

Boylan, P.J.

Europe's built environment and movable heritage
Strasbourg : Council of Europe. Cultural policy and action division, 1995
82 p. ; 31 cm. - Met lit. opg.

BOEKMAN*stichting*

Studiecentrum voor kunst, cultuur en beleid

Herengracht 415
1017 BP Amsterdam
telefoon bibliotheek 020-624 37 39
fax 020 - 638 52 39
e-mail bibliotheek@boekman.nl
internet www.boekman.nl

De uitleentermijn bedraagt 4 weken. Verlenging met 4 weken
is mogelijk, tenzij de publikatie inmiddels is gereserveerd.

De uitleentermijn is verstreken op:

--	--	--

Council of Europe
Conseil de l'Europe



Boekmanstichting - Bibliotheek
Herengracht 415
1017 BP Amsterdam
Tel. 6243739

[Handwritten signature]

9 March 1995

COUNCIL FOR CULTURAL CO-OPERATION

Culture

BACKGROUND STUDY

commissioned
by the Council of Europe
and the European Task Force
in charge of the preparation of

THE EUROPEAN CONTRIBUTION TO THE WORLD REPORT ON CULTURE AND DEVELOPMENT

EUROPE'S BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND MOVABLE HERITAGE

by Patrick J. Boylan
(1994)

*EUROPEAN TASK FORCE ON CULTURE
AND DEVELOPMENT*

*EUROPE'S BUILT
ENVIRONMENT AND
MOVABLE HERITAGE*

PATRICK J. BOYLAN

1994

EUROPEAN TASK FORCE ON CULTURE AND DEVELOPMENT

EUROPE'S BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND MOVABLE HERITAGE

PATRICK J. BOYLAN

CONTENTS

1.	<i>Introduction</i>	2.
2.	<i>The 20th century physical heritage explosion</i>	5.
3.	<i>Historic urban environments and development</i>	17.
4.	<i>Historic rural environments and development</i>	32.
5.	<i>Modern urban environments and development</i>	41.
6.	<i>The moveable physical patrimony: museums and collections</i>	47.
7.	<i>Future prospects</i>	63.
 <i>Appendices</i>		
I:	<i>Relevant international commitments of European States</i>	65.
II:	<i>European cultural properties on the World Heritage List</i>	67.
III:	<i>Selective bibliography on physical patrimony and development</i>	73.

DECEMBER 1994

EUROPEAN TASK FORCE ON CULTURE AND DEVELOPMENT

**EUROPE'S BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND
MOVABLE HERITAGE**

PATRICK J. BOYLAN

CONTENTS

1.	<i>Introduction</i>	2.
2.	<i>The 20th century physical heritage explosion</i>	5.
3.	<i>Historic urban environments and development</i>	17.
4.	<i>Historic rural environments and development</i>	32.
5.	<i>Modern urban environments and development</i>	41.
6.	<i>The moveable physical patrimony: museums and collections</i>	47.
7	<i>Future prospects</i>	63.

Appendices

I:	<i>Relevant international commitments of European States</i>	65.
II:	<i>European cultural properties on the World Heritage List</i>	67.
III:	<i>Selective bibliography on physical patrimony and development</i>	73.

1. INTRODUCTION

1. 1. This study has been prepared as a Background Report for the Council of Europe's Task Force on Culture and Development, which is preparing a European Report as a contribution to the World Commission on Culture and Development. It focuses primarily on current experience and practice and on future prospects in relation to cultural, social and economic development in relation to both distinctive areas of the physical heritage: the moveable patrimony, and the built cultural environment, which ranges from individual monuments and other buildings and structures of cultural significance through to extensive areas of urban and rural cultural landscapes.
1. 2. It examines the explosive growth of preservationist and conservation sentiment in both the public and private sectors in recent years in relation to both the physical and moveable patrimony. These preservation and conservation developments have increasingly been rationalised and justified in terms of the claimed economic benefits of such initiatives, specifically in relation to the promotion of tourism, and more recently in terms of (less clearly focused) assumptions of the value of cultural initiatives in the service of much wider, though more nebulous, concepts of 'development'.
1. 3. However, it is necessary to enter a most important caveat at the very beginning of this study. Society as a whole, and public authorities at international, national, regional and local levels in particular, need to recognise that the over-riding

justification for the development of culture and the patrimony must always be cultural not economic.

1. 4. Adapting the old mountaineering argument used to justify perhaps very dangerous attempts to climb Mount Everest, we need to explore, support, develop, interpret and communicate the significance of culture to humanity in general and the specific population or social group that it is hoped to serve 'because it's there', not because of an implied or hoped-for economic benefit or 'profit'. This fundamental principle is especially important in relation to immovable cultural property.

1. 5. A good example of this principle is that of the extremely remote late 18th century ironworks at Bonawe, Loch Etive, in the Western Highlands of Scotland about 140 km. from the nearest large centre of population (Glasgow). Because of its now-unique historic features, in particular a well-preserved but the last surviving example of what was in the 18th century the most common British (and perhaps Continental also) type of charcoal-fired blast furnace, Bonawe is in the care of the National Trust for Scotland. Even though the number of actual (and indeed potential) visitors per year is inevitably very small, it is just as important to save and preserve this key historic site and its various now-unique features as Abraham Darby's coke-fired blast furnace of approximately the same date in the Ironbridge Gorge World Heritage Site in the English West Midlands, which has a population of around 5 million within easy travelling distance and which attracts over 400,000 paying visitors a year. Judged in purely economic development terms

it would be hard to justify a substantial investment in preserving and interpreting the Bonawe site, yet in cultural terms its location in relation to current concentrations of population and patterns of mass tourism is quite irrelevant.

1. 6. Though features of cultural interest and importance can certainly be developed and exploited as part of a tourism development or more broadly-based economic development initiative, values judgements about what to preserve or how to care for the physical patrimony need to be made on cultural, not economic, grounds.
1. 7. Inevitably, with such an enormous field to cover this report must be in most areas impressionistic rather than detailed and definitive, though a number of longer case studies are included in the text at relevant points.

2. THE 20TH CENTURY PHYSICAL HERITAGE EXPLOSION

2. 1. The half century since the end of the Second World War and particularly the past two decades has seen a quite unprecedented interest in almost all aspects of the preservation, interpretation and exploitation of the world's physical patrimony of individual historic buildings, cultural ensembles such as historic townscapes and cultural landscapes, museums, galleries and collections. Though it has grown explosively since World War II, the historic conservation movement had of course a significant 'pre-history'. Notable examples included the debates about the possible preservation of historic monuments and historic collections in the early days of the French Revolution¹, the efforts of the isolated later 19th century English social reformers and preservationists promoting a respect for medieval social and creative values, such as John Ruskin and William Morris² and the founding in 1895 of the (English) National Trust³, which became a model for similar national and regional preservation trusts in other countries.
2. 2. More typically in the 19th century public sentiment placed far greater emphasis on new building and the modern rather than the conservation of the historic

¹ Most recently discussed in Patrick J. Boylan, 1992B.

² John Ruskin, artist, critic and social reformer, 1819 - 1900; William Morris, 1834 - 1896 - one of the founders in 1877 of the Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings.

³ The full title is 'The National Trust for Places of Historic Interest and Natural Beauty'; although it remains an entirely voluntary body it has special legal status under the National Trust Act 1907 and United Kingdom tax law.

heritage. Perhaps the grandest of all examples of this was Haussmann's drastic and immensely costly re-modelling of the ancient city of Paris and its emerging faubourgs (suburbs) between 1853 and 1870. At a more local, and from a modern viewpoint, more bizarre level, one can cite the petition from property owners to the Town Council of Leicester, England, in the late 1880s demanding that the Town's 14th to 16th century timber-framed Guildhall be demolished because it spoilt the appearance of the large new factories that they had recently built overlooking what is, in the more conservation minded atmosphere of today, regarded as one of the most important buildings of its kind in the country.

2. 3. The rates of growth of both the expert conservation movements and of pro-conservation sentiment among the general public since World War II have been quite phenomenal. In the United Kingdom, for example, the number of historic buildings and archaeological sites enjoying some form of protection under national law has risen from less than 1,000 Scheduled Ancient Monuments⁴ in 1946 to more than half a million today (many times as many Scheduled Ancient Monuments, 'Listed Buildings'⁵ and properties located within 'Conservation Areas'⁶).

⁴ Designated by, and under the protection of what was then the Ministry of Works.

⁵ The 'Lists' of buildings of architectural and/or historic importance were established by Ministerial Order on the advice of Ministry architectural and historic experts (now the Historic Buildings and Monuments Commission - 'English Heritage') under the Town and Country Planning Act, 1947, and successive updates of this.

⁶ Local Planning Authorities were given the power to designate (with the consent of the relevant Minister) (urban) Conservation Areas under the Civic Amenities Act 1967 and subsequent legislation.

2. 4. Further, the types and ages of properties being preserved has widened very greatly over the past two decades or so. For example, industrial and commercial buildings and sites of the 19th or earlier 20th centuries are now widely deemed worthy of legal and practical protection and conservation, while a rapidly growing range of 20th century buildings and urban ensembles are also now receiving national and even international protection⁷. Ironically, post-World War II British building conservation laws today protect not just Leicester's ancient Guildhall (as a Scheduled Ancient Monument and Grade 1 Listed Building) but also those very same factories built in the 1880s mentioned in the Petition referred to above (now Grade 2 Listed Buildings), while the whole ensemble, and the spatial relationships between them, are also now protected as part of the Leicester Cathedral and Guildhall Conservation Area.

2. 5. The statistics are just as remarkable in relation to the moveable historic heritage. Although a small number of the world's museums have existed for many hundreds of years, the great majority are very recent creations in historical terms. In most developing countries of Africa, Asia, the Caribbean and the Pacific regions of the world there were few if any museums during their colonial periods, while even in the most developed regions such as western Europe a substantial majority of museums and art galleries have been created since the end of the

⁷

This wider definition extends to the World Heritage List, where European 20th century features now include not only Antoni Gaudí's extraordinary Parc Güell (1900-1914) and Casa Milia ('La Pedrera') apartment block (1905-1910) in Barcelona (on the World List since 1984, together with Gaudí's first 'moderniste' (= Art Nouveau) masterpiece, the Palau Güell of 1886-1888), but also the Auschwitz (Poland) Concentration Camp of 1941-1945 (inscribed on the World List as early as 1979).

Second World War and therefore are younger than UNESCO, the Council of Europe or the International Council of Museums (ICOM), for example.

2. 6. In the United Kingdom there was what proved to be a short-term explosive growth in the number of museums during the 1970s and early 1980s in the local government sector, apparently linked to the creation of new authorities in 1974 in England and Wales and 1975 in Scotland and reflecting efforts to record and express the cultural identity of the new authorities, as part of a tourism development initiative or - quite often - for no clear purpose except to find an appropriate use for an otherwise redundant historic building.
2. 7. The same period saw a similar explosion in the United Kingdom of new private sector 'independent' industrial history and similar community museums being created reflecting both the growing popular interest in industrial archaeology and social history, coupled with national concern about the grave loss of both the physical and social evidence of the industrial history of the locality following the rapid run-down and collapse of traditional industries.
2. 8. Similarly, both the United States and Australia, to take two examples, saw massive growths in the number of their museums during their national bicentennial celebrations around 1976 and in the late 1980s respectively, while France has made massive investments in renewing and extending the Musée du Louvre in time for the museum's November 1993 bicentenary.

2. 9. Over the past decade or so there have been a growing number of major studies and reviews considering the actual and potential impact of the physical culture sector in the wider economic and cultural development fields. A particularly important and pioneering study in terms of both objectives and methodology was the major study for the 1982 Madrid International Seminar on the Financing of Culture *Museums: An Investment for Development* financed by the UNESCO International Fund for the Promotion of Culture and prepared under the auspices of the International Council of Museums⁸. Especially noteworthy subsequent studies covering wider areas of the physical heritage in most cases, include studies of the actual and potential role of culture in tourism and economic development in Latin America and the Netherlands respectively, both published in 1983⁹, a Canadian study completed in 1985¹⁰, and the UK national study of 1988¹¹. The growing interest in this field is evidenced by an increasing flow of such studies in the 1990s, including Franco Bianchini's 1991 research paper on urban cultural development and the arts for the Arts Council of Great Britain's National Arts and Media Strategy¹², the proceedings of a significant French conference with a number of important cases studies, particularly from

⁸ De La Torre and Monreal, 1982 (107 pp.)

⁹ Office of American States: *Regional Seminar about the Cultural Patrimony and the Tourism Product* 1983; Netherlands Research Institute for Recreation and Tourism: *The National Heritage - a tourist asset*, 1983.

¹⁰ WHITING, P.G. & Associates: *Economic Impacts of Heritage Institutions on the Canadian Economy: Analysis of Method*, 1985.

¹¹ John Myerscough for the Policy Studies Institute: *The Economic Importance of the Arts in Britain*, plus four additional volumes examining different British towns, 1988.

¹² Franco Bianchini, 1991: *Urban Cultural Policy. National Arts and Media Strategy Discussion Document no. 40* (London: Arts Council).

francophone countries, published in 1992¹³, and last year's substantial volume *Cultural policy and urban regeneration: The Western European experience* (with cases studies extending beyond the physical heritage issues, brought together by Franco Bianchini and Michael Parkinson¹⁴.

2.10. At the international level there has been steady progress through the 20th century with developments to encourage and assist in the development of the cultural patrimony. The 1899 *Hague Convention Concerning Bombardment by Naval Forces in Time of War* and the 1907 *Fourth Hague Convention on the Laws and Customs of War on Land* established the principle that historic town centres, churches, monuments, important libraries and archive repositories, providing they are not being used for military purposes should be protected in times of war by both the attacking and defending forces.

2.11. After the serious cultural losses of the Second World War, UNESCO sponsored the *Convention on the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict, The Hague, 1954* (The 'Hague Convention') which took the 1907 Hague principles much further, extending the principles of wartime cultural protection to civil wars and other non-international conflicts, and also calling on States Parties to the Convention to establish in peacetime adequate measures for the identification and protection of both moveable and immovable cultural property

¹³ Régis Neyret.(editor): *Le Patrimoine atout du Développement*, 1992.

¹⁴ Bianchini and Parkinson, 1993.

should armed conflicts occur, the proper training of both military and civilian personnel in the requirements of the *Convention*¹⁵.

2.1.2 Over the next twenty years UNESCO developed a wide range of other studies and recommendations relating to the physical heritage, including *Recommendations on International Principles Applicable to Archaeological Excavations*, 1956, concerning *The Most Effective means of rendering Museums Accessible to Everyone*, 1960, concerning *The Protection of Cultural Property Endangered by Public or Private Works*, 1968, concerning *The International Exchange of Cultural Property*, 1976, and the *Recommendation for the Safeguarding and Preservation of Moving Images*, 1980. Even more important, UNESCO also developed two further important international treaties. After many years of international negotiations about the impact of international theft, illegal excavation and smuggling of items of cultural value, the 1970 UNESCO General Conference adopted the *Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property*. States Parties to this Convention undertake to regulate the international market in 'Cultural Property' of all kinds (the Convention's definition of cultural property is widely drawn and includes works of art, archaeological and ethnographical material, and natural history and geological specimens) in order to try to contain the rapidly growing illicit trafficking in stolen and smuggled cultural property. However,

¹⁵

The issue of cultural protection in times of war has recently been discussed in detail - see the bibliography of this report for details (Boylan 1993A and 1993B), while the position of the various European States in relation to the ratification of the 1954 Hague Convention are detailed in Appendix I below.

even as the 25th anniversary of the Convention approaches the States Parties to the Convention are still overwhelmingly the 'vulnerable' countries suffering major archaeological and antiquity losses. Few of the major art importing countries have ratified the Convention, with the exception of United States which eventually ratified it, though with a number of important reservations.

2.13. UNESCO's third international convention in the physical patrimony field was a runaway success in terms of ratifications. This was the *World Heritage Convention* of 1972¹⁶, which introduced the concept of a World Heritage List of monuments, townscapes, and historic and archaeological sites of 'universal value' (as well as natural sites of similar importance - which fall outside the scope of this Report). The Convention also established a World Heritage Fund, and an intergovernmental World Heritage Committee charged with a wide range of functions, including examining and deciding on proposals from States Parties for additions to the List and the allocation of financial and other resources (especially expert staffing) using the resources of the World Heritage Fund.

2.14. The concept of the World Heritage List quickly captured the imagination of not just of those with special interest in historic, architectural (and natural) conservation and interpretation, but also of national, regional and local governments, which saw the potential great value of entries on the World Heritage List in terms of national and local prestige, and - not least - tourism marketing. However, the

¹⁶

The European countries that are parties to the World Heritage Convention are noted in Appendix I of this report.

Convention extends far beyond the World List. For example every State Party to it is obliged to develop effective systems of legal protection and positive conservation measures and programmes at the national level, and to undertake public education and information campaigns in relation to the value of the local, national and international natural and historic heritage.

- 2.15. Following the most recent (Cartagena, Colombia, 1993) meeting of the World Heritage Committee 28 European countries now have at least one cultural property on the World List. The numbers though vary greatly from one country to another (reflecting at least in part the level of resources made available at the national level to prepare the necessary national surveys, evaluations and documentation through to a formal application stage). Two European countries, France and Spain, already have 19 World Heritage List cultural entries each, followed by Germany (13), United Kingdom (11), Italy (8), Bulgaria, Russian federation and Turkey (all with 7 each), Portugal (6), Poland (5), and Norway (4). Seven European states have three cultural sites each (Czech Republic, Malta, Romania, Slovakia, Sweden, Switzerland, and the remaining parts of Yugoslavia), five have two each (Croatia, Cyprus, Finland and Hungary, while five more have just one cultural entry each (Albania, Holy See, Ireland, Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, and Ukraine)¹⁷.

¹⁷

A summary of the cultural World Heritage List entries for Europe, grouped by country, is included as Appendix II of this Report.

2.16. European regional organisations, notably the Council of Europe¹⁸ and the European Union¹⁹ have also developed important initiatives in relation to the physical patrimony. In the case of the Council of Europe, which has always had an explicit constitutional competence in relation to culture, these have included successive European Conventions on the Archaeological Heritage, the encouragement of international relations through town-twinning agreements and both student and adult exchanges, the Twenty Historic Towns initiative of the 1970s and early 1980s, a programme of national cultural policy evaluations from the mid 1980s onwards and continuing, while currently it is taking a leading role in monitoring the impact of armed conflicts in various parts of the former Yugoslavia.

2.17. During the various previous stages in the development of the present European Union prior to the current (1993) Treaty there were serious constraints on cultural initiatives due to a lack of an explicit constitutional competence in relation to the cultural sector. Also, the positions of Member States varied greatly on the issue, at least in relation to the establishment of significant levels of expenditure in the cultural sector. Despite this there have been a number of successful initiatives in relation to the physical patrimony, including the 'European Room' exhibition development grants to museums in the 1970s and early 1980s, the annual European City of Culture designation, and the provisions for the continuing

¹⁸ The current status of the States of Europe is indicated in Appendix I of this Report: a majority of European countries are now full Members of the Council, while most of the remainder have Observer status in relation to the Council.

¹⁹ Previously known successively as the European Common Market and then the European Community prior to the final ratification and bringing into effect of the Treaty of European Union ('Maastricht Treaty') in 1993.

protection of the national patrimonies of moveable cultural property in Member States following the removal of customs and other controls and checks from national frontiers between Member States at the end of 1993.

- 2.18. Several UNESCO recognised Non-Governmental Organisations have also been very active in promoting the protection and interpretation of the physical patrimony at the international level. The International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS), is specially recognised within the text of the World Heritage Convention itself, as is the International Conservation Centre in Rome (ICCROM)²⁰. Both assist the World Heritage Committee in the evaluation of proposals from States Parties for additions to the World Heritage List, while the International Council of Museums (ICOM) is very active in relation to both the development of museums and the protection of the moveable patrimony, especially in relation to international theft of, and illicit trafficking in, cultural property, and the protection of cultural property and museums in times of armed conflicts and both natural and civil disasters. The World Travel and Tourism Council (WTTC) represents the main commercial operators in the international travel trade. The WTTC has also been giving increasing attention to both the potentially negative effects of excessive tourist pressure on more popular cultural sites which happen to be located in regions of mass tourism. Most recently it too

²⁰

Strictly speaking ICCROM is an inter-governmental organisation, not a non-governmental organisation (NGO), since constitutionally the Members are the participating sovereign states. However, in practice most States nominate appropriate conservation experts as their voting delegates to both the General Assembly and to serve within ICCROM's internal governing structures and operationally ICCROM is much more like an NGO than an inter-governmental body.

has been campaigning about the damaging effect on both the patrimony and the tourist industry of recent armed conflicts in areas of both cultural and international tourism importance, such as Lebanon or the Adriatic coast of former Yugoslavia.

3. HISTORIC URBAN ENVIRONMENTS AND DEVELOPMENT

3. 1. Historic cities and towns of course, been central to much of traditional tourism since at least the days in which the so-called Grand Tour of the cultural centres of 18th century Europe was regarded as an essential part of the education of a well-bred young nobleman or gentleman. The traditional great historic centres remain central to tourism development in the historic regions of the world. Obvious examples south of the Alps include Rome, Venice, Florence, Athens and Istanbul (the historic New Rome or Constantinople), while the same is true of the major historic cities of northern Europe, such as Paris, London, Amsterdam, Cologne, St. Petersburg and many others. Indeed, urban environment cultural preservation and development schemes can be identified much earlier than this, as in the 16th century legal measures aimed at urban conservation in the Papal States, or the mid 16th century urban planning laws laid down by the Spanish Crown in relation to the development of the newly created Hispanic city of Puebla, south of Mexico City in New Spain.

3. 2. With the development of mass transportation from the second quarter of the 19th century onwards (particularly of reliable steamships and the building of long-distance railways) large scale 'heritage' rapidly developed, exploiting the growing curiosity (much of it deliberately engendered by the emerging tourism industry itself) about important natural and historic heritage localities and regions. Early examples included the opening up to organised mass tourism of whole regions such as the Swiss Alps, ancient Egypt or the Holy Land - all three of which were

opened by the English pioneer Thomas Cook²¹, the founder of mass tourism - or to individual important archaeological sites, for example the buried cities of Pompeii and Herculaneum (Italy), or the great Megalithic archaeology complexes of Stonehenge (England) and Carnac (France).

3. 3. Following each of the 20th century world wars, and especially in the aftermath of the widespread destruction in historic cities during the Second World War major rebuilding, restoration and conservation initiatives were seen in many parts of Europe, and in some of the most seriously devastated historic centres, such as Dresden, this primary rebuilding and restoration work is still in progress a full half century after the area bombing and firestorms that caused the destruction.
3. 4. It seems clear that there were a mixture of motives behind such post-war initiatives, and in particular the choice made in many places to restore or even to create what are for all practical purposes replica buildings (or even just replica facades) rather than take the opportunity (and usually far cheaper option) of carrying out a total clearance and redevelopment in a modern style. Often there were deep emotional reasons for such decisions.

²¹

Thomas Cook (1808 - 1892) ran his first railway charter excursion in 1841, and his business expanded into the creation of international 'package' tours out of the profits from his excursions to the first world trade fair, the Crystal Palace, London 'Great Exhibition' of 1851. His first major continental tourism initiative was a programme of tours from England to the 1855 Exposition Universelle in Paris on the first roundabout 'Cook's Tour', taking the travellers via Antwerp, Brussels, Cologne and Strasbourg. Larger-scale programmes of tours to Switzerland, (first pioneered in 1851), followed soon afterwards and were extended to Italy in 1864, to Egypt and the Holy Land in 1869 and the first Round the World Tour (with Cook himself as the tour leader) in 1872, (see Swinglehurst, 1982).

3. 5. For example, following its use as a headquarters building of the occupying force during the Seige of Leningrad, the great 18th century Russian Imperial Summer Palace of Petrovits, on the Gulf of Finland in what are now the suburbs of St Petersburg, the whole complex was blown up by the retreating German forces on the direct orders of Hitler. Even though all that remained was less than 40% of the outside walls of the main palace, and in spite of the grave economic crisis of the times Stalin immediately ordered that the buildings and gardens were to be fully restored regardless of cost in order to eliminate all traces of the handiwork of the invader. The work took over 30 years to complete, requiring immense resources, especially in terms of skilled labour. It took over 12 years' work using exact replicas of original 18th century handlooms to reproduce the silk damask needed to re-cover the walls of the relatively small Blue Salon, using a 60cm by 50cm fragment recovered from the ruins as a pattern, while it was estimated that 0.9 tonnes of pure gold were used for the gilding of the reproduced interiors, external roofs and not least the replicas of the bronze gilt garden statuary, fountains etc. removed and melted down by the German forces during the seige.
3. 6. However, although the original reasons for the decision to proceed with a full rebuilding were essentially political and cultural, with the opening up of Russia to international tourism on an ever-increasing scale from the mid 1970s, boosted by the 1980 Moscow Olympics, and particularly since the break-up of the USSR in 1991, there is no doubt that this initiative has been of very considerable

economic development benefit also in terms of income derived from international tourism.

3. 7. Similar sentiments were behind many other decisions taken by national and municipal authorities soon after World War II to proceed with restoration and rebuilding, even to the extent of creating total replicas, either of whole buildings or only of their facades. In the former German Federal Republic both the wartime bomb damage and losses and the postwar restorations and rebuildings have recently been published in great detail town by town²², while the very many other many notable examples that could be cited. These include the re-creation of the pre-war appearance of the ancient core of Warsaw, or Buda Castle in Budapest²³, of the medieval Guildhall and many historic City Churches and Livery Halls in the City of London, and the fifteen year programme of architectural history research and six years of rebuilding involved in re-creating the important 19th century Semper Oper opera house in the heart of Dresden²⁴.
3. 8. In fact the heritage movement does not seem to be at all purist in what is regarded as permissible and acceptable. Buildings 'restored' by total rebuilding

²² Besler & Gottschow, 1988 (2 volumes).

²³ However, modern buildings were constructed on most of the surrounding area and indeed on some individual sites within the Castle complex itself, including a very large modern luxury hotel.

²⁴ In the case of the Semper Oper barely 50% of the outside walls and nothing of the roofs or interiors survived the February 1945 fire storm, but the German Democratic Republic government and City authorities decided that the original appearance of all the public areas of the opera house should be replicated, including the wall and ceiling paintings and other interior decorations, though the stage and technical facilities and accommodation behind the proscenium arch are thoroughly modern, with far more space and the most sophisticated technical facilities.

or 'facadism'²⁵ frequently have extensive legal protection under planning law nowadays, on exactly the same basis as if the structures were original historic buildings, and not just twenty or thirty years old²⁶.

3.9. In such cases (and many hundreds of others that could be cited) the reconstruction projects were seen as not only cultural in their importance and impact, in terms of expressing or re-asserting traditional values and identities, but also developmental, playing an important economic role in the re-establishment of tourism in particular and probably in more general economic regeneration terms.

3.10. Thankfully however only a minority of important urban sites and townscapes have had to be re-constructed in this way following wartime destruction (or historic or more recent natural disasters such as the City of London after the Great Fire of London, the Bryggen Hanseatic City area of Bergen, Norway, after a succession of fires, or Lisbon after the great earthquake and fire). The great majority of the recent restorations and reconstructions have been in response to either natural processes of deterioration, or to make good the effects of insensitive (or worse)

²⁵ A fairly derogatory expression used to describe the practice of retaining or recreating only the facade to the main street or public square of a destroyed or demolished building, with the less visible parts being perhaps built in an entirely unrelated modern and unsympathetic architectural style, such as a modernist steel framed open plan office or department store structure behind a retained or replica street facade.

²⁶ Some historic townscapes that are in fact today almost total reconstructions of all or part of destroyed buildings are now included on the World Heritage List, as for example the heart of the historic centre of Warsaw and the largely timber-built medieval Hanseatic City townscape of Lübeck, north Germany, the original or which was in fact burned to the ground in the first Allied fire-storm bombing experiment of March 1942, (see for example Boylan, 1993A, p. 35 - 36, and Beseler & Gottschow, 1988).

redevelopments and planning policies (or a lack of them) of quite recent times.

3.11. For example, in the ancient small Catalunya port of Lloret de Mar a substantial and important Roman period fortification was totally demolished as recently as 1968 to facilitate the development of the modern tourist resort. However, less than a quarter of a century later local interests have realised that in the 1990s they need to create and project a much more varied and up-market tourism market for Lloret than the 'Sun, Sand, Sangria and Sex' image of the early phases of Costa Blanca mass international tourism of the 1950s and 1960s. Consequently, considerable efforts are now being made to build an authentic replica of the Roman ruins so recently demolished to create a new 'cultural tourism' attraction for the resort²⁷.

3.12. Of course, the successful promotion and exploitation of the built historic heritage as part of tourism development initiatives is by no means confined to areas that have been subject to major building conservation or reconstruction works. Income from visitors attracted by their historic and other cultural interests and values has been an important part of the economy and development of some of the great historic, artistic and educational centres of Europe for centuries. Obvious world-class examples include Florence, Venice, Rome and Naples in

²⁷ Such a move is not without precedent. Perhaps the most celebrated example is at the New England, USA, landing site of the Pilgrim Fathers at Plymouth. With nothing surviving from the early 17th century, and with all of the original site was entirely under the modern town, in the late 1940s it was decided to create a completely new 'Plimoth Plantation' on a site of similar size and topography approximately 3 miles east of the town, based on detailed archaeological and historical research into the original site. This has gradually built up to become one of the most popular cultural tourism destinations of the region.

Italy, Madrid and Seville in Spain, Paris in France, Cologne, Bonn, Munich, Nuremberg and Dresden in Germany, Vienna and Salzburg in Austria, Amsterdam and The Hague and Leiden in the Netherlands, and Brussels, Antwerp and Bruges in Belgium.

3.13. One of the world's most ambitious current development programmes led by physical patrimony initiatives is seen in Athens. The City suffered a long period of degradation in almost every aspect of the quality of urban life, including almost uncontrolled demolition and poor quality rebuilding through much of the post-war period, coupled with increasingly severe damage to the marble stonework of both ancient and more recent buildings due to increasingly severe air pollution caused by excessive traffic pollution and the widespread use of cheap, high sulphur, fuel oil for commercial and domestic heating systems throughout the City. Now a \$500 million programme of public works is under way within the City, including radical action to reduce traffic congestion, to improve air quality, to strengthen previously very weak urban planning policies and controls, and to develop new cultural facilities, with particular emphasis on cultural tourism. The latter include the creation of what will eventually be a 10 sq.km. Archaeological Park centred on the Acropolis, with a major new Acropolis Museum.

3.14. Already a substantial area immediately to the north of the Acropolis, covering an area of medieval (or earlier) streets with many fine Renaissance to late 19th century buildings though with numerous important archaeological sites and

historic monuments and early churches, has been successfully established as a new zone for conservation, urban renewal and traffic control, supported by an extensive programme of archaeological excavations and conservation on both redevelopment sites and existing preserved sites and monuments. This area has immediately attracted much tourism-related commercial developments, including restaurants, craft and souvenir shops, while new and improved cultural facilities are being developed by the public sector, including the creation of an excellent new music museum and major improvements to the visitor services and interpretation of established, but generally fairly neglected, archaeological sites²⁸.

3.15. Similar conservation and culturally related urban regeneration and development programmes have been seen in other important historic cities across Europe and beyond, (though few if any of these were as badly degraded as those of the equivalent historic core of Athens). Spanish examples include Bilbao²⁹ (where the Basque Government's current approved programme for the development of existing and new physical patrimony facilities including the new Guggenheim Museum of Modern Art totals more than 8 billion pesetas), and Barcelona in Spain.

3.16. What is claimed to be the largest Gothic period conservation zone in Europe is the so-called Barri Gòtic (Gothic Quarter) of Barcelona, (though in reality this is

²⁸ The information on recent and current developments in Athens is largely based on two recent study visits by the author and discussions with Greek officials and colleagues during these, but see also the recent summary of Olive Wakeman (1993).

²⁹ See for example Julia M. Gonzalez, 1993.

the same area as the Roman period walled city, and contains a number of highly important pre-Gothic Roman and Romanesque archaeological remains and buildings). In addition to a major programme of archaeological excavations (including some carried out underneath highly important standing medieval buildings such as parts of the Cathedral complex and the city museum), there has been a major investment in the creation of both new public cultural facilities. These have included the new Picasso Museum (installed in a highly important medieval palace, the Palau Aguilar), additional buildings of the Museu de la Cuitat, and restoration and conservation programmes (which currently include further work on the medieval Cathedral and Diocesan buildings complex, as well as several other splendid historic churches and palaces). Both building conservation and museological renewal is also in progress on one quite unparalleled survival, the 14th century Les Drassenes - a enormous covered Royal naval shipyard³⁰. The major public sector investments in the conservation and cultural development of the Barri Gòtic has prompted parallel private sector conservation and development on a very extensive and sympathetic scale, including in this case a wide range of sympathetic-scale shopping and similar developments which serve not only the ever-growing cultural tourism industry, but which have also served to boost the Old City's traditional role as the heart of the commercial life of Barcelona and its immediate region.

- 3.17. Another major success in using the physical patrimony to lead economic and social regeneration can be seen in the historic centre of Prague, virtually unique

³⁰

See for example Generalitat de Catalunya, 1993.

amongst the great historic centres of central Europe in being spared direct war damage. After the Second World War Prague suffered - along with the majority of European capital cities - extensive environmental degradation due to neglect of planning policies unsympathetic to its historic character, neglect and destructive conversions of many historic buildings, in-filling with large new buildings to unsympathetic (and mainly poor quality) modern designs, and destructive major highway schemes. This degradation of the historic environment was most marked at the upper end of Wenceslas Square, where the major urban motorway of the early 1970s (with several large modern buildings along it) cut off the splendid Royal Bohemian Museum and National Pantheon building of 1890 (now the Narodny - National - Museum) from the rest of one of the greatest public places of any European city.

3.18. However, from the early 1980s onwards much more enlightened planning and conservation policies began to prevail, with for example the start of major restoration work on several historically important buildings (particularly but by no means exclusively those used as museums), of the very large former Royal Palace complex, and in the former Jewish Ghetto, and this programme accelerated rapidly following the fall of Communism, despite the country's pressing financial problems.

3.19. Much of the rapid post-1990 expansion of cultural conservation and restoration measures have, of course, been about much more than conservation and restoration for purely architectural or economic reasons. They have in fact been

a very good demonstration of the increasing importance and value attributed to the physical patrimony in terms of the expression and promotion of cultural identity at the national, regional or local levels. Especially symbolic and important in Czechoslovak terms was the restoration of Wenceslas Square. As well as being the traditional commercial centre of the City from the 19th century onwards, it is the pre-eminent national centre of pilgrimage in relation to several key episodes in national history, most recently the resistance to the 1968 Soviet invasion and to the late 1980s demonstrations that lead to the fall of communism. The restoration and opening up of the Presidential (Royal) Palace complex and the restoring the portraits and busts of many historic figures of Bohemia's and Czechoslovakia's democratic tradition to the national Pantheon, (with the simultaneous consigning of those of communist politicians, officials and military personnel to the Narodny Museum's reserve collections) also carried a special symbolism in terms of the expression of national identity. In terms of the physical patrimony from the viewpoint of the tourist the recent restorations and revivals have rapidly restored Prague to its late 18th to early 20th century position as one of the great international cities of Europe, but for both the Czech peoples both at home and in exile these works have been of even greater national significance.

3.20. All of these, and very many other, traditional historic architectural centres have been rapidly developed in the past thirty to forty years of rapidly expanding mass tourism, and in most cases the built and artistic heritage plays an most important part in the economies of the cities, regions and countries concerned, with an every

increasing emphasis on diversification of the tourism 'product' notably through the rapid expansion of supporting activities aimed at broadening the appeal of the cultural centre (and the average length of stay of the visitor). This trend has been particularly marked in relation to the performing arts, especially in those countries where the traditional season for music and lyric theatre was short, (typically running only from early December to Passiontide in the case of predominantly Catholic countries such as Italy).

3.21. Very many examples could be cited of the development of the creation and expansion of summertime cultural festivals and similar activities in the various historic cities of Europe (and indeed other parts of the world). Compared with just a handful of major summer festivals and seasons before the Second World War (e.g. Salzburg, Austria, Bayreuth, Germany, and Glyndebourne, England) there are many hundreds of major international summer festivals across Europe, the largest being the Edinburgh International Festival with something approaching a thousand official and 'Fringe' events covering almost every conceivable area of cultural activity each August. Important more specialised ones include the Venice Biennale in the visual arts, and Florence's Maggio Musicale and the continuing Salzburg and Bayreuth Festivals in the field of classical music and lyric theatre.

3.22. However, culture-led economic and social development initiatives are now being seen in many parts of the world in cities and towns that are far removed from the traditional pattern of tourist attractions. A very early example was the City of

Bradford, a heavily industrialised town in northern England, dominated for at least 1½ centuries by the textile industry. In attempting to create a new image for the City in place of William Blake's early 19th century image of 'dark, satanic mills', over 25 years ago the City Council decided that particularly with its traditional woollen industry in steep decline Bradford could not compete with more affluent parts of the country head-on in terms of economic and social development. Hence it needed to establish a distinctive market 'niche' and chose culture - both historic and contemporary as its focus. Initially tourism development was not seen as a priority: indeed even within the City the idea of it becoming a major tourism centre was regarded as something of a joke.

- 3.23. Instead, Bradford emphasised its actual and potential cultural environment to create an image (and, to be fair, a reality) of a more attractive living environment in order to both retain sectors of the existing local population interested in having access to good cultural facilities, and also to encourage inward migration of business people willing to investment in and relocation their enterprises to the City³¹. One of the first steps was to seek special central government assistance for ambitious programmes of air pollution control measures and of grants to help pay for the cleaning of the City Centre's distinguished ensemble of late 19th

³¹

The then Chief Executive Officer of the Council even went so far as to make what would today be regarded as quite unacceptably sexist claim that in terms of attracting such inward investment by re-location of businesses from the comfortable areas of southern England the attitudes of the (middle class and middle aged) wives of proprietors and senior managers of the businesses was even more important than the attitudes of key workers, and hence the major block to relocations, and hence his key targets, were 'the managing director's wife'.

century civic buildings and commercial premises³². At the same time the City's new public cultural facilities were developed, including a new central library incorporating a small theatre, and a new Industrial Museum (in a restored historic industrial building complex). The City Council also restored an important historic theatre and - in a partnership between the City Council and the National Museum of Science and Industry - developed the large-scale and immensely popular National Museum of Photography, Film and Television.

- 3.24. In fact in 1974, during the period of these major cultural developments, the City boundary was greatly extended, bringing in large rural areas and several small historic towns, including Haworth, with its long-established tradition of large-scale literary tourist industry linked to the 19th century Brontë sisters³³, and a particularly fine volunteer-run preserved steam railway³⁴. Also within the city is one of Britain's finest 19th century planned industrial developments in the

³² The architectural quality and detailing of these had been almost totally invisible for most of this century because the pale yellow local sandstone which was the predominant building material had been turned completely black by soot and chemical pollution within a few years of the completion of each building.

³³ The small town of Haworth, on the edge of the moor that is the traditional setting of Emily Brontë's masterpiece *Wuthering Heights* (published in 1848), is second only to Shakespeare's Stratford-upon-Avon within England centre of literary tourism and pilgrimage, with a quarter of a million visitors a year to the Brontë Parsonage Museum, the former home of Charlotte (1816-1855), Emily (1818-1848) and Anne (1820-1849) Brontë, and many hundreds of thousands more visiting other features in the town including the Parish Church, where their father was perpetual curate from 1820 to his death in 1861, and the surrounding moorland.

³⁴ The Keighley and Worth Valley Railway, operated largely by volunteers enthusiasts, running from the town of Keighley up to the edge of the moors at Haworth, which also incorporates two fine transport museums along the line. The historic railway facility plus the Brontë 'industry' at Haworth provide together a full day excursion for both local residents within a one hour travel catchment area of around 4 million inhabitants, in addition to being one of the most popular attractions for tourists visiting the Leeds-Bradford area on holiday.

country - Saltaire, where the industrialist and philanthropist Sir Titus Salt established in 1851 an integrated complex of woollen mills, canal port, workers' housing and community facilities. Following the ending of their industrial use, the main Salt's Mill has been increasingly developed as an increasingly important exhibition centre for contemporary art³⁵, while the historic village was designated as one of the earliest Conservation Areas, and indeed was one of the first beneficiaries of the original cleaning of buildings initiative.

- 3.26. Close parallels to such uses of the physical patrimony to lead wider economic regeneration schemes can now be found in most other European countries, particularly in areas of urban decline following the closure or major contraction of traditional urban industries, as for example in several parts of the Ruhr valley of Germany and the declining coalfield areas of the France - Belgium border region³⁶ as well as in many other parts of the world³⁷.

³⁵ The artist, David Hockney, born and brought up in Bradford though long resident in California, has been a strong supporter of this initiative.

³⁶ Discussed under 'rural environments' in Chapter 4 below.

³⁷ Perhaps the most celebrated and most extensively researched is the waterfront area of Baltimore, U.S.A., which in less than ten years during the late 1970s and early 1980s was transformed from a crime-ridden zone of dereliction to one of the most heavily visited local community facilities and regional tourist attractions of the Mid-Atlantic region: see for example, David Harvey (editor), 1989.

4. HISTORIC RURAL ENVIRONMENTS AND DEVELOPMENT

4. 1. Of course, Europe's cultural heritage is by no means only an urban one. More than half a million years of hominid presence, and particularly the past 5,000 years or more of human settlement, has influenced and greatly modified almost all of the European land mass, with the possible exception of the highest summits of mountains and some parts of the high Arctic, where limited areas of primary forest and tundra may still survive. Consequently all significant terrestrial habitats and apparently 'natural' rural features of Europe probably have an important human history component in their development and current state. However, it is only in very recent times that there have been moves towards an understanding of these inter-relationships and to co-operation between those interested in 'natural' and 'cultural' conservation within Europe³⁸, and even today the need for cooperation and mutual understanding between the 'natural' and 'cultural' sectors is by no means universally accepted.
4. 2. Consequently the great majority of the rapidly growing number of conserved cultural sites and monuments across Europe are organised by what are primarily archaeological or historic conservation bodies, such as the Direction du Patrimoine of the Ministry of Culture and Francophony in France, the national

³⁸

The United Kingdom National Trust founded in 1895 (see para. 2.1 and footnote 3 above) was very exceptional in its period in giving equal weight in its constitution and programme to places of 'historic interest' as to those of 'natural beauty' and it was only in 1965 that what was probably the first local forum to attempt to bring together public and voluntary organisations involved in natural conservation, historic conservation and countryside recreation and sport, the East Yorkshire Conservation Committee, was initiated by the Hull Museums, England.

Department of Antiquities in Greece, the Historic Buildings and Monuments Commission ('English Heritage') on behalf of the Department of National Heritage, in England, by regional or local official bodies (e.g. Soprintendenzie in Italy, Ephorates in Greece, elected local authorities in many European countries), by the voluntary non-profit sector such as the English National Trust or by private landowners.

4. 3. Very many thousands of individual major archaeological and other historic sites located outside major urban areas are now recognised to be highly important parts of the cultural economy of their countries and localities, and it is in many ways invidious to cite an specific examples. However, obvious ones include many of the large number of great Classical period sites in rural settings that have been excavated, preserved and opened to the public in modern times in Italy and Greece. The same is true of virtually every one of the more than 40 other present-day countries that came under the direct or indirect influence of the classical Greek and/or Roman civilisations, such as the Emperor Hadrian's great Roman Wall right across northern England from sea to sea, marking the early 2nd century northern limit of the Empire, or the sophisticated Roman town of Caesar Augustus on the Rhine in northern Switzerland. From earlier periods preserved Prehistoric sites serving cultural tourism range from caves with Pleistocene art over 20,000 years old in France and Spain (the latter including the World Heritage List Grotto of Altamira), through the World Heritage List Stonehenge and Avebury prehistoric stone circles and related sites in England, similar period Megalithic monuments in many other places the such as the chambered tombs and

standing stones of France, Ireland, Scotland and the Scandinavian countries, the major series of Megalithic sites on Malta and Gozo, including the World Heritage Site of Ggantija, to excavated and reconstructed 'living history' Iron Age villages in England and Denmark.

4. 4. From the earlier medieval periods preserved rural archaeological sites similar in presentation to those of the prehistoric and classical periods are joined by an increasing number of surviving buildings. From the earlier periods these are perhaps predominantly religious, such as the ruins of isolated abbeys of contemplative monastic orders as at the World Heritage Sites of Fountains Abbey in northern England, Mont St. Michel in northern France and Mount Athos in Greece. In later periods these are joined by major rural fortifications, as seen in the Norman and Burgundian period fortifications of France and of Wales and the Welsh - English border country including the World Heritage List Edward 1st period castles of Gwynedd, the extraordinary succession of castles along the middle Rhine Valley, and numerous examples of major castles and fortified houses in most other parts of Europe, such as the numerous rural medieval castles of the Danish and Swedish Crowns.
4. 5. The significance of such monuments and sites has, of course, been recognised for very many years, though even in these areas there have been a growing number of important and mainly successful initiatives in developing the interpretation, presentation and - especially - the marketing of both individual sites and

monuments and groups of these. Good European³⁹ examples include many examples of successful themed touring routes linking related cultural attractions within a particular region such as the medieval Pilgrim's Way to the shrine of St Thomas à Becket at Canterbury, England, or the pilgrim route of Santiago de Compostela, Spain, both of which are on the World Heritage List.

4. 6. Also noteworthy is the increasing use of the new international standard 'brown signs' (to represent features of tourist interest) on major roads explaining and promoting the cultural patrimony of the regions being traversed by the road, perhaps most effectively developed on the French autoroute network. Another highway-linked joint promotion is that of the succession of great chateaux (in a wide range of different ownerships) of the middle Loire valley in France which is supported by an excellent, specially developed, CD-ROM based information system offered in a wide range of locations, including not only tourist information centres but also at each major rest area on the autoroutes within reasonable travelling distance of the Loire region.
4. 6. Historic landscapes which have a significant natural heritage conservation component or interest are increasingly being developed and interpreted in ways that enhance an understanding of the complex inter-relationships involved. There are several good examples in Hungary where efforts have been made to demonstrate and respond to the mutual dependence of the natural and human

³⁹ UNESCO's current major campaign in relation to the medieval Silk Road from Europe to China is another good example, though most of this route lies outside Europe.

occupation factors in creating and maintaining traditional landscapes and rural economies. These include the Hollokö historic alpine village and rural landscape (a World Heritage List site) in the Cserhát Mountains north of Budapest.

4. 7. A second Hungarian example is the area of marshy plain pastoral grasslands of the Hortobágy National Park in the low-lying sands of the Tisza valley west of Debrecen. This is one of the few large-scale representative survivors of an environment and social system that up to the early 20th century covered many thousands of square kilometres stretching across central Europe as far as the Russian Caucasus and the Ukrainian black earth steppes. Particularly important in the Hortobágy project are the preservation of the traditional large-scale cattle ranching estate system (and the many different human skills involved in working these in traditional ways), of the historic breeds of semi-domesticated animals that formed an integral part of the traditional land-use system, and the practical demonstrations of these techniques, and the integral interpretation centre and museum. A close parallel to this in many ways, though in a very different geographical setting, is the developing conservation and interpretation programme for the Camargue coastal marshes of the Rhone delta in southern France, with the tourism information and interpretation programmes coordinated by the Ecomusée de la Camargue.

4. 8. The rapid growth in interest in industrial archaeology over the past 30 years or so has led to many conservation, restoration and interpretation initiatives being undertaken in predominantly rural landscapes of industrial history interest. Early

examples of such conservation programmes, both initiated by the voluntary sector, included the historic mineral mining areas of Leadhills, southern Scotland, and of Morwellham and the Upper Tamar Valley in southwest England in the 1960s. However, perhaps the most spectacular example of all has been the progressive development over the past 25 years of the Ironbridge Gorge of the River Severn, near the border between central England and Wales. Here in 1715 Abraham Darby successfully smelted iron in a blast furnace (which still survives) using coal mined on the adjacent hill, rather than wood charcoal, and the technique was improved through successive developments of the blast furnace so that by the late 18th century the company had the skill and capacity to build the world's first large-scale cast iron bridge - which gave Ironbridge its modern name. More or less contemporary 18th century industrial features include a hill-top contour canal with an inclined plane boat lift, while in the early 19th century the area became important for ceramic production, both of high quality Coalport porcelain and of decorative glazed earthenware building materials such as tiles. The whole complex of more than 50 historic sites and buildings over an area of more than 40 sq.km. has been developed as a major tourist attraction by a semi-public body, the Ironbridge Gorge Museum Trust. The initiative has totally transformed the external image, and to a significant extent the economy, of its locality (the Telford New Town area of Shropshire) which suffered severe economic depression and high unemployment in the late 1960s and early 1970s due to the decline of the traditional mining and industrial jobs of the region.

- 4.9. There have been many attempts to repeat the cultural and economic success of Ironbridge, for example in the similar pioneering rural industrial region on Le Creusot - Monceaux-les-Mines in central France, with the decentralised network of historic industrial sites being managed by a similar body to the Ironbridge Gorge Museum Trust - the Ecomusée du Creusot. However, this has been less successful in terms of preserving the industrial monuments due to persistent opposition to the project from a significant part of the local population supported by many local politicians, anxious to avoid any sort of reminder of the lost industrial and economic base of the region's former prosperity⁴⁰, resulting in the decision to demolish and clear a number of the key industrial history sites and buildings originally proposed for preservation and site interpretation.
- 4.10. Far more successful has been the restoration and interpretation of the isolated late 18th century cotton mill communities of New Lanark, in the Clyde Valley, Scotland, and Styal, Cheshire, England. Both have similar settings in steep-sided valleys - reflecting the need for ample fast-flowing water for the original water-powered machinery, and each were notable not just for their industrial developments but also for the social and welfare systems developed by their enlightened owners and managers, the Gregg family at Styal and David Dale and his son-in-law Robert Owen at New Lanark. Owen's pioneering approach to both the social organisation of the workforce on co-operative lines, and to the direct provision

⁴⁰

There have also been increasingly vocal intellectual objections to such initiatives, questioning the truth and - especially - the balance of the 'storyline' that is being presented by what Robert Hewison, in his challenging polemic, termed the 'Heritage Industry' (Hewison, 1987).

of welfare facilities and benefits for the workforce, including housing, education and child welfare, was particularly significant and was known across the world by the early 1820s, attracting visitors from all over Europe (including the Emperor of Russia) and even North America, where imitations of New Lanark and its systems were established in Massachusetts and Pennsylvania before the end of the decade. The past two decades' restoration programme at New Lanark has given considerable prominence to the re-establishment of a viable local community through the re-habilitation of Dale and Owen's original residential tenements and other suitable buildings into modern residential accommodation in parallel with the restoration and interpretation work on the historic mills, water power system and community building such as the Institute for the Improvement of Knowledge of 1811 - a large building for community and educational activities very close in concept to that of a contemporary multi-purpose Arts Centre.

- 4.11. Joint marketing and promotion initiatives are also being actively developed in many places in relation to industrial history, as for earlier periods of the physical patrimony, in many parts of Europe. Examples include the bringing together many different locations and tourism attractions either on the basis of their specialised subject matter, as in the joint promotion nationwide of the United Kingdom's more than 100 preserved steam railways, or more usually on a local or regional basis.
- 4.12. A good example of regional cooperation is that between public authorities at the regional, departmental and local levels and both the voluntary and commercial

sectors in the Avesnois tourism promotion region of parts of the Nord Pas-de-Calais region of northern France (plus some projects in adjacent areas of western Belgium). Here more than 30 different localities and tourism attractions of cultural interest across an area of industrial decline are cooperating with public authorities and each other in promoting a range of features including historic industrial sites, medieval towns, practical production businesses such as craft potteries or working mills and more mainstream tourist facilities such as hotels and restaurants. Coordinated by the decentralised Ecomusée Fourmis the Avesnois consortium is focusing particularly on improving self-generation of income (e.g. through re-establishing production of the historic industrial or craft facilities) and on exploiting the very considerable potential market of knowledgeable industrial archaeology and history enthusiasts in southern England, now within easy reach of the Avesnois region and its facilities following the opening of the Channel Tunnel. A particularly interesting new development of the Avesnois initiative in relation to marketing the facilities in England has been the recent twinning of the Ecomusée Fourmis with the Kent Museum of Rural Life just outside Maidstone, the site of which is in fact now bisected by the upgraded M20 motorway serving the British terminal of the Channel Tunnel.

5. MODERN URBAN ENVIRONMENTS AND DEVELOPMENT

5. 1. The contemporary urban environment is now such an integral part of cultural activities and provision that only the merest outline of the possibilities and opportunities in the context of this report.

5. 2. Important forms of patronage of contemporary culture include architectural commissions, urban planning and both private and public art commissions. In a majority of European countries there is a well established system of architectural competitions for major new public works which give an opportunity for the consideration of new ideas and approaches. The ambitious programme of new museums built during the 1980s in many western German cities are highly significant in not only architectural as well as cultural terms, as is the ambitious programme of cultural 'grand projets' in France, including the Parc de La Villette⁴¹, the Bastille Opéra and the new National Library.

5. 3. Some European countries have well developed arrangements for the support of the plastic arts, particularly but by no means exclusively linked to new building works, such as 'Percent for Art' schemes under which the promoter of a new building or urban development scheme is expected to allocate a sum equal to 1%

⁴¹ Including the new national science museum - the Cité des Sciences et de l'Industrie and the Gèode (Omnimax theatre), the Cité de la Musique including the new building for the National Conservatoire, as well as the 25 hectare park and its smaller buildings, architectural follies and public sculpture.

of the total building etc. cost as a minimum for visual art commissions and purchases.

5. 3. Particularly significant recent initiatives have included a series of major commissions by the City of Birmingham, England, related to its major new Symphony Hall and adjacent International Convention Centre, including the creation of the largest completely new public square to be developed in Europe this century, over which the decorative paving is a major public art work by the English artist Tess Jaray. An earlier example was the substantial re-modelling of the south side of the 'Platform Beaubourg' adjacent to the Pompidou Centre, Paris, with the large assemblage of water-related sculptures by Ives Tinguely and Nikki Saint-Phaere. There are also a growing number of 'temporary public art' initiatives in public places in many cities and towns across Europe, both of already created works, especially sculptures, and specially commissioned works.
5. 4. France has gone further than this with the establishment as partnerships between the Ministry of Culture's contemporary art unit⁴² and regional authorities of a wide range of programmes, particularly the 'FRACs'⁴³, for the support of contemporary art commissions for both new developments and for existing buildings and sites.

⁴² Délégation des Arts Plastiques.

⁴³ Fonds Régionaux d'Art Contemporain.

5. 5. The European Community/European Union's programme of designating an annual European 'City of Culture' (on the nomination of each national government in rotation) has been one of the Community's major successes in the cultural field. Although some of the cities designated so far have been important capitals or otherwise well established cultural tourism centres, some more imaginative nominations have been made, with the aim of cultural decentralisation and diversification.
5. 6. A particularly good example was that of Glasgow, Scotland, the United Kingdom's nomination for 1990. A proud and prosperous international trading and manufacturing city in the late 19th century, Glasgow had suffered a progressive and serious decline both economically, socially and - especially - in terms of its national and international image more or less continuously from the end of the First World War onwards.
5. 7. In many respects the popular external image of Glasgow was an unfair one, especially in cultural terms. Its Education Department had a very progressive reputation in art and music education, while the City Museums and Art Galleries and their outstanding collections comprised much the most important local authority service of its kind in the British Isles, a reputation that was greatly enhanced with the opening of the Burrell Collection in 1983, while the various theatres (especially the Citizen's Theatre⁴⁴), the regular seasons of Scottish Opera, and an ambitious all the year round orchestral concert programme were

⁴⁴ See Michael Coveney, 1990, in particular.

all very much 'metropolitan' rather than 'provincial' in scale. However, Glasgow's local authority initiatives even with a 52 weeks a year programme was seen outside the city as lacking the prestige and cachet of Edinburgh with its 'national' cultural institutions such as the Scottish National Gallery, National Museums of Scotland, and - from the late 1940s onwards - the August Edinburgh International Festival.

5. 8. In fact, from the early 1980s start of Glasgow's serious campaigning to reposition the City in terms of its external image, its cultural facilities, both historic and contemporary, were seen by the City Council as one of its strongest selling points, particularly from the opening of the Burrell Collection museum. Indeed, Glasgow Museums were perhaps the first in Britain to successfully develop effective marketing links with the hotel and hospitality centre, through a partnership with the Glasgow-based Stakis Hotels group, which successfully marketed excellent value packaged museum weekend breaks, centred on the new Burrell museum, to both individuals and (especially successfully) to both special interest and general affinity groups.

5. 9. In the campaign building up to 1986 submission of its bid for the UK candidature for the 1990 'European City of Culture' designation Glasgow rapidly developed the physical facilities for its cultural services as well as their promotion both locally and within a wider region. For example, plans were made for a new building for the Royal Scottish Academy of Music and Drama, complete with two new medium-sized concert and recital halls and a lyric theatre, and for moving

the Transport Museum to the central Kelvin Halls, thus releasing its former tram depot building for community arts uses. (Peter Brook's use of the space for large-scale theatre demonstrated the great potential of this, and lead directly to the creation of The Tramway as a major national venue.) Glasgow City Council had also agreed in 1985 to support the Policy Studies Institute analysis of the economic impact of the arts in Britain, and a special study volume on Glasgow was published in 1988⁴⁵, demonstrating amongst other things that the cultural 'industries' contributed in excess of £200 million per year to Glasgow's economy - compared with a total public sector⁴⁶ annual 'investment' of well under £20 millions a year - implying a more than 10-fold 'gearing'.

5.10. The United Kingdom government through the 1980s supported for urban regeneration and redevelopment (through amongst other things) the promotion of large-scale Garden Festivals on derelict land. As part of its overall regeneration strategy Glasgow took advantage of this, winning the national competition for the 1988 Garden Festival. Other initiatives included the adoption and implementation of a city-wide Public Art Policy⁴⁷.

5.11. Of course Glasgow's overall cultural development strategy and in particular its role as the 1990 'European City of Culture' extended far beyond the physical

⁴⁵ John Myerscough, 1988B; see also Peter Booth and Robin Boyle, 1993.

⁴⁶ Glasgow City Council and Strathclyde Regional Council services and grants, plus Arts Council of Great Britain and Scottish Arts Council grants to Glasgow-based cultural organisations.

⁴⁷ Peter Booth and David Harding, 1987.

heritage field: in fact the performing arts and community arts activities were predominant, and the overall impact has recently been assessed in a substantial academic study which both documents the role of the cultural sector in attempts to regenerate Glasgow both socially and economically through the 1980s, and in particular attempts to evaluate the impact of the substantial investment involved (over £50 million) and the impact of the Year of Culture in cultural, social and economic terms⁴⁸.

⁴⁸

Peter Booth and Robin Boyle, 1993.

6. *THE MOVEABLE PHYSICAL PATRIMONY: MUSEUMS AND COLLECTIONS*

6. 1. There is also a very important contribution to culture and development from the 'moveable' evidence of the heritage - historical objects of every conceivable kind including works of art, though art has been only a minor element in the overwhelming proportion of recent museum developments orientated towards cultural development compared with history and (to a lesser extent) the natural environment. Single artefacts, collections and museums frequently carry a special significance in cultural and social terms, as do other aspects of the intangible patrimony of a geographical area of a distinct cultural group of people, including the cultural traditions and practices. Even before the end of the 19th century in many parts of Europe there was growing recognition of the need to record, reflect and communicate visually the heritage of the ordinary people, especially of rapidly changing rural communities.

6. 2. In the United Kingdom the response to these concerns was perhaps primarily in written form, whether literary or musicological - the recording of folk traditions and folk songs for example. However, some other parts of Europe, especially Scandinavia, this was accompanied by a serious concern to record and preserve the material culture of a changing society as well, leading to the early development of social history collections and museums. Though the main explosive growth of heritage tourism linked to the historic patrimony including museums has been very recent, in some places these initiatives began surprisingly early. Pioneering examples of 'open-air' museums oriented towards rural life and based

on re-located traditional buildings grouped together on a single site, were established before the end of the 19th century in the case of the Sweden-wide Skansen in the centre of Stockholm, and Maihaugen at Lillehamer, which focuses only on its immediate locality, the Gulbrandsdal Valley of central Norway.

6. 3. These pioneers now have many imitators across the world, though still predominantly in northern Europe and the United States. Important more recent projects with a strong community and economic development role include the Ulster Folk and Transport Museum at Cultra, and the Ulster-American Folk Park at Omagh, both in Northern Ireland, the Zuider Zee Museum and the Arnhem national open air museum, both in the Netherlands, and the leading French open-air museum, the Ecomusée de Haut-Alsace in a former salt-mining region of eastern France.
6. 4. However, it is perhaps to the United States that one should turn for key models of development in this field. Before the nation was a hundred years old the historic sites relating to early east coast settlement, to the Revolution and to the Civil War were already places of both pilgrimage and tourism, and before the end of the 19th century the Federal government had established the first national Parks protecting and making available to the public both natural and historic localities of national importance. Both the U.S. National Parks Service and the American National Trust had developed by the 1940s if not earlier outstanding and pioneering traditions of both natural and historic site visitor interpretation which have been of great influence through the world, notably in Europe. For example, when in 1972 the Leicester City Museums Service, England, was commissioned

undertake the first English battlefield interpretation project at Bosworth Field⁴⁹, the U. S. National Parks Service was the main model of how to successfully interpret an historic battle in its original geographical setting.

6. 5. The past two to three decades have seen three particularly relevant major trends throughout much of the so-called developed countries, particularly non-Communist Europe and North America. The first of these trends has been the precipitous decline in traditional extractive and manufacturing industries - probably marking the end of the Industrial Revolution that began in the late 18th century. This collapse of traditional industries and employment patterns has led in many areas to massive changes in the economic and social conditions of regions that have depended (and prospered) for a century or more on activities such as coal mining, iron and steel production, heavy engineering, ship-building and textile manufacturing.
6. 6. This has led directly to the rapid growth of attempts by public authorities in many regions of the world at the local, regional and national levels to create and develop new kinds of economic and social intervention within the service sector to counter the effects on such regions of industrial decline. Meeting the needs of the local or regional economic and social agenda was consequently the first consideration in the early stages of the present phase of heritage tourism and museum developments. Examples initiated in the 1960s already mentioned above

⁴⁹

Where King Richard III was killed in 1485 - immortalised by Shakespeare and traditionally regarded in English history as marking the end of the Middle Ages.

in the context of rural cultural development included the Ironbridge Gorge Museum complex in the former coal-mining area of the Severn valley, and in the early 1970s, the French Ecomusée du Creusot in a region whose economy traditionally was based on the manufacture of armaments and other heavy engineering products in a secure region far from the coasts and frontiers. However, the local social mission of such museum-centred projects was soon extended to include the development of new tourist facilities as a key element of their programmes.

6. 7. The third trend of the past few decades has been a growing concern amongst museum professionals, academics and the public at large, that the drastic changes seen to be taking place in industrial and employment activity should be reflected in museums through an energetic social agenda. Common methods used include developments preserving key sites, buildings, and historic equipment associated with dying industries, together with the evidence of the social structures and working methods that are being lost, probably for ever. This concern has led in many countries to the development of large numbers of completely new kinds of museums and museum-related heritage activities, reflecting and recording these massive changes in the economic and social structures of the regions and localities concerned. In the United Kingdom alone, the past 20 years has seen the creation of over fifty new preserved steam railway museums, at least as many historic (mainly military) aircraft museums and collections, almost 20 museum projects on former mining sites, and perhaps 200 or more other new museums and related interpretation facilities on preserved historic industrial and agricultural

sites. What has distinguished much of the British explosive growth of recent years from that of many other countries is the dominant role of local enthusiasts working voluntarily for their own local or specialised museum or preservation scheme.

6.8. However, non-traditional origins and organisational structures are becoming increasingly common in other parts of Europe also. This is especially so in Scandinavia where - amongst many examples that could be cited - voluntary organisations such as the Danish Vintage Aircraft Club has established an excellent 'working' aviation museum on a regional airport in Jutland, and the trade union movement has been active in the creation and running the pioneering Museum of Work at Norkopping, Sweden, and local historical societies and groups of enthusiasts have developed numerous local community museums, especially in Norway. It is also fascinating to note that in the former Soviet Union while the Soviet and Republic Culture Ministries were immensely proud of the fact that official museums increased from less than 50 at the time of the Russian Revolution to over 1,500 by the late 1980s, a survey in 1987 discovered that there were over 14,000 unofficial museums in the USSR, mainly established and run by a wide range of enthusiast groups⁵⁰.

6.9. Right across Europe existing museum services and organisations hoping to establish new museums and preservation schemes in both the public and voluntary sectors have been quick to see the considerable potential offered by the very large

⁵⁰

See Patrick J. Boylan 1990B.

amount of public investment funds that are being made available in many countries to assist with the economic reconstruction of the regions of industrial decline, including the development of new tourism facilities. With the ever-increasing demands of tourists for more interesting and challenging activities many museums and related heritage facilities have sought to match their museological ambitions to relevant economic regeneration and tourism development programme opportunities. Showing in many cases great entrepreneurial vision and innovative approaches to management, many museums - both public and private - have therefore moved quickly (and generally highly successfully) to exploit these new financial opportunities by devising development schemes which fit into the local, regional or national programmes of economic regeneration, employment substitution and - particularly - tourism development. Many have thus attracted substantial new funds from both local and national sources and through international social development and aid programmes (especially the European Community's Regional and Social Funds in western Europe, and as integral parts of various World Bank economic and tourism schemes in developing countries).

- 6.10. The hectic pace of such recent developments, and the limited period of their operation so far, has made proper evaluation of their longer-term economic and museological effects difficult and premature, though proper long-term research must be seen as one of the highest priorities. However, two things are already clear. First, that some of these new initiatives have been extremely successful not just in the narrower economic, preservation and educational terms, but also in

changing the image of the of their regions. Ironbridge, already mentioned, is a good example of a museum-led heritage development that has changed quite fundamentally the image of a run-down region. Secondly, and in contrast with this, it is equally clear that simply investing large amounts of money in creating a new tourist attraction does not guarantee success: the appalling scale of Euro Disneyworld's financial losses in its first year of operation is proof of that. A U.K. example on a smaller scale, and within the more traditional museum world, is the experience of the 'independent' Chatterley Whitfield Mining Museum in the English Midlands. This has recently gone bankrupt after less than ten years' existence, despite a direct and indirect public expenditure investment totalling more than £4 million - mainly from funds and services provided by the nationalised coal industry and the Employment Ministry.

- 6.11. In planning new museum and heritage facilities as part of economic development or tourism proposals requires much serious and realistic museological and marketing research before the viability of a proposal can be forecast with any degree of accuracy. Simply copying an outstanding success elsewhere is rarely if ever sufficient. The Jorvik Centre in York, England, with its famous 'dark ride' backwards through a thousand years to a life-size reconstruction of the period of the City's Viking occupation as discovered in the archaeological excavation of the site, has remained an outstanding success ever since its opening in 1984. However, not a single one of the many imitations of the concept using similar techniques in different locations around the world, several of them developed by the same creative team that were so successful with Jorvik, has

matched Jorvik's economic success. Bluntly, none of the localities chosen matched either York's unique tourism development circumstances of that time, nor offered a subject as interesting and exciting, romantic even, as the Coppergate excavation of the heart of Viking York to interpret.

6.12. Nor is the location necessarily a guarantee of success: in marketing terms the 'product' offered must both appeal to the potential audience and be successfully marketed in terms of publicity and other promotion and - not least - the perceived value of the experience offered in terms of both the visitor's time and both the direct and indirect cost of visiting. In the restored early 19th century waterfront of Boston, Massachusetts, a large Transport Museum went bankrupt and the collections were sold by the creditors to pay off the museum's debts within two or three years of its opening in the early 1980s, even though the re-located Boston Children's Museum occupying the other half of the same restored historic building was, and remains, an outstanding success, and is now undertaking its third major extension since the failure of its former neighbour. Another example that can be quoted is Euro Disneyworld's gross miscalculation of the percentage of the hundreds of millions of potential visitors within the target catchment area that would actually regard the Disney 'experience' as worthwhile in cultural terms (under any circumstances, and regardless of price).

6.13. Also, there are well-documented examples of even modest scale economically motivated museum initiatives facing strong opposition from the local population that they are claimed to be serving. In some cases the objections may be on

environmental grounds. The opening of the open air museum park of the Zuider Zee Museum in the Netherlands, already mentioned, was delayed for several years by legal objections to any increase in tourism from the local town and people of Enkhuisen, resulting in the museum's main entrance being closed and replaced by a compulsory water bus service from a new entrance and parking area 3 miles away. In other cases there may be strong objections to the preservation of an abandoned historic industrial enterprise from former workers themselves. Some may be bitter and feel a strong sense of betrayal of their industry and their enterprise by the former management or by government following a controversial closure of the factory or mine. Others may simply want to see a fundamental change in the image of the town and region following the collapse of a traditional industry, and in either case may be hostile to anything that serves as a reminder of the area's industrial past.

- 6.14. Those museologists and social or industrial historians who have a very romantic image of the social cohesion and comradeship of traditional mining industries and their labour forces have in several recent cases been both mystified and horrified that it has been the unemployed former workers, whose history, lives and values the museum is intended to celebrate, who have been at the centre of opposition to preservation and museum proposals. (Such problems have arisen in several British coal-mining areas). Partly at least, such opposition to the romantic image presented by most industrial museums is justified. At the most, only a tiny fraction of the industrial preservation projects established so far have managed to reflect the truth and reality of what they claim to preserve and exhibit, and even

in these few cases some aspects of the truth - such as dangerous past working conditions and the noise, dirt and pollution of historic production methods can never be preserved or reproduced again, because they would be totally illegal under modern safety and environmental protection standards. The average large-scale late 19th century or early 20th century coal mine had dozens of deaths a year, for example, whilst in relation to the dangers of sea fishing no one has summaries the position more graphically than Sir Walter Scott, 'It's not fish you are buying, it's men's lives'.

- 6.15. In planning any new museum or site preservation and interpretation scheme as part of such economic development initiatives it is therefore important to work very closely with the local community at all levels in order reflect as far as possible the genuine wishes and hopes of the local population. Only in this way can the - perhaps understandable - negative attitudes to the proposals be minimised. To have any chance of long-term success, every museum or preservation project of this type must develop a strong sense of 'ownership' among local people, including those who have lost their jobs due to the run-down and closure of the traditional industries to be represented in the museum. It is equally important to be aware of the risk of strong campaigning against the project from those who reject the project on ideological, environmental or sentimental grounds. As has already been mentioned this has arisen from time to time in relation to the planned network of decentralised preserved sites and branch museums as part of the Ecomusée du Creusot's long-term development plan. In fact in less than 20 years the majority of the important historic sites

originally preserved and interpreted as part of the Ecomusée du Creusot project have been deliberately destroyed as a result of local democratic decisions following strong opposition by the local population to their preservation.

- 6.16. There is one other important trend emerging among some of the new generation of economic development-related museums, particularly those with an industrial history theme, and one that seems likely to grow substantially. This is the aim to integrate the museum's conservation and education programme with the widening of its sources of income through the maintenance or re-establishment of industrial - or at least craft - production. Very many long-established historic farm museums have of course always aimed to sell either to visitors or to specialist markets (e.g. 'organic' food stores) their surplus agricultural products and animal stock, as at the Ecomusée of Haut-Alsace in France. The historic Mill Green Museum water-powered corn mill at Hatfield, England, supplies about 1 tonne of organic stone-grown flour a week to a local specialist baker in addition to flour sales to museum visitors, while the Ecomusée Fourmis and its associates in the Avesnois development project already mentioned offers a wide range of traditional local food products including honey, cider and bier du garde. More unusually, the Staffordshire County historic farm museum in central England has been researching, developing and storing genetic material relating to rare and historic breeds of farm animals for more than a decade, and is now recognised as one of the leading suppliers for high grade breeding stock of rare and historic breeds and also for related specialised genetic material such as semen for artificial insemination.

6.17. Many other museums, both long-established, and - especially - the new generation of economic development museums - have set up active programmes to preserve, demonstrate and teach traditional crafts and production methods. Some examples of these are of course familiar to almost every visitor to rural life museums in particular: craft pottery-making, basket making, wood-working, blacksmithing and similar traditional crafts are seen almost everywhere, and the income from either direct sales by the museum itself or from a sales commission of between perhaps 20% to 50% on sales by private craft enterprises located within the museum are in some cases important elements of the museum's total income. The national Handloom and Crafts Museum of India invites about thirty different craftspersons at a time to come to Delhi from every region of India to spend between two weeks and up to about six months at a time in the museum demonstrative a very wide range of traditional crafts, textile production and artistic practices. Their expenses and a modest honorarium are paid, and at the same time they are offered the opportunity of selling their production direct to the many tens of thousands of visitors to the Museum (which is in fact located on the very large national exhibition and commercial trade fair park in the centre of New Delhi).

6.18. Other newer industrial museums developed as part of economic development programmes have moved on to re-establish industrial-scale production using historic machinery and techniques. Examples include the production of traditional cotton or woollen (as appropriate) fabrics for commercial sale at Styal Mill in northwest England or the Swansea Industrial Museum, Wales, the manufacture of traditional steel and iron garden tools in Sheffield, England, and in Saxony,

Germany. (Interestingly, the latter was well-established under the former German Democratic Republic system, long before the fall of communism and German reunification.)

6.19. There is much evidence that heritage and museum developments can play a significant role in plans for economic development, whether as part of general tourism initiatives, or more specifically in relation to the regeneration of regions of great industrial decline and change. Such new facilities also have some direct economic benefits to the area served through the creation of employment opportunities. However, it is important to avoid exaggeration of this aspect of such projects, as one final example shows.

6.20. From 1984 onwards the Museums, Arts and Records Service of the Leicestershire County Council, in central England, was responsible for the planning and implementing development of the largest completely new science museum to be built in England for more than 40 years. On the 50 hectare site of the former Snibston Mine, with over 10,000 square metres of exhibition space, the Snibston Discovery Park in Leicestershire, central England, finally opened in 1992⁵¹. The site was a very important one historically: the former coal mine had been developed by the railway and mining pioneers George and Robert Stephenson in 1832-33 on their Leicester and Swannington Railway. (The engines built for this line were the first standardised production locomotives designed and built

⁵¹ See Patrick J. Boylan, 1990A.

anywhere in the world, and by 1837 the designs were being built under licence from the Stephensons at Le Creusot in France and by 1839 in the USA.)

6.21. At its peak production period the coal mining industry in the area must have employed over 30,000 men, In the late 1960s the Snibston Mine alone employed over 2,000 people, and at the time of its purchase by the Leicestershire Museums soon after the National Coal Board announced its planned closure it still employed over 900, most receiving very high salaries by local standards. During its construction and development phase the integrated new museum, industrial and ecological park developed on the site offered a maximum of 100 jobs at any one time, and now that is completed the Snibston Discovery Park employs directly less than fifty people, (a number of them former employees of the mine), most of whom probably earn less than half the current salary of a miner. Even if we add an allowance for the estimated additional jobs created (or saved) in the local commercial sector as a result of the creation of the museum (restaurants, shops, transport and motoring services), it is unlikely that the whole project has created more than 100 to 150 jobs - certainly less than 10% of the number of jobs lost through the closure of the mine. The same kind of ratio must be applicable in the case of the great majority of historic industrial site museums across the world, even where there is a quite aggressive commercial exploitation philosophy.

6.22. However, there can be benefits beyond the direct creation of replacement employment which can and should be quoted. Public (and indeed private) investment in such prestige projects can be used very effectively as evidence that

the area of economic and industrial decline has a real future, and is not going to be simply abandoned. In the case of the Snibston project just mentioned, the total public investment to date has been only £10 million: about £6 million directly from the Leicestershire County Council, its promoter - and the rest indirectly from the Government through various special schemes, including derelict land reclamation and unemployment relief programmes. However, the total investment in the approximately 130 sq. km. area of coalfield closure over the same period was of the order of £50 million to £80 million from public and private sources combined. These included highway, public transport, water and sewerage improvements, derelict land reclamation, the establishment of England's first new national forest for over 100 years, other new educational and tourism initiatives (including five new smaller industrial and community museums and preserved sites), and the development by the private sector of several large-scale industrial and commercial zones, which have between them created many hundreds of new jobs, including a significant proportion in the high technology field.

- 6.23. It would be absurd to claim that all of these new initiatives have come about solely because of the creation of the major new educational and tourism facility at Snibston. The location is outstanding in relation to the national road network, and this made Snibston such an attractive location from the point of view of the Leicestershire Museums. (The site has over 20 million people living within the comfortable day excursion distance of not more than two hours' driving each way - much larger than the comparable statistic for Euro Disneyworld's Marne La Vallée site - and the Service had a quite serious take-over bid for the whole site

from a commercial theme park developer before the first phase of building development was completed). Such a location was, of course, equally attractive for the establishment of many types of commercial activity, particularly regional and national distribution centres. However, interviews with industrialists and developers showed that the museum development was seen as an enormous vote of confidence in the locality on the part of the public authorities involved, especially the County Council and District Council, and that this had been a very significant factor in their calculations of the development potential of the area, and - very soon - in the values of property and development land in the area. (This latter factor had been well documented more than a decade earlier at Ironbridge, where both domestic and commercial property values increased greatly through the 1970s as the Museum development moved forward and transformed the image of the locality in both environmental and social terms.)

7. FUTURE PROSPECTS

7. 1. In conclusion, I believe it is clear that the physical heritage, particularly publicly accessible projects including historic and modern urban environments and rural landscapes, as well as museums and interpretation facilities based on preserved sites and related developments, have already played an important role in economic and social development, particularly though by no means exclusively in relation to areas of potential for tourism development. However, enthusiasm engendered by the many successes have to be balanced against some past failures and likely future failures (admittedly much fewer in number), resulting from inadequate research, particularly market research, a lack of a clear vision of the mission of the proposal and - perhaps above all over-optimism about the project's longer-term development and market potential.

7. 2. In this field of heritage facility planning above perhaps all others it is still far too easy to 'solve' the problem of a forecast shortfall in the budget by making unrealistic and un-achievable estimates of the levels of visitors or of admission charges (and frequently of both at the same time). One of the problems is that this is a highly specialised area of museum and tourism development in which there is only a limited amount of experience and expertise worldwide so far, and very few projects of this kind have been subjected to rigorous planning evaluation whether before or after the facility has been developed and opened to the public. Also, in far too many cases mere imitation of a success elsewhere has been regarded as all that was needed to ensure viability.

7. 3. In far too many cases across the world such initiatives have been led by politicians, urban planners or economic development experts, with the experienced specialists being recruited much too late in the development process to influence key policy decisions. Nevertheless, there is still much potential for such developments where these are professionally conceived, planned and directed with a sense of economic realism, and - not least - the degree of intellectual truth and integrity that only properly educated, trained and experienced professionals in the relevant fields can bring to the development team.

7. 4. With the 'cultural industries' and tourism amongst the fastest growing sectors of the world economy there are going to be more and more initiatives aimed at expanding and developing the role of the cultural sector in general and the physical heritage, both immovable and movable, in particular. Ultimately limits will be reached, and indeed in some developed countries (notably the United States and the United Kingdom) serious questions are already been asked about the viability of even the present numbers of heritage 'attractions' such as museums, monuments and sites, with suggestions that new facilities in areas already well-provided with such facilities simple re-distribute amongst the existing and new attractions a level of visiting and use that is already near to or at saturation point⁵². In marked contrast, however, in many less developed parts of the world there is still a vibrant, expanding, future in prospect.

⁵²

In the UK both the Museums and Galleries Commission, the government's official advisory body, and the National Committee of the International Council of Museums have very recently argued that the national priority should now be the maintenance and improvement of existing museums and galleries, not the creation of any new ones.

APPENDIX I

INTERNATIONAL COMMITMENTS OF EUROPEAN STATES

UNITED NATIONS MEMBER

Y = Yes

UNESCO MEMBER

Y = Yes

COUNCIL OF EUROPE MEMBER

M = Member; O = Observer

HAGUE CONVENTION, 1954

R = Ratified; A = Acceded; S = Ratification or succession as a successor state

WORLD HERITAGE CONVENTION

R = Ratified; S = Ratification or Accession as a successor state

COUNTRY	UN MEM- BER	UNESCO MEMBER	COUNCIL OF EUROPE MEMBER	HAGUE CONVEN- TION	WORLD HERITAGE CONVEN- TION
ALBANIA	Y	Y	O	A	R
AUSTRIA	Y	Y	M	R	-
BELGIUM	Y	Y	M	R	-
BOSNIA AND HERZOGOVINA	Y	-	O	-	-
BULGARIA	Y	Y	M	A	A
CROATIA	Y	-	O	S	S
CYPRUS	Y	Y	M	A	A
CZECH REPUBLIC	Y	Y	M	R	A
DENMARK	Y	Y	M	-	R
ESTONIA	Y	Y	M	-	-
FINLAND	Y	Y	M	-	R
FRANCE	Y	Y	M	R	A
GERMANY	Y	Y	M	R	R
GREECE	Y	Y	M	R	R
HOLY SEE	-	-	-	A	A
HUNGARY	Y	Y	M	R	R
ICELAND	Y	Y	M	-	-
IRELAND	Y	Y	M	-	R
ITALY	Y	Y	M	R	R

COUNTRY	UN MEM- BER	UNESCO MEMBER	COUNCIL OF EUROPE MEMBER	HAGUE CONVEN- TION	WORL HERIT CONV TION
LATVIA	Y	Y	O	-	-
LIECHTENSTEIN	Y	-	M	A	-
LITHUANIA	Y	Y	M	-	A
LUXEMBOURG	Y	Y	M	R	R
MACEDONIA (FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC)	Y	-	O	-	-
MALTA	Y	Y	M	-	A
MOLDOVA	Y	-	O	-	-
MONACO	-	Y	-	R	R
NETHERLANDS	Y	Y	M	R	A
NORWAY	Y	Y	M	R	R
POLAND	Y	y	M	R	R
PORTUGAL	Y	Y	M	-	R
ROMANIA	Y	Y	M	R	A
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Y	Y	O	R	R
SAN MARINO	Y	-	M	R	R
SLOVAK REPUBLIC	Y	Y	M	S	S
SLOVENIA	-	-	M	S	-
SPAIN	Y	Y	M	R	A
SWEDEN	Y	Y	M	R	R
SWITZERLAND	-	Y	M	A	R
TURKEY	Y	Y	M	A	R
UKRAINE	Y	Y	O	R	R
UNITED KINGDOM	Y	-	M	-	R
YUGOSLAVIA	Y	Y	-	R	R

*APPENDIX II**EUROPEAN CULTURAL PROPERTIES ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST
(with date of inclusion)**ALBANIA*

Bitrinti (1992)

BULGARIA

Boyana: Church (1979)

Madara: Rider (1979)

Kazanlak: Thracian tomb (1979)

Ivanovo: Rock-hewn churches (1979)

Nessebar: Ancient city (1983)

Pila: Monastery (1983)

Svechtari: Thracian tomb (1985)

CZECH REPUBLIC

Prague: Historic centre (1992)

Cesky Krumlov: Historic centre (1992)

Telc: Historic centre (1992)

CROATIA

Dubrovnik: Old Town (1979)

Split: Historic complex with Palace of Diocletian (1979)

CYPRUS

Paphos: Historic town (1980)

Troodos region: Painted churches (1985)

FINLAND

Old Rauma (1991)

Suomenlinna: Fortress (1991)

FRANCE

Mont-Saint-Michel and its Bay (1979)

Chartres: Cathedral (1979)

Versailles: Palace and Park (1979)

Vezelay: Basilica and Hill (1979)

- Vézère Valley: Decorated grottos (1979)
 Fontainebleu: Palace and Park (1981)
 Chambord: Chateau and Estate (1981)
 Amiens: Cathedral (1981)
 Orange: Roman Theatre and its surroundings and Arc de Triomphe (1981)
 Arles: Roman and Romanesque monuments (1981)
 Fontenay: Cistercian Abbey (1981)
 Ars-et-Senans: Royal Saltworks (1982)
 Nancy: Place Stanislas, Place de la Carrière and Place d'Alliance (1983)
 Saint-Savin sur Gartempe: Church (1983)
 Pont du Gard: Roman aqueduct (1985)
 Strasbourg: Grand Ile (1988)
 Paris: Banks of the Seine (1991)
 Reims: Cathedral of Notre-Dame, former Abbey of Saint-Remi and Palace of Tau (1991)
 Bourges: Cathedral (1992)

GERMANY

- Aachen: Cathedral (1978)
 Speyer: Cathedral (1981)
 Würzburg: Residence with Court Gardens and Residence Square (1981)
 Weis: Pilgrimage Church (1983)
 Brühl: Castles of Augustusburg and Falkenlust (1984)
 Hildesheim: St Mary's Cathedral and St Michael's Church (1985)
 Trier: Roman Monuments, Cathedral and Liebfrauen Church (1986)
 Lübeck: Hanseatic City (1987)
 Berlin and Potsdam: Palaces and Parks (1990, extended 1992)
 Lorsch: Abbey and Altenmünster (1991)
 Goslar: Historic town and mines of Rammelsberg (1992)
 Bamberg: Historic town (1993)
 Maulbronn: Monastery complex (1993)

GREECE

- Bassae: Temple of Apollo Epicurius (1986)
 Delphi: Archaeological site (1987)

Athens: Acropolis (1987)

Mount Athos (1988)

Meteora (1988) (joint inscription on World List as a both a Cultural and Natural Property)

Thessalonika: Palaeochristian and Byzantine monuments (1988)

Epidaurus: Archaeological site (1988)

Rhodes: Medieval town (1988)

Mystras (1989)

Olympia: Archaeological site (1989)

Delos (1990)

Chios: Monasteries of Daphni, Hossios, Luckas and Nea Moni (1992)

HOLY SEE

Vatican City (1984)

HUNGARY

Budapest: Banks of the Danube with the district of Buda Castle (1987)

Hollokö: Historic village and rural landscape (1987)

IRELAND

Bend of the Boyne: Archaeological ensemble (1993)

ITALY

Valcamonica: Rock drawings (1979)

Milan: Church and Dominican Convent of Santa Maria delle Grazie with 'The Last Supper' of Leonardo da Vinci (1980)

Florence: Historic centre (1982)

Venice and its Lagoon (1987)

Pisa: Piazza del Duomo (1987)

San Gimignano: Historic centre (1990)

I Sassi di Matera (1993)

Rome: Historic centre and the properties of the Holy See enjoying extraterritorial rights and San Paulo Fuori (1990)

MACEDONIA, FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF

Ohrid Region (1980) (joint inscription on World List as a both a Cultural and Natural Property)

MALTA

Hal Saflieni: Hypogeum (1980)

Valetta: City (1980)

Megalithic Temples: Temples of Ggantija and five other megalithic sites on Malta and Gozo (1980, extended 1992)

NORWAY

Urnes: Stave Church (1979)

Bergen: Bryggen historic quarter (1979)

Roros (1980)

Alta: Rock art (1985)

POLAND

Cracow: Historic centre (1978)

Wieliczka: Salt Mine (1978)

Auschwitz: Concentration Camp (1979)

Warsaw: Historic centre (1980)

Zamosc: Old City (1992)

PORTUGAL

Angra do Heroismo, Azores: Central zone of town (1983)

Lisbon: Monastery of the Heironymites and Tower of Belem (1983)

Batalha: Monastery (1983)

Tomar: Convent of Christ (1983)

Evora: Historic Centre (1986)

Alcobaça: Monastery (1989)

ROMANIA

Biertan and its fortified church (1993)

Horezu: Monastery (1993)

Moldavia: Churches (1993)

RUSSIAN FEDERATION

St Petersburg: Historic centre and related group of monuments (1990)

Kizhi Pogost (1990)

Moscow: Kremlin and Red Square (1990)

Novgorod: Historic monuments and surroundings (1992)

Solovetsky Islands: cultural and historic ensemble (1992)

Valdimir and Suzdal: The White Monuments (1992)

Sergiev Posad: Architectural ensemble of the Trinity Sergius Lavra (1983)

SLOVAKIA

Vlkolinec (1993)

Banska Stiavnica (1993)

Spissky Hrad and its associated cultural monuments (1993)

SPAIN

Cordoba: Mosque (1984)

Granada: Alhambra and the Generalife (1984)

Burgos: Cathedral (1984)

Madrid: Monastery and site of the Escorial (1984)

Barcelona: Parc Güell, Palau Güell and Casa Mila (1984)

Altamira: Grotto of Altamira (1985)

Segovia: Old town and aqueduct (1985)

Asturia: Churches of the Kingdom of the Asturias (1985)

Santiago de Compostela: Old town (1985)

Avila: Old town and extra-muros churches (1985)

Teruel: Mudejar architecture (1986)

Toledo; Historic town (1986)

Caceres: Old town (1986)

Seville: Cathedral, Alcazar and the Archivo de Indias (1987)

Salamanca: Old city (1988)

Poblet: Monastery (1991)

Mérida: Archaeological ensemble (1993)

Guadalupe: Royal monastery of Santa Maria (1993)

Historic pilgrimage route of Santiago de Compostela (1993)

SWEDEN

Drottningholm: Royal Domain (1991)

Birk and Hovegarden (1993)

Engelsberg: Historic ironworks (1993)

SWITZERLAND

St Gall: Convent (1983)

Müstair: Benedictine Convent (1983)

Berne: Old City (1983)

TURKEY

Istanbul: Historic areas (1985)

Göreme: National Park and rock sites (1985) (joint inscription on World List as a both a Cultural and Natural Property)

Divrigi: Great Mosque and Hospital (1985)

Hattusha (1986)

Nemrut Dag (1987)

Xanthos-Letoon (1988)

Heirapolis - Pamukkale (1988)

UKRAINE

Kiev: St Sophia Cathedral and related monastic buildings and Kiev-Pechersk Lavra (1990)

UNITED KINGDOM

Durham: Castle and Cathedral (1986)

Ironbridge Gorge (1986)

Studley Royal Park including the ruins of Fountains Abbey (1986)

Stonehenge, Avebury and associated prehistoric sites (1986)

Gwynedd: Castles and Town Walls (1986)

Blenheim: Palace (1986)

Bath: Historic city centre (1987)

Hadrian's Wall (1987)

London: Palace of Westminster, Westminster Abbey and St Margaret's Church (1987)

London: Tower of London (1988)

Canterbury: Cathedral, St Augustine's Abbey and St Martin's Church (1988)

YUGOSLAVIA

Stari Ras and Sopocani

Kotor: Natural and Culturo-Historic region (1979)

Studenica: Monastery (1986)

APPENDIX III

SELECTIVE BIBLIOGRAPHY ON PHYSICAL PATRIMONY AND DEVELOPMENT

- AHLBERG, N., & REDIN, L., 1994. Towns. pp. 110 - 117 in Selinge, 1994, q.v.
- ALLEN, J., 1976. Port Arthur Site Museum, Australia: its preservation and historical perspectives. *Museum [UNESCO]* 28, (2), pp. 98 - 105.
- AMAHAN, A., 1992. Museums and Tourism. The example of Morocco. pp.281 - 284 in ICOM, 1992. *What Museums for Africa? Heritage in the Future* (Paris: International Council of Museums)
- AMBROSE, T.(editor), 1987. *Working with Museums* (Edinburgh: HMSO).
- AGNUS, J-M, 1993. La recherche de complémentarités dans la valorisation du patrimoine, l'action de la Director du patrimoine au ministère de l'Education nationale et de la Culture. pp. 33 - 35 in Observatoire des Politiques Culturelles, 1993. *Les Départements: Nouvelles missions et la gestion. Nouvelles structures du patrimoine. Nouveaux réseaux. Actes du séminaire, Grenoble 16 - 17 février 1993.* (Grenoble: Musée Dauphinois & Observatoire des Politiques Culturelles).
- ANGELINI, S., 1971. *The Historic Route: a work-plan for the development of the sites and monuments of Ethiopia* 181 pp. (UNESCO Report no. 2468/RMO.RD/CLT)
- ARANJO, H., & TUPY, D., 1989. Can Carnival fit in a Museum? *Museum [UNESCO]* 41, (4), pp. 50 - 53.
- ARTS COUNCIL OF GREAT BRITAIN, 1989. *An Urban Renaissance* (London: Arts Council)
- AUSTRALIAN COUNCIL FOR THE ARTS, 1991. *Culture on Holiday* (Chippendale, N.S.W.: Australia Council).
- BERG, K., 1994. The Cultural Environments of Townships. pp. 118 - 114 in Selinge, 1994, q.v.
- BERTA, I., 1983. Museums and Tourism. *Museum [UNESCO]* 140, pp. 241 - 248.
- BESLER, H. & GOTTSCHOW, N., 1988. *Kriegsschicksale: Deutscher Artitectur Ver luste Schäden - Werideraufbau. Eine Dokumentation für das Gebeit der Bundesrepublik Deutschland.* (2 vols.) (Neumünster: Karl Wächholtz Verlag).
- BIANCHINI, F., 1991. *Urban Cultural Policy. National Arts and Media Strategy Discussion Document no. 40* (London: Arts Council).

BIANCHINI, F. & PARKINSON, M., (Editors), 1993. *Cultural Policy and urban regeneration: the West European experience* (Manchester: Manchester University Press).

BIANCHINI, F., 1993. Remaking European cities: the role of cultural politics. pp. 1 - 20 in Bianchini & Parkinson, 1993, *q.v.*

BIRD, J., *et al.*, 1993. *Mapping the Futures. Local Cultures, Global Change* (London: Routledge).

BJORNSTAD, M., 1994. Cultural-Environmental Preservation in a European Future. pp. 176 - 177 in Selinge, 1994, *q.v.*

BOOTH, P., 1990. The arts as a regenerative force. *The Arts Business* (Southern Arts): Summer 1990, pp.38-39.

BOOTH, P. & BOYLE, R., 1993. See Glasgow, see culture. pp. 21 - 47 in Bianchini & Parkinson, 1993, *q.v.*

BOOTH, P., & HARDING, D., 1987. *A Public Art Strategy for Glasgow City Centre* (Glasgow: Glasgow Action).

BONIFACE, P. & FOWLER, P., 1993. *Heritage and Tourism in the Global Village* (London: Routledge).

BOYER, M., 1992. "Tourisme Culturel" et "Patrimoine" Bati: Ambiguité des mots, forces des images. pp. 63 - 69 in Régis Neyret, (editor), 1992. *Le Patrimoine atout du Développement* (Lyon: Presses Universitaires de Lyon).

BOYLAN, P.J., 1988. The Changing World of Museums and Galleries, Ch. 6 (pp. 99 - 140) in J Benington & J White. *The Future of Leisure Services* (London: Longman)

BOYLAN, P.J., 1990A. Snibston - The Industrial Adventure. A New Industrial Heritage and Science Museum and Park under development in Leicestershire, England. pp. 63 - 66 in *Science Museums without Walls: Exhibits to Go. International Workshop Delhi, Bombay, Bangalore and Calcutta, 1989.* (National Council of Science Museums, Calcutta).

BOYLAN, P.J., 1990B. Museums and Cultural Identity. Museums Association Presidential Address 1990. *Museums Journal* Dec. 1990: 29 - 33.

BOYLAN, P.J., 1991. Planning in a Regional Museum Context. Chapter 6, pp. 85 - 99 in G D Lord and B Lord, (editors) *The Manual of Museum Planning* (London: HMSO).

BOYLAN, P.J., (editor), 1992A. *Museums 2000: Politics, people, professionals and profit* (editor) (Routledge, London)

- BOYLAN, P.J., 1992B. Revolutionary France and the foundation of modern museum management and curatorial practice. Part I. From Revolution to the First Republic, 1789 - 1792. *Museum Management and Curatorship* 11, (2), p. 141 - 152.
- BOYLAN, P.J. 1993A. *Review of The Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict (The Hague Convention of 1954)* (Paris: UNESCO, Doc. ref. CLT-93/WS/12).
- BOYLAN, P.J., 1993B. *Revue du Convention sur la Protection des Biens Culturels dans les temps des Conflits Armées (La Convention de La Haye, 1954)* (Paris: UNESCO, Doc. ref. CLT-93/WS/12).
- BROWING, E.L., 1993. A personality museum as a tourist attraction. *Economic Development Review* 11, (4) (Fall 1993), pp. 78 - 80.
- CAPSTICK, B., 1985. Museums and Tourism *International Journal of Museum Management and Curatorship* 4, pp. 365 - 372.
- CANADIAN CONFERENCE OF THE ARTS, 1982. *Culture as a Growth Sector in Canadian Development* (Ottawa: Canadian Conference of the Arts)
- [CANNON-BROOKES, P.], 1993. Editorial: Tourism and the Museum Industry: Paymaster, Pollutant and Worse? *International Journal of Museum Management and Curatorship* 12, pp.
- CODY, J.W., 1992. Le Cas du Quartier Chinoise à Boston. pp. 89 - 95 in Régis Neyret, (editor), 1992. *Le Patrimoine atout du Développement* (Lyon: Presses Univeristaires de Lyon). 123 - 126.
- COLARDELLE, M., 1992. La Dimension Economique du Patrimoine Culturel. pp. 45 - 47 in Régis Neyret, (editor), 1992. *Le Patrimoine atout du Développement* (Lyon: Presses Univeristaires de Lyon).
- COLQUOON, H., 1994. Temporary Public Art. *Unpublished MA thesis: Dept. of Arts Policy and Management, City University, London.*
- CORNEDE, M., 1993. Les monuments historiques. pp. 47 - 50 in Observatoire des Politiques Culturelles, 1993. *Les Départments: Nouvelles missions et la gestion. Nouvelles structures du patrimoine. Nouveaux réseaux. Actes du séminaire, Grenoble 16 - 17 février 1993.* (Grenoble: Musée Dauphinois & Observatoire des Politiques Culturelles).
- COSSONS, N., 1983. The new museum movement in the United Kingdom. *Museum (UNESCO)*, 35 (2) pp. 83 - 89.
- COTE, M. (editor), 1992. *Les Tendances de la Muséologie au Québec.* (Québec: La Société des Musées Québécois).

- COUNCIL OF EUROPE, 1983. *Urban Cultural Life in the 1980s: Reports and Essays from the Council's Twenty Towns Project* (Strasbourg: Council of Europe).
- COVENEY, M., 1990. *The City - 21 years of the Glasgow Citizens Theatre* (London: Nick Hern Books).
- CUIR, D., 1981. Economic studies with impact. *Museum News* 59 (6) pp. 60 - 63.
- DAVIDSON, S. (editor), 1991. *Cultural Tourism: Making it Work, Planning and Marketing Cultural Tourism*. (Sydney: Museum Association of Australia)
- DE BRES, K., 1991. Seaside Resorts, Working Museums, and Factory Shops: Three Vignettes as British Tourism Enters the Nineties. *Focus* 41 (2), pp. 10 - 16.
- DE CLERQ, P., 1985. *Conférence Internationale sur l'étude et la mise en valeur du Patrimoine Industriel, Lyon - Grenoble, 1981* (Paris: CNRS).
- DE LA TORRE, M. & MONREAL, L., 1982. *Museums: An Investment for Development* (Paris: International Council of Museums)
- DEPARTMENT OF THE ENVIRONMENT, 1990. *An Evaluation of Garden Festivals* (Lodon: H.M.S.O.).
- DESLAURIERS, H., 1992. Le Patrimoine, Outil de Développement de l'Entrepreneurship Local. pp. 37 - 44 in Régis Neyret, (editor), 1992. *Le Patrimoine atout du Développement* (Lyon: Presses Univeristaires de Lyon).
- DE VARINE, H., 1991. *L'Initiative Communautaire: recherche et expérimentation* (Macon: Editions W/MNES).
- DONNISON, D.D. & MIDDLETON, A., (editors), 1987. *Regenerating the Inner City: Glasgow's Experience* (London: Routledge).
- DOWAY, S. 1992. The Seychelles Islands. Tourism and Museum Financing pp. 47 - 48. in ICOM, 1992. *What Museums for Africa? Heritage in the Future* (Paris: International Council of Museums)
- EMERY-WALLACE, F.A.J., 1979. The Value of Museums to the Economy. *Museums Journal* 79 (2), pp. 115 - 116.
- ESENAT, E., 1973. Museums, cultural development in the rural environment and the development of agriculture. *Museum (UNESCO)* 28 (4) pp. 188 - 195.
- FAVIERE, J., 1973. *Les musées brésiliens et le développement social et économique du Pays*. 53 pp. (UNESCO Doc. ref. 2860/RMO.RD/CLP).

- FLADMARK, J.M. (editor), 1993. *Heritage: conservation, interpretation, enterprise* (London: Donhead).
- FERNANDEZ GUIDO, H., 1973. *Round Table on the Role of Museums in Today's Latin American, Santiago de Chile, 1972* 39 pp. (UNESCO Doc. ref. SHC/173/CONF.28.4)
- FISHER, M. & OWEN, U. (editors), 1991. *Whose Cities?* (Harmonsworth: Penguin).
- FORCE, R.W., 1976. *Historic and prehistoric sites, preservation of culture and cultural tourism in the Trust Territory of the Pacific Islands* 92pp. (UNESCO/UNDP Mission Report, ref. FMR/CC/CH/77/217 UNDP).
- FOWLER, P., 1992. *The Past in Contemporary Society* (London: Routledge).
- FRANK, G., 1992. Associations et Tourisme Culturel: Une Expérience. pp. 111 - 113 in Régis Neyret, (editor), 1992. *Le Patrimoine atout du Développement* (Lyon: Presses Univeristaires de Lyon).
- FRENCH, Y., 1993. Museums must take better advantage of cultural tourism. *Museums Journal* 93 (8) (August 1993), p. 18.
- FUKUDA, S., 1979. Museums and International Tourism. pp. 96 - 100 in ICOM, 1979. *Museum and cultural exchange/Musées et échanges culturels. The papers from the 11th General Conference of ICOM, Leningrad & Moscow, 1977.*
- GALLO, G.N., 1965. Los monumentos y museos como centros de atracción turística. *Estudios Turísticos* No. 5. (Madrid: Instituto Español de Turismo).
- GANSLMAYR, H., 1988. Museums and Crafts. *Museum (UNESCO)* 40 (1), pp. 2 - 9.
- GENERALITAT DE CATALUNYA, 1993. *Routes of Gothic art in Catalonia* (Barcelona: Direcció General de Turisme, Departament de Comerç, Consum i Turisme).
- GIRARD, A., (editor), 1988. *Economie et Culture. Tom. II: Culture et Devinir et Volonté Public. [4eme conférence internationale sur l'Economie de la Culture, Avignon, 1986]* (Paris: La Documentation Française).
- GREENBERG, K., 1992. La Réhabilitation du Réseau Urbain Historique de Toronto. pp. 85 - 88 in Régis Neyret, (editor), 1992. *Le Patrimoine atout du Développement* (Lyon: Presses Univeristaires de Lyon).
- GONZALEZ, J.M., 1993. Bilbao: culture, citizenship and quality of life. pp. 73 - 89 in Bianchini & Parkinson, 1993, (q.v.).
- GOODEY, B., GLASSON, J. & GODFREY, K., 1993. *Approaches to Carrying Capacity and Visitor Management in Areas of Cultural Heritage in Europe. Report to Tourism Unit, Directorate General XXIII, Nov. 1993.* (Brussels: Commission of the European Communities).

GOODEY, B., 1994. Spreading the Benefits of Heritage Visitor Quarters. *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 1 (1), 18 - 29.

GUIBAL, J., 1993. La gestion du patrimoine entre nouvelle demande sociale et nouvelles responsabilités des départements. pp. 9 - 12 in Observatoire des Politiques Culturelles, 1993. *Les Départements: Nouvelles missions et la gestion. Nouvelles structures du patrimoine. Nouveaux réseaux. Actes du séminaire, Grenoble 16 - 17 février 1993.* (Grenoble: Musée Dauphinois & Observatoire des Politiques Culturelles).

HANRICH, G., 1985. Die Wiener Museen und der Städtetourismus *Foireschundberichte Museologisches Institut, Pram [Austria]* 5 pp. 19 - 58.

HARRISON, S., 1988. Marketing to the Tourist. *Museums Journal* 88 (3) (December 1988), pp. 143 - 146.

HARVEY, D., (editor), 1989. *The Urban Experience* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press).

HEWISON, R., 1987. *The Heritage Industry* (London: Methuen).

HORNE, D., 1984. *The Great Museum* (London: Pluto Press).

ICOM, 1982. *Musées de site archéologique.* 50pp. (UNESCO Report no. CLT.82/W5/7)

INSTITUTO NACIONAL DE CULTURA [PERU], 1977. *Cultural Policy in Peru* (Paris: UNESCO).

JAFARI, J., 1992. Cultural Tourism and Regional Development. *Annals of Tourism Research* 19 (3), p. 576.

JOHNSON, P.S. & THOMAS, R.B., 1990a. The Development of Beamish: an Economic Assessment. *International Journal of Museum Management and Curatorship* 9, pp. 5 - 24.

JOHNSON, P.S. & THOMAS, R.B., 1990b. Measuring the Local Impact of a Tourist Attraction: an Empirical Study. *Regional Studies* 24, pp. 395 - 403.

JONES, S., 1993, (editor). *Art in Public: What, Why and How* Sunderland: AN Press)

KARP, I. *et al.*, 1992. *Museums and Communities: The Politics of Public Culture* (Washington D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press).

KEDIT, P.M., 1990. Museums and Tourism *Sarwak Museum Journal* 62 (New Series) pp. 218 - 235.

LAPLANTE, M., 1992. Le Patrimoine en Tant qu'Attraction Touristique: Histoire, Possibilités et Limites. pp. 49 - 61 in Régis Neyret, (editor), 1992. *Le Patrimoine atout du Développement* (Lyon: Presses Universitaires de Lyon).

LASER, K., 1981. Ausländische Touristen im Museum [DDR]. *Arbeit Museumspädagogik Berlin*, 1981, pp. 112 - 116.

LATARGET, B., 1992. *L'Aménagement Culturel du Territoire* (Paris: La Documentation Française)

LEBLANC, F., 1992. Regions de Patrimoine au Canada et Parcs Naturels Régionaux en France. pp. 145 - 153 in Régis Neyret, (editor), 1992. *Le Patrimoine atout du Développement* (Lyon: Presses Universitaires de Lyon).

LE GALES, P., 1993. Rennes: Catholic humanism and urban entrepreneurialism. pp. 178 - 198 in Bianchini & Parkinson, 1993, q.v.

LEWIS, R.K., & BLAGG, M., 1992. The Museum as Catalyst: Camden New Jersey & Panhandle, Texas. *Museum News* 71 (6) (November/December 1992) pp. 46 - 49.

LONGMAN, P., 1986. Museums in Scotland. *Museums Journal* 86 pp. 157 - 163.

LOPEZ, F., 1992. Reorganisation and Touristic Exploitation of Historic Monuments pp. 313 - 316 in ICOM, 1992. *What Museums for Africa? Heritage in the Future* (Paris: International Council of Museums)

LOWENTHAL, D., 1985. *The Past is a Foreign Country* (Cambridge: University Press)

MACLEAN, M.G.H., (editor), 1993. *Cultural Heritage in Asia and the Pacific [Symposium held in Honolulu, 1991]* (Los Angeles: Getty Conservation Institute).

MANN, P.R., 1989. Working Exhibits and the Destruction of Evidence in the Science Museum: *International Journal of Museum Management and Curatorship* (1989), 8, pp.369-387.

MIDDLETON, V.T.C., 1990. *New Visions for Independent Museums in the UK* (Chichester: Association of Independent Museums).

MILES, M., 1989. *Art For Public Places* (London: Winchester School of Art Press)

MONTPETIT, R. (editor), 1987. *Les Musées/Museums* (Trois Rivières, Québec: Presses de l'Université de Québec).

MOREIRA, F.J., 1992A. Tourisme, Musées et Identités Locales. pp.71 - 76 in César Lopes, (editor), 1992. *Textes de Muséologie/Cadernos do MINOM - 2* (Lisbon: Regroupement portugais du MINOM).

MOREIRA, F.J., 1992B. Museologie, Structures Territoriales et Développement. pp.107 - 114 in César Lopes, (editor), 1992. *Textes de Muséologie/Cadernos do MINOM - 2* (Lisbon: Regroupement portugais du MINOM).

VELS HELJN, A. *et al.*, 1984. Musea en toerisme. *Museumvisie (Nederlandse Museumveriging)* 8 (1) pp. 1 - 14.

UNESCO, 1974. *Réunion sur les effets du tourisme sur les valeurs socio-culturelles* 20 pp. (UNESCO Report no. CLP/1580/0406).

VENCATACHELLUM, I., 1981. *Centre inter-Etats de promotion de l'artisanat et du tourisme culturel* 99pp. (UNESCO Report no. FMP/CC/CD/81/247 UNDP).

VIAU, S., 1992. La Tetrologie de Québec: Capitale, Patrimoine, Culture et Tourisme. pp. 115 - 125 in Régis Neyret, 1992, *q.v.*

WAKEMAN, O., 1993. Greece is smoothing the way for travelers. *Global Finance* 7, (10) (Oct. 1993), p. 92.

WALSH, K., 1992. *The Representation of the Past* (London: Routledge).

WHITING, P.G. & Associates, 1985. *Economic Impacts of Heritage Institutions on the Canadian Economy: Analysis of Method* (Ottawa: Canadian Museums Association).

[WORLD HERITAGE CENTRE], 1993. *Liste des Biens inscrits sur la Liste du Patrimoine Mondial, List of Properties included in the World Heritage List* (Paris: Centre de Documentation UNESCO-ICOMOS).

P.J.B. 11 December 1994. With acknowledgement to the UNESCO/ICOM Information Centre, Paris, for some of these references, (from ICOM, 1992. Tourism [Bibliography], Paris: ICOM) and for unfailing assistance and advice.