a competitive environment, and the importance of a range of support, from the financial through to encouragement and notice from significant figures in the classical music industry.
195. Looking at the work of the Sphinx Organizations and its partners in this area, and reflecting upon the comparison with the UK context, what is immediately notable is the degree of structured, long-term organisation and commitment to a range of activities which attempt to address the hypothesis of a ‘leaky pipeline’, by intervening at several key points in the training and career progression of musicians.
196. In a UK context, the Bournemouth Symphony Orchestra (BSO) ran a project in 2017-2018 (funded through Arts Council England’s Change Makers initiative) whose aim was to respond to the under-representation of disabled people in the arts workforce, and involved a training placement for an artist with disabilities, the development of a disabled-led ensemble and a range of ‘organisational change activities’, including training for all BSO staff. The external evaluation report identifies positive outcomes, as well as further work to be undertaken, but also importantly identifies some of the factors which were key in enabling the project to be meaningful. These include leadership within the organisation, and a commitment to the programme across all areas of the organisation, which together seem to confirm the other side to the negative findings relating to poor leadership and cross-organisational commitment of the US study on fellowships (League of American Orchestras et al, 2016).
197. Key to the conception and application of the project has been the adoption and application of the social model of disability. James Rose, the conductor who won the training placement, reported a range of beneficial experiences and outcomes in terms of his development – but the evaluation also acknowledges the relatively short period of the placement (18 months) and the intensity of the experience. The ensemble which was set up as part of the programme is now established as an ongoing part of the BSO’s activities, and its performances have opened up engagement with audiences, some of which has been positive and some of which has exhibited challenging and complex questions around the perceptions of ‘standards’ and perceptions of music and disability. Lastly, there is a sense that the BSO is helping to bring some of these challenges and approaches to the wider sector (Sound Connections, 2018).
198. Finally, elsewhere this review has discussed the study by Fulford et al (2011) on musicians with hearing impairments; the article connects to a wider study which explored how vibrotactile technology might facilitate music making for those with hearing impairments. Alongside the

experiences of the BSO Change Makers, the recommendations made in the Universal Music report (n.d.) on neurodiversity and the Taking it home Consortium's work on Disabled musicians (Youth Music, 2020), this indicates a small cluster of work which has actively explored approaches to support different groups to take part in the classical music workforce.

4 Conclusions

4.1 The current state of knowledge

199. This literature review has looked at a range of sources which help us to gain a picture of who gets to train for and work in the classical music industry. It has included material which provides a sense of how diversity in classical music is experienced and articulated (by minority and majority demographic groups), and also reflects upon studies which look at the relationships between the way classical music operates and how identity and meaning are constructed. Much of the material which has been included here was written in the last five or six years; whilst there are gaps where more research could be undertaken, there is also a contemporary knowledge and research community and a range of industry-focused stakeholders who have recently contributed to our understanding in this area.
200. Whilst there is now a body of material which addresses the relationship between gender/sex and classical music, other areas of diversity are less well explored. In the UK there appears to have been limited attention paid to ethnicity, though recent work has begun to demonstrate a focus on class. Work on disability and long-term health conditions is limited, though there are also connections to work on illness and injury which have felt meaningful to include in this review. Other protected characteristics, including age, have not received significant notice in the material which was discovered through this review.
201. Data on representation in younger participants, people training for work and in the workforce suggests several inequalities: an absence of musicians from lower socio-economic groups, little ethnic diversity (and where it exists, it is amongst specific groups), and an absence and perhaps an underreporting of musicians with disabilities or long-term health conditions. Women are present in the workforce, and their prevalence in key employment groups like the orchestral workforce has grown. Despite this, it appears that attrition occurs at some stages between young instrumentalists, entry to higher education and entry into particular parts of the workforce. Women are poorly represented in high profile artistic leadership roles, including conducting, principal roles in orchestras and in the more prestigious sections of the teaching workforce.
202. There is also data which suggests some segregation begins very early, particularly in the patterns of instrument choice – again, the data here is clearest and most plentiful when looking at the relationship between classical music and gender/sex. Supporting this quantitative data is a growing body of qualitative material, with a strong theoretical framework, which reveals some of the ways in which classical music connects with and reinforces with socially constructed identities and norms. There is evidence of the particular influence of families and their familiarity (or not) with classical music, as well as the importance of role models.
203. There is limited material which maps the careers of those working in classical music, and what is available does not always explore the relationship between demography and practice. This literature review has included some material which does not consider demography, because the

wider literature which does touch on working practices and demography suggests that these working practices are important factors in the opportunities and choices which are available to those who work in the sector. Work on career pathways is limited, but important in recognising that we want to know not only who gains access to the broad umbrella of the classical music workforce, but also what they do – and what changes – once they succeed. Work from Bennett (2005 and 2008) and Bennett and Hannekam (2018) helps to map the way that musicians see the work that they do, what values are placed on different types of work and how their decision-making and opportunities change over time.

204. Notable in the literature is the combination of the evidence of barriers and problems – such as precarious working conditions, racial stereotyping, gendered critiques, the prevalence of informal and unwritten ways of working and gaining work, experiences of illness, injury, harassment and discrimination – with the tendency for the classical music industry to deny those issues, both on an individual level and within organisations and other structures. Scharff frames this issue as a central problem: that workers in classical music tend to deny the structural factors which they experience themselves, and which effect those around them (2015b, 2019). A similar analysis has emerged from other research looking at cultural work. Brook, O’Brien and Taylor’s study of the discourses of senior men working in the cultural and creative industries suggests that when they reflected upon their own careers, they ‘played down or ignored the role of structural inequalities in explaining their careers’ (2019). Like Scharff’s study participants, they ‘felt luck and chance were key explanations of their success’. Brook et al conclude that the recognition of inequalities by senior decision-makers, whilst on the increase, often occurs in rhetoric only; and that this rhetoric can seemingly serve to exempt the decision-maker from taking action (2019: 14).
205. Finally, there is a challenge from some literature to the value and meaning of classical music and its practices. Critical readings from Green (1997), Bull (2019), Straus (2011) and others suggest that the music itself cannot be defended as separate from the practices which constitute it; nor can it be separated from the way in which those practices construct and reinforce inequalities. The claim to a universal value attempts to obscure differences and inequalities which, the literature reveals, cannot be held as distinct from music itself. Both Bull (2019) and Scharff (2017) reflect upon the significant and sometimes intense pleasure which playing classical music gives the musicians in their studies; however, Bull also contests that the community which can gain access to this pleasure is an ‘exclusionary’ one.

4.2 What are the gaps?

206. This review has already outlined where some types of diversity which have been a focus, and areas which have gained less notice and/or (it may be supposed) are harder to develop meaningful data for. The work which Oman (2019) has been undertaking with Arts Council England on developing metrics for collecting data about the socio-economic status of the workforce in funded cultural organisations is an example of an initiative which may help to improve our understanding in a key area. There are also some parts of the workforce which we simply know less about. There are studies about orchestras, but relatively little data about musicians whose careers includes a range of different activities – such as performance work in musical theatre, with popular music bands and artists - and musicians who may focus on non-performance activities like teaching.
207. Survey data on injury, illness, wider health and wellbeing, discrimination and harassment all suggest the presence of significant challenges and negative experiences for the workforce. The

data is valuable but has some limits in terms of providing confidence about the prevalence of these incidences and experiences across the workforce, due to potential selection bias. Similarly, the survey which has been undertaken as part of this study must be treated carefully in terms of its capacity to represent experiences across the workforce due to the nature of survey distribution and self-selection bias in responding. Recent work by Taylor (2020) with the games industry may provide useful learning about the capacities and methods required to undertake research which can meaningfully act as a kind of census (i.e. be truly representative of the workforce).

208. Beyond some greater focus in these less-well-understood areas, the literature also only begins to give us a sense of how the intersection of different demographic characteristics might reinforce inequalities. An ‘intersectional framework’ of the kind which Scharff (2015a) calls for would be a meaningful next step in understanding representation and career pathways in the workforce.
209. Elsewhere this review notes calls from researchers to examine cultural production and cultural consumption together (e.g. Oakley and O’Brien, 2015; and Bull and Scharff, 2017); evidence about the influence of families, and which suggests some subtle differences within demographic groups (e.g. the middle-classes) adds to the proposition that there is a cycle of taste, influence, support and self-actualisation which underpins the presence of many – perhaps most – in the workforce. Work on consumption already suggests that graduates are six times more likely to express an appreciation for classical music than those who have no qualifications, demonstrating a strong relationship between class and consumption of classical music (Bennett et al, 2009). There is a significant wider body of research in publication and, in some cases, taking place at the moment which examines consumption and production separately within the context of the wider cultural sector and creative industries, and which is beginning to examine data on the two together. Future research on classical music should benefit from and connect to these wider efforts.
210. In addition, work which looks more widely at activities which children and young people undertake (e.g. Donnelly et al, 2019) suggests that inequality of provision and/or take-up extends outside music and wider cultural activities into sport and other areas. Representation of different types of diversity amongst the workforce in other sectors is also unequal. A quick glance at higher education figures for the UK reveals, for example, that 41% of full-time academic staff in 2017/2018 were female (HESA, 2019). Whilst there is a job to do to understand the specific barriers and challenges within classical music, it is also important to recognise that there is a wider context of inequalities which are currently embedded from the early years of any child. Investigations into diversity in classical music may benefit from connecting to this wider context; there may be learning from other areas which have been outside the scope of this literature review, but which could be valuable.
211. There is some literature which illuminates the different stages and career pathways of those working in classical music, and which examines common working practices. At present, however, it provides a limited view of the way in which specific gateways, hurdles or stages (in careers or lives) might interact with demography to produce the current picture of representation. As it stands, we can suggest the likelihood of particular factors or motivations for the absence of particular demographic groups at particular demographic points, but the detailed evidence is lacking. In her review of evidence on race, socioeconomic factors, urban teaching and classical music in a US context, DeLorenzo states that:

‘...we do not really have much evidence about why so many students of color are absent from classical music ensembles. Are we losing students by not appealing to their cultural heritage or offering opportunities that poor students cannot afford? We can only speculate, given the small research base that we have at hand. Although we may be asking the right questions, perhaps we are not asking the right people.’ (DeLorenzo, 2012: 42).

212. This analysis seems to apply more widely: there is evidence which reveals the relationship between preferential structures/meanings and presence in the workforce; but there is, perhaps for very practical reasons, less material which examines the experiences of those who are underrepresented. Where attrition takes place in the pipeline, whether during education, training or throughout a career, there is relatively little research at present which examines why individuals drop out.
213. Alongside this need for an appreciation of the individual trajectories of training and career-span of workers in classical music, it would also be valuable to understand better the wider potential for change across the sector. Sergeant and Himonides (2019) observe that the potential long-term tenure of musicians in orchestral employment means that changes to the workforce happen ‘over a relatively extended period of time’ (p. 11). Data from higher education admissions provides a time series (covering a period of either 10 or 15 years, depending on the characteristic) over which we can see some change (Scharff, 2015b). The surveys from ABRSM (2014) and Youth Music and Ipsos Mori (2019) also use some repeated measures from previous surveys, and ABRSM have repeated their survey in 2020 (at the time of writing the report is not yet available), providing an update on our population-level understanding of instrumental learning.
214. There is work to be done to understand whether we can gauge how long it might take for the workforce to become more diverse without any particular additional intervention. In addition, we must ask whether we understand what would need to happen in order for different types of diversity to be better supported? The small number of initiatives considered in this literature review suggest some practical learning about what makes interventions feel meaningful to participants, but they are less able to be clear about whether those interventions are leading to broader change in the classical music sector.

5 Bibliography

- ABO (2014) 'Youth Ensembles Survey Report'. Available at: <http://www.abo.org.uk/championing/press/youth-ensembles-press-release-2014.aspx> (Accessed 10 December 2019)
- ABRSM (2014) 'Making Music. Teaching, learning and playing in the UK.' Available at: <https://qb.abrsm.org/media/12032/makingmusic2014.pdf> (Accessed 26 February 2020)
- Allmendinger, J. and Hackman, J. (1995) 'The More, the Better? A Four-Nation study of the Inclusion of Women in Symphony Orchestras.' *Social Forces* 74(2): 423-460
- All-Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education, ISM and University of Sussex (2019) 'Music Education: State of the Nation.' Available at: <https://www.ism.org/images/images/FINAL-State-of-the-Nation-Music-Education-for-email-or-web-2.pdf> (Accessed 26 February 2020)
- Arts Council England (2019) 'Equality, Diversity and the Creative Case. A Data Report 2017-2018'. https://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-file/Diversity_report_1718.pdf
- Araújo, L.S., Wasley, D., Redding, E., Atkins, L., Perkins, R., Ginsborg, J. and Williamon, A. (2017) 'Fit to Perform: An Investigation of Higher Education Music Students' Perceptions, Attitudes, and Behaviors towards Health', *Frontiers in Psychology* 8:1558.
- Araújo, L.S., Wasley, D., Redding, E., Atkins, L., Perkins, R., Ginsborg, J. and Williamon, A. (2020) 'Fit to Perform: A Profile of Higher Education Music Students' Physical Fitness', *Frontiers in Psychology* 11:298.
- Attitude is Everything (2019) 'A Snapshot of 96 Artists with Access Requirements.' Available at: http://www.attitudeiseverything.org.uk/uploads/general/NEXT_STAGE_SURVEY_-_FINDINGS_-_DIGITAL_BOOKLET.pdf (Accessed 13 February 2020)
- Bain, V. (2019) 'Counting the Music Industry: The Gender Gap.' Available at: <https://img1.wsimg.com/blobby/go/c35ef375-9fb4-4753-8e7d-b9088ef68d25/downloads/Counting%20the%20Music%20Industry%202019%20full%20report.pdf?ver=1571140963410> (Accessed 16 October 2019)
- BASCA, (no date) 'Equality and Diversity in New Music Commissioning.' Available at: https://ivorsacademy.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/BASCA_Music-Commissioning.pdf (Accessed 24th February 2020)
- Batty, D. (2020a) 'UK royal schools of music exam board urged to address colonial legacy'. Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2020/jul/15/uk-royal-schools-of-music-exam-board-urged-to-address-colonial-legacy> (Accessed 12 January 2021)
- Batty, D. (2020b) 'It puts me off': musicians on why white syllabuses deter black talent.' (The Guardian, 16 July 2020). Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/education/2020/jul/16/it-puts-me-off-musicians-on-why-white-syllabuses-deter-black-talent> (Accessed 30 November 2020)

- Bennett, D.E. (2008) *Understanding the Classical Music Profession: the Past, the Present and Strategies for the Future*. Aldershot: Ashgate
- Bennett, D.E. (2005) *Classical Instrumental Musicians: Educating for Sustainable Professional Practice*. PhD: University of Western Australia, School of Music
- Bennett, D. and Hennekam, S. (2018) 'Lifespan Perspective Theory and (Classical) Musicians' Careers.' In Dromey, C. and Haferkorn, J. eds. *The Classical Music Industry*. Routledge: London 112-125
- Bennett, T., Savage, M., Silva, E., Warde, A., Gayo-Cal, M. and Wright, D. (2009) *Culture, Class, Distinction*. London: Routledge
- Blamey, J., Kokot, P. and Scharff, C. (2014) 'Demographic background of students doing a music degree in the UK.' In: Scharff, C. (2015b). 'Equality and diversity in the classical music profession.' London: King's College London and ESRC.
- Bogdanovic, D. (2015) 'Gender and Equality in Music Higher Education'. National Association of Music in Higher Education.
- Born, G. and Devine, K. (2015) 'Music Technology, Gender, and Class: Digitization, Educational and Social Change in Britain' In *Twentieth-Century Music* 12/2, 135–172
- Bourdieu, P. (2010) *Distinction: a social critique of the judgement of taste*. Translated by R. Nice. Oxford, Routledge
- Breda, J. and Kulesa, P. (1999) *Stress and Job Satisfaction Among Symphony Musicians*. Evanston, Illinois: Symphony Orchestra Institute
- Brook, O., O'Brien, D. and Taylor, M. (2018) 'Panic! Social Class, Taste and Inequalities in the Creative Industries.' <http://createlondon.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/Panic-Social-Class-Taste-and-Inequalities-in-the-Creative-Industries1.pdf>
- Brook, O., O'Brien, D. and Taylor, M. (2020) *Culture is bad for you. Inequality and the creative class* Manchester: Manchester University Press
- Bull, A. (2015) *The musical body: how gender and class are reproduced among young people playing classical music in England*. Unpublished PhD Thesis. Goldsmiths, University of London.
- Bull, A. (2016a) 'El Sistema as a bourgeois social project: class, gender, and Victorian values', *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 15(1): 120-153
- Bull, A. (2016b) 'Gendering the Middle Classes: The Construction of Conductors' Authority in Youth Classical Music Groups', *The Sociological Review*, 64(4), pp. 855–871. doi: [10.1111/1467-954X.12426](https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-954X.12426).
- Bull, A. (2018) 'Uncertain Capital. Class, Gender, and the "Imagined Futures" of Young Classical Musicians'. In: Dromey, C. and Haferkorn, J. eds. *The Classical Music Industry*. Routledge: London 79-95

Bull, A. (2019) *Class, Control, and Classical Music*. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Bull, A. and Scharff, C. (2017) "McDonald's Music" versus "Serious Music": How Production and Consumption Practices Help to Reproduce Class Inequality in the Classical Music Profession.' *Cultural Sociology*, Vol. 11(3) 283 –301

Busby, E. (2019) 'Exam board criticised for failing to include more works by female composers on piano syllabus.' (Independent, 22 December 2019) Available at: <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/female-composers-piano-grades-music-exam-board-abrsm-gender-imbalance-a9256901.html> (Accessed 30 November 2020)

CAMEo (2018) 'Workforce Diversity in the UK Screen Sector: Evidence Review'. CAMEo Research Institute: Leicester.

Carey, H., Crowley, L., Dudley, C., Sheldon, H., and Giles, L. (2017) *A Skills Audit of the UK Film and Screen Industries Report for the British Film Institute*. London: Work Foundation Creative and Cultural Skills (2019) 'Creative and Cultural Skills Annual Conference 2019'. Available at: https://ccskills.org.uk/downloads/Creative_Cultural_Skills_-_National_Conference_2019_-_Programme.pdf Accessed: 17 December 2019

CUKAS (2014) 'CUKAS Annual Report 2013. 2013 Entry Cycle.' Available at: <https://www.ucas.com/file/62801/download?token=PDqszl4r> (Accessed 7 January 2020)

Daubney, A. and Mackrill, D. (2018) 'Changes in Secondary Music Curriculum Provision over time 2016-18/19. Summary of the research.' Available at: <https://www.ism.org/images/images/SUMMARY-Changes-in-Secondary-Music-Curriculum-Provision-2016-18.pdf> (Accessed 26 February 2020)

Davis, J. (2014) 'The Accessibility of a Classical Music Education to Youth in the United States.' Unpublished dissertation, Oberlin College.

De Boise, S. (2018). 'Gender Inequalities and Higher Music Education: Comparing the UK and Sweden.' *British Journal of Music Education*. 35:1, 23-41

DeFord, C. (2008) 'Bringing Diversity to the World of Classical Music.' *Diverse Issues in Higher Education* 25/10: 10-12

DeLorenzo, L. C. (2012) 'Missing Faces from the Orchestras: An Issue of Social Justice?' *Music Educators Journal* 98/4: 38-4

Department for Education (2011) 'The Importance of Music. A National Plan for Music Education.' Available at: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/180973/DFE-00086-2011.pdf (Accessed 26 February 2020)

Derbyshire, S. (2015) 'Musical Routes: A landscape for music education.' London: Royal Philharmonic Society. Available at: <https://www.musicmark.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/MUSICAL-ROUTES-report-Sarah-Derbyshire-Royal-Philharmonic-Society.pdf> (Accessed 26 February 2020)

DHA (2012) 'The Working Musician.' Available at: <https://www.musiciansunion.org.uk/Files/Reports/Industry/The-Working-Musician-report> (Accessed 10 February 2020)

Donnelly, M., Lažetić, P., Sandoval-Hernandez, A., Kumar, K. and Whewall, S. (2019) 'An Unequal Playing Field: Extra-Curricular Activities, Soft Skills and Social Mobility.' Available at: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/818679/An_Unequal_Playing_Field_report.pdf (Accessed 19 March 2020)

Dromey, C. and Haferkorn, J. eds. (2018) *The Classical Music Industry*. Routledge: London

Dowd, V. (2020) 'Traditions should change' says Proms composer Errollyn Wallen.' (BBC News, 12 September 2020). Available at: <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/entertainment-arts-54115638> (Accessed 30 November 2020)

Ewell, P. (2020) 'Music Theory and the White Racial Frame', *Music Theory Online* Volume 26 (2). Available at: <https://mtosmt.org/issues/mto.20.26.2/mto.20.26.2.ewell.html> (Accessed 30 November 2020)

Fasang, A. (2006) 'Recruitment in symphony orchestras: testing a gender neutral recruitment process', *Work, employment and society* Volume 20(4): 801-809

Fautley, M. and Kinsella, V. (2017) 'Independent Evaluation of the OHMI Teaching Pilot.' OHMI Trust: Birmingham

Fautley, M. and Whittaker, A. (2017). 'Key Data on Music Education Hubs 2017'. Available at: https://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-file/KeyDataOnMusicEducationHubs2017_0.pdf (Accessed 7 March 2020)

Fulford, R., Ginsborg, J. and Goldbart, J. (2011) 'Learning not to listen: the experiences of musicians with hearing impairments', *Music Education Research*, Vo.=l. 13, No. 4, December 2011, 447-464

Goldin, C. and Rouse, C. (1997) 'Orchestrating impartiality: the impact of "blind" auditions on female musicians.' Available at: <https://www.nber.org/papers/w5903.pdf> (Accessed 7 March 2020)

Goldin, C. and Rouse, C. (2000) 'Orchestrating Impartiality: The Impact of "Blind" Auditions on Female Musicians.' Available at: <https://pubs.aeaweb.org/doi/pdfplus/10.1257/aer.90.4.715> (Accessed 7 March 2020).

Greasley, A., Fulford, R., Pickard, M. and Hamilton, N. (2018) 'Help Musicians UK hearing survey: Musicians' hearing and hearing protection', *Psychology of Music* <https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735618812238>

Green, L. (1997) *Music, Gender, Education*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Gross, S. A. and Musgrave, G. (2016) 'Can Music Make You Sick? Music and Depression. A Study into the Incidence of Musicians' Mental Health Part 1: Pilot Survey Report.' Available at:

https://www.helpmusicians.org.uk/assets/publications/files/can_music_make_you_sick_part_1-_pilot_survey_report_2019.pdf (Accessed 13 February 2020)

Gross, S. A. and Musgrave, G. (2017) 'Can Music Make You Sick? A Study into the Incidence of Musicians' Mental Health. Part 2: Qualitative Study and Recommendations.' Available at: <https://www.helpmusicians.org.uk/assets/publications/files/can-music-make-you-sick-part-2-qualitative-study-1.pdf> (Accessed 13 February 2020)

Hallam, S. and Burns, S. (2018) 'Research into support for musical progression for young people from In Harmony programmes. Phase Two Research: Action Research and Case Studies'. Available at: https://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-file/IH_Musical_Progression_PhaseTwoReport_Dec18_0.pdf (Accessed 20 January 2020)

Hallam, S., Rogers, L. and Creech, A. (2008) 'Gender differences in musical instrument choice', *International Journal of Music Education* 26(1), 7-19

Help Musicians (2014) 'Health and Wellbeing Survey.' London: Help Musicians

Help Musicians (2015) 'Musicians' Hearing Survey.' Available at: https://www.helpmusicians.org.uk/assets/files/help_musicians_uk_hearing_survey_june_2015.pdf (Accessed 12 February 2020)

Henley, D. (2011) 'Music Education in England: a review by Darren Henley for the Department for Education and the Department for Culture, Media and Sport.' Available at: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/175432/DFE-00011-2011.pdf (Accessed 26 February 2020)

HESA (2019) 'Higher Education Staff Statistics: 2017/18.' Available at: <https://www.hesa.ac.uk/news/24-01-2019/sb253-higher-education-staff-statistics> (Accessed 19 March 2020)

Hesmondhalgh, D. and Baker, S. (2015) 'Sex, gender and work segregation in the cultural industries'. *The Sociological Review*, 63: 23-36

Hesmondhalgh, D. (2018) 'The media's failure to represent the working class: explanations from media production and beyond'. In J. Deery and A. Press (eds), *Media and Class: TV, Film and Digital Culture* (21–37). London: Routledge

Higham-Edwards, B. (2019) 'Women in Percussion'. Unpublished.

Irwin, S. and Elley, S. (2011) 'Concerted Cultivation? Parenting Values, Education and Class Diversity.' *Sociology* 45/3: 480-95

ISM (2018) 'Dignity at work: a survey of discrimination in the music sector'. Available at: https://www.ism.org/images/images/ISM_Dignity-at-work-April-2018.pdf (Accessed 6 January 2020)

ISM, Equity and Musicians' Union (2018) 'Dignity in study: a survey of higher education institutions'. Available at: <https://www.ism.org/images/images/Equity-ISM-MU-Dignity-in-Study-report.pdf> (Accessed 6 January 2020)

Journal of Schenkerian Studies (2019) 'XII (2019): Symposium on Philip Ewell's SMT 2019 plenary paper, Music theory's white racial frame', *Journal of Schenkerian Studies*, 12 (2019).

Kantar Public and Office of National Statistics (2017) '2017-18 Crime Survey for England and Wales Questionnaire (from April 2017)'. Swansea: Office of National Statistics

Konsen Tromsø (2018) 'Music and Gender in Balance Conference.' Available at: http://site.uit.no/mgb-conference/files/2018/03/book_of_abstracts_MGB18.pdf (Accessed 3 March 2020)

Labour Party (2017) 'Acting Up Report. Labour's inquiry into access and diversity in the performing arts'. London: Labour Party

Lareau, A. (2003) *Unequal Childhoods. Class, Race and Family Life*. Berkeley, CA: University of California

League of American Orchestras and Doerer, J. (2016) *Racial/Ethnic and Gender Diversity in the Orchestra Field*. New York: League of American Orchestras

League of American Orchestras, Rabkin, N. and Hairston O'Connell, M. (2016) *Forty Years of Fellowships: A Study of Orchestra's Efforts to Include African American and Latino Musicians*. New York: League of American Orchestras

Mantie, R. and Tucker, L. (2012) 'Pluralism, the right, and the good in choirs, orchestras, and bands.' In: *International Journal of Music Education* 30(3) 260-271

McClure, B., Kokot, P. and Scharff, C. (2014) 'Demographic backgrounds of orchestral players and conservatoire teaching staff in the UK.' In: Scharff, C. (2015b). 'Equality and diversity in the classical music profession.' London: King's College London and ESRC

McCormick, L. (2009) 'Higher, faster, louder: Representations of the international music competition', *Cultural Sociology*, 3(1): 5–30

McCormick, L. (2015) *Performing Civility. International Competitions in Classical Music*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

McDowell, A., Gamblin, D., Teoh, K., Raine, C. and Ehnold-Danailov, A. (2019) "Balancing Act". PiPA's survey into the impact of caring responsibilities on career progression in the performing arts'. Available at: <http://www.pipacampaign.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/BA-Final.pdf> (Accessed 6 January 2020)

Moore, G. (2012) "Tristan Chords and Random Scores": Exploring Undergraduate Students' Experiences of Music in Higher Education Through the Lens of Bourdieu." *Music Education Research* 14/1: 63-78

Musicians' Union (2019) 'Sexual Harassment Widespread Across the UK Music Industry'. Available at: <https://www.musiciansunion.org.uk/Home/News/2019/Oct/Sexual-Harassment-Widespread-Across-the-UK-Music-I> (Accessed 6 January 2020)

National Alliance for Audition Support (no date) 'National Alliance for Audition Support (NAAS) & Sphinx Orchestral Partner Auditions (SOPA). Summary Impact/Program Update'. Detroit: Sphinx Organization

Nordicity and Smith, A. (2017) 'Workforce Review of the UK Offstage Theatre and Performing Arts Sector. Final Report for UK Theatre and Society of London Theatre' Nordicity: London

Nwanoku, C. (2020) 'Chineke! Call for Action'. Available at: <https://www.chineke.org/news/chineke-call-for-action> (Accessed 12 January 2021)

O'Donnell, H. (2016) 'The Broken Musician. The Taboo of Injury and Disability in Music'. Available at: <https://van-us.atavist.com/broken-musician> (Accessed 13 February 2020)

Oakley, K. and O'Brien, D. (2015) 'Cultural Value and Inequality: A Critical Literature Review.' AHRC: Swindon

Oakley, K. and O'Brien, D. (2016) 'Learning to labour unequally: understanding the relationship between cultural production, cultural consumption and inequality'. *Social Identities*, Vol. 22, No. 5, 471-486

O'Brien, D., Laurison, D., Miles, A. and Friedman, S. (2016) 'Are the creative industries meritocratic? An analysis of the 2014 British labour force survey.' *Cultural Trends*, Vol. 25, No. 2, 116-131

Oman, S. (2019) 'Improving data practices to monitor inequality and introduce social mobility measures – a working paper for the cultural sector'. Available at: https://www.sheffield.ac.uk/polopoly_fs/1.867756!/file/MetricsWorkingPaper.pdf (Accessed 18 March 2020)

Orchestras for All (2010) 'Impact Report 2018-2019'. Available at: <https://static1.squarespace.com/static/58f032f81b631b6e8362b2a2/t/5dcbe1106d474f159d771d0c/1573642538502/Impact+Report+2018-2019.pdf> (Accessed 21 January 2020)

Osborne W and Conant A (2010) A survey of women orchestral players in major UK orchestras as of March 1, 2010. Available at: <http://www.osborne-conant.org/orch-uk.htm> (Accessed 16 September 2019)

Payne, J. and Taylor, S. (2017) 'Where are they now? Post graduate research report. November 2017. Executive Summary.' London: Help Musicians

Pentreath, R. (2020) 'ABRSM must include more black and BAME composers in exam syllabus, music leaders urge'. Available at: <https://www.classicfm.com/music-news/abrs-sm-urged-include-black-bame-composers-exam-syllabus/> (Accessed 12 January 2021)

Plumb, S. (2019) 'Behind the curtain: An investigation of workforce gender segregation in UK orchestral management.' Unpublished dissertation, Manchester Metropolitan University

Royal Musical Association and Music HE (2020). 'Equality, Diversity and Inclusion in Music Higher Education Convened by the Royal Musical Association and Music HE (formerly

NAMHE)'. Available at: https://www.city.ac.uk/_data/assets/pdf_file/0007/509614/Abstracts.-Schedule,-Logos,-programme-draft-HJM.pdf (Accessed 3 March 2020)

Scharff, C. (2015a) 'Blowing your own Trumpet: Exploring the Gendered Dynamics of Self-Promotion in the Classical Music Profession', *The Sociological Review* 63/97: 97-112

Scharff, C. (2015b) 'Equality and Diversity in the Classical Music Profession.' London: King's College London and ESRC

Scharff, C. (2017) *Gender, Subjectivity, and Cultural Work. The Classical Music Profession*. Oxford: Routledge

Scharff, C. (2018) 'Inequalities in the Classical Music Industry. The Role of Subjectivity in Constructions of the "Ideal" Classical Musician'. In: Dromey, C. and Haferkorn, J. eds. *The Classical Music Industry*. Routledge: London

Sergeant, D.C. and Himonides, E. (2019) 'Orchestrated Sex: The Representation of Male and Female Musicians in World-Class Symphony Orchestras', *Frontiers in Psychology* 10, 1760 <https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.01760/full>

Soave, R. (2019) 'A Famous Study Found That Blind Auditions Reduced Sexism in the Orchestra. Or Did It?' Available at: <https://reason.com/2019/10/22/orchestra-study-blind-auditions-gelman/> (Accessed 7 March 2020).

Society for Music Theory (2020) 'Executive Board response to essays in the Journal of Schenkerian Studies Volume 12.' Available at: <https://societymusictheory.org/announcement/executive-board-response-journal-schenkerian-studies-vol-12-2020-07> (Accessed 30 November 2020).

Sound Connections (2018) 'Bournemouth Symphony Orchestra Change Makers Programme 2017-2018. External Evaluation Report.' Bournemouth Symphony Orchestra: Bournemouth.

Sphinx Organization (2020) *Our History*. Available at: <http://www.sphinxmusic.org/our-history/> (Accessed 21 January 2020).

Sphinx Organization (no date) 'Sphinx Organization Impact Report'. Available at: http://www.sphinxmusic.org/images/Sphinx_20_Year_Impact_Report.pdf (Accessed 21 January 2020).

Straus, J. (2011) *Extraordinary Measures: Disability in Music* Oxford University Press: New York

Straus, J. (2018) *Broken Beauty: Musical Modernism and the Representation of Disability* Oxford University Press: New York

Taylor, M. (2020) 'UK Games Industry Census. Understanding diversity in the UK games industry workforce.' Available at: https://ukie.org.uk/sites/default/files/cms/docs/UK_Games_Industry_Census_2020_FINAL_DIGITAL_0.pdf (Accessed 19 March 2020)

Tsiris, G. (2013) 'Voices from the ghetto': Music therapy perspectives on disability and music (A response to Joseph Straus's book *Extraordinary Measures: Disability in Music*), *International Journal of Community Music*, 6(3), 333-343

UCAS Conservatoires (2015) 'End of Cycle Report 2014'. Available at: https://www.ucas.com/file/21066/download?token=0eP_O3J4 (Accessed 7 January 2020)

UCAS Conservatoires (no date) *UCAS Conservatoires end of cycle 2018 data resources*. <https://www.ucas.com/data-and-analysis/ucas-conservatoires-releases> (Accessed 7 January 2020)

UCAS Conservatoires, (no date) *UCAS Conservatoires end of cycle 2019 data resources*. <https://www.ucas.com/data-and-analysis/ucas-conservatoires-releases> (Accessed 9 February 2021)

Universal Music (no date) 'Creative Differences. A handbook for embracing neurodiversity in the creative industries'. Available at: <https://umusic.co.uk/Creative-Differences-Handbook.pdf> (Accessed 19 February 2020)

UK Music (2020) 'Ten-Point Plan'. Available at: <https://www.ukmusic.org/equality-diversity/ten-point-plan/> (Accessed 12 January 2021)

Whittaker, A., Fautley, M., Kinsella, V. and Anderson, A. (2019) 'Geographical and social demographic trends of A-level music students.' Royal College of Music and Royal Academy of Music: London

Whittaker, P. (1986) *Music potential in the profoundly deaf*. BA Thesis. University of Oxford.

Willis, S. Neil, R., Mellick, M. C. and Wasley, D. (2019) 'The Relationship Between Occupational Demands and Well-Being of Performing Artists: A Systematic Review.' *Frontiers in Psychology*, 10/2019: 393

Yang, M. (2014) *Planet Beethoven: Classical Music at the Turn of the Millenium*. Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press.

Yoshihara, M. (2007) *Musicians from a Different Shore: Asians and Asian Americans in Classical Music*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press

Youth Music and Ipsos Mori (2019) 'The sound of the next generation. A comprehensive review of children and young people's relationship with music.' Available at:

<https://www.youthmusic.org.uk/sound-of-the-next-generation> (Accessed 26 February 2020)

Youth Music (2020) 'Reshape Music. A report exploring the lived experience of Disabled musicians in education and beyond.' Available at: <https://youthmusic.org.uk/reshape-music> (Accessed 9 February 2021)

Zeserson, K., Welch, G., Burn, S., Saunders, J. and Himonides, E. (2014) 'Inspiring Music for All. Next steps in innovation, improvement and integration. Paul Hamlyn Foundation Review of Music in Schools.' Available at: <https://www.phf.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2014/07/Inspiring-Music-for-All.pdf> (Accessed 26 February 2020)

ⁱ Scharff adopts a similar approach to using the term ‘classical music’ and chooses to do so as a reflection of the language which her study participants (classical musicians) also use (Scharff, 2017: 7).

ⁱⁱ It is important to acknowledge that much of the work which seeks to enable ‘first access’ opportunities for children and young people to engage with classical music (or, indeed, other musical genre and activities) is time and funding limited, and so there is a real absence of material which tracks individual participants through from an early ‘intervention’ to understand if they continue to engage in activities in the future.

ⁱⁱⁱ Emphasis is author’s own.

^{iv} It is worth noting that Straus’s inclusion of commentary on music therapy in the book is limited (given the wider scope of the study), and that it has received some critique (e.g. Tsisis, 2013) for mischaracterising the motivation of at least some established music therapy practices as something done ‘to’ or ‘for’ participants, rather than ‘with’.

^v Bain reflects upon the possibility that observing gender via website content may lead to errors, and states:

‘There may be those who wish to identify as a gender other than that which I have assumed but believe any errors introduced this way are relatively small and would not impact the findings of this research.’ (Bain, 2019: 9)

She goes on to note that HESA data reports only 0.04% of students over a five year period identify as ‘other’ (i.e. neither male nor female). To provide some context to this methodological choice of observing demographic characteristics, it is worth noting that other approaches (e.g. in-person surveys) sometimes also encourage interviewers to observe characteristics like sex. For example, the National Crime Survey for England and Wales for 2017 includes the following instruction to the interviewer:

‘INTERVIEWER: CODE THE SEX OF EACH ADULT IN THE HOUSEHOLD

1. Male

2. Female’ (Kantar Public and Office of National Statistics, 2017: 18).

^{vi} The 2014 survey builds in part upon previous surveys undertaken in 1993, 1996 and 1999; ABRSM also repeated this work in 2020 (at the time of writing the report is not yet available), and thus this dataset provides population level data (via an omnibus survey/weight sample) on instrumental learning by children and young people and adults with an increasingly longitudinal time series.

^{vii} This report specifically uses the term ‘Disabled musicians’ with the capitalisation as presented, and discusses the choice made in doing so; the term is one used by Youth Music to emphasise the social model of disability (‘often people are *dis*-abled by society, not that a disability is something they *have*’) and to emphasise the ‘unique and collective sense of identity’ (Youth Music, 2020). The contributors to the research used whichever terms they chose to describe themselves, but overall the report adopts this formulation.

^{viii} The conclusions of Sergeant and Himonides (2019) in relation to conservatoire admissions seem to contradict those of De Boise (2018), Scharff (2019) and indeed UCAS Conservatoires’ own assessment of the data (e.g. UCAS Conservatoires, 2015), all of which use UCAS entry data though in some cases with a different time period/focus and/or different combination of undergraduate and postgraduate data. Looking at the publicly available data from UCAS Conservatoires over a 9-year period from 2010 to 2018 the proportion of women applicants has risen substantially, from 53% to 63% of all applicants (UCAS, 2018). The proportion of women accepted for courses in UK conservatoires is lower than the proportion of applicants in every year over this data period. Acceptance rates for women applicants in this period range from between 21% and 32%; for men applicants they range from 26% to 38%. Acceptance rates for women applicants are between 3 and 9 percentage points lower than for men applicants. The difference is sufficient to confirm that men applicants have experienced a better application to acceptance ratio than women applicants.

^{ix} Elsewhere (Scharff, 2017) suggests that no Black undergraduates were offered a place in UK Conservatoires between 2011 and 2013; the CUKAS data report (2014) removed columns in graphs where the figures were under 5, and so it is possible that in that period Black undergraduates were accepted to

a conservatoire but that the figures were removed due to being relatively small. The issue with data disclosure is complicated in that particular CUKAS report by the fact that the graphs show applicants and acceptances by ethnicity and gender, and so if either the male or female Black acceptances in any given year were less than 5, all data on Black acceptances for that year would have been removed. UCAS Conservatoires end of cycle data for 2019 provides a 10-year data set which enables us to look at applicants and acceptances by ethnicity and level of study; data is rounded to the nearest 5 meaning that some data may be removed, but that acceptance numbers of 3 or greater will appear rather than being removed. This data shows a small number of Black undergraduate acceptances in 2011, 2012 and 2013.

^x Born and Devine go on to point out that traditional music degrees are largely offered by ‘the elite end of the university spectrum’ and conservatoires, whereas music technology degrees have largely been offered by the 1960s and ‘post-1992’ universities, suggesting a ‘subordinat[ion] in status and legitimacy’ and reflecting the apparent differences in student intake from different social class groups (Born and Devine, 2015: 158).

^{xi} The authors of this study briefly discuss whether the physical strains of playing might be the amongst the reasons for women serving less long in orchestras (Sergeant and Himonides, 2019); what may be worth consideration is that the current datasets may currently reflect the overall time-lag of women into the orchestral workforce. The average age of women is younger than men, their average service length is less; if fewer women were in the workforce 10 years ago, and even fewer 20 years ago, potentially these data points in age and service length reflect the historic absence and the more recent presence of women coming through the workforce.

^{xii} It is worth noting that the study does not differentiate chief executive/managing director roles from other senior management. Board membership is also not included.

^{xiii} This study (League of American Orchestras and Doerer, 2016) uses the term ‘non-white’ in presenting data. The report indicates that this includes: ‘African American, Hispanic / Latino, Asian / Pacific Islander, American Indian / Alaskan Native, and other non-white backgrounds’ (p. 3).

^{xiv} The group ‘Asian and Pacific Islander’ follows categories used in the US Census, and covers very broad territory, including persons having origins in any of the original peoples of the Far East, Southeast Asia, or the Indian subcontinent and Native Hawaiian, Samoan, Guamanian or Chamorro, Fijian, Tongan, or Marshallese peoples and encompasses the people within the United States jurisdictions of Melanesia, Micronesia and Polynesia.

^{xv} Schaff also usefully notes the way in which this chimes with research about other creative work (Scharff, 2018: 104).

^{xvi} It is worth noting here the use of language in this handbook; the term ‘neurodivergent’ is specifically avoided within the report, alongside some other terms, because ‘these phrases can emphasise difference and ‘otherness’ (Universal Music, n.d.). The terms ‘neurodiverse’ and ‘neurodiversity’ are used instead; however, it is worth noting that where the term ‘neurodiversity’ is used, therefore, it appears the whole population of neuro-possibilities is included – including those ‘with specific facets of neurodiversity such as ASD, ADHD, dyslexia, dyscalculia, dyspraxia and Tourette Syndrome’, but not exclusively this group. ‘Neurodiverse’, on the other hand, seems to refer to a specific group of people who have specific facets of neurodiversity. As such, therefore, the survey responses as presented appear to be asking organisations not about whether they have policies specifically for employees or others who may have these specific facets, but whether they have policies which encompass the wider population, including those with these specific facets.

^{xvii} As is discussed earlier in the section 2.3, it is difficult to judge to what extent the high prevalence of reported hearing loss amongst the survey population is likely to be representative of that amongst the wider population of musicians, given the potential for self-selection bias amongst survey respondents/non-respondents.

^{xviii} For Bull this is material from an ethnographic study of young people playing in music ensembles in South East England, and included observations, interviews, focus groups and other material. This data is used across a number of publications, including Bull and Scharff (2017) and also Bull (2015, 2016a, 2016b, 2018, and 2019). Scharff’s material comes from 64 semi-structured interviews with female musicians in their late 20s and early 30s, and is similarly used across a number of publications, including Bull and Scharff (2017) and Scharff (2015a, 2017 and 2018).

^{xix} In this article Moore is examining a particular cultural nexus, in which the Irish traditional music is valued, but not the dominant cultural paradigm within the music higher education context.

^{xx} It is worth noting that Green's study of teachers' perceptions is based on a dataset from 1992. Whilst this means that the data is now 17 years old, one of the striking things of her two-part approach is the continuity of gender constructions in musical meanings between the historical examples in the first part, and the data from a (then contemporaneous) classroom setting in the second part.

^{xxi} In this case, McCormick is referring to what we understand as East Asian.

^{xxii} Bull also identifies a third group, consisting of young people from the professional and upper-middle classes who did not wish to pursue a career in classical music. Bull describes how these musicians reflect upon the benefits which classical music has brought them – making contacts, obtaining scholarships to private schools, gaining prestigious experiences – as beneficial, but also notes that the class background of this group means that these benefits are likely, in any case, to have been accrued by this group through their class experience. Bull also suggests that for some of this group, deciding not to pursue a career in classical music in order to do something else is more likely to have reproduced the class position which they currently held (and their parents exemplify) (Bull, 2018: 84-5).

^{xxiii} This review keeps the formulation which Yoshihara uses here; in the UK, we would understand much of her study to be referring more specifically to the experiences of musicians of East Asian heritage.

